

J o u r n a l o f W o m e n i n  
C u l t u r e a n d S o c i e t y**Editors**

Carolyn Allen  
Judith A. Howard

**Managing Editor**

Ruth Largay

**Assistant Editor**

Caroline Klumppar

**Program Assistant**

Gitana Garofalo

**Graduate Research Assistant**

Ramira Alamilla

**Editorial Interns**

Jennifer Armbrust  
Candace Barlow  
Stephanic Fitts  
Denise Johnson  
Shelley Price  
Tracy Sachstjen  
Kate Scott

**Editorial Office**

University of Washington

**Associate Editors**

Johnella Butler  
Christine Di Stefano  
Angela B. Ginorio  
Nancy Hartssock  
Susan Jeffords  
Sydney J. Kaplan  
Mary Romero  
Therese Saliba  
Cynthia Steele  
France Winddance Twine  
Priscilla Wald  
Nancy F. Woods  
Shirley J. Yee

**Founding Editor**

Catharine R. Stimpson

**Editors Emeritae**

Barbara Charlesworth Gelpi  
Jean F. O'Barr  
Ruth-Ellen Boetcher Joeres  
Barbara Laslett

**Cover:** Artis Lane, *Celebration II Dialogue* (1986), consisting of two pieces: *Celebration II*, bronze, black patina, 38 x 17 1/2 x 9 1/2 inches and *Emerging Celebration II*, bronze, resin, ceramic shell, 38 x 17 1/2 x 9 1/2 inches. Signifying emergence, pieces of the ceramic mould remain attached to the finished bronze sculpture of *Celebration II Dialogue*. Like many of her works, this sculpture embodies the potential of becoming more. For Lane, life and art, like her sculptures, are processes of continual evolution. © 1986 by Artis Lane. Permission to reprint may be obtained only from the artist.

R. Z. Z. Z.  
September 2000

**Advisory Board**

Edna Acosta-Belén  
M. Jacqui Alexander  
Catherine Belsey  
Francine D. Blau  
Paola Bono  
Liana Borghi  
Rosi Braidotti  
Karen Brodtkin  
Judith Butler  
Hazel Carby  
Sue-Ellen Case  
Rey Chow  
Drucilla Cornell  
Teresa de Lauretis  
Irene Dolling  
Cynthia H. Enloe  
Anne Fausto-Sterling  
Patricia Fernández-Kelly  
Jane Flax  
Nancy Fraser  
Malgorzata Fuzsara  
Judith Kegan Gardiner  
Linda Gordon  
Elizabeth Grosz  
Donna Haraway  
Sandra Harding  
Heidi Hartmann  
Jane Jensen  
Linda K. Kerber  
*University at Albany, State University of New York*  
*Connecticut College*  
*University of Wales, Cardiff College*  
*Cornell University*  
*University of Rome*  
*University of Florence*  
*Utrecht University*  
*University of California, Los Angeles*  
*University of California, Berkeley*  
*Yale University*  
*University of California, Davis*  
*University of California, Irvine*  
*Rutgers University School of Law*  
*University of California, Santa Cruz*  
*University of Potsdam*  
*Clark University*  
*Brown University*  
*Princeton University*  
*Howard University*  
*New School for Social Research*  
*University of Warsaw*  
*University of Illinois at Chicago*  
*University of Wisconsin - Madison*  
*University at Buffalo, State University of New York*  
*University of California, Santa Cruz*  
*University of California, Los Angeles*  
*Institute for Women's Policy Research*  
*University of Montreal*  
*University of Iowa*

Annette Kuhn  
Lisa Lowe  
Susan McClary  
Jane Mansbridge  
Elaine Marks  
Biddy Martin  
Emily Martin  
Jill Julius Matthews  
Chandra Talpade Mohanty  
Henrietta L. Moore  
Julia O'Connell Davidson  
Neil Irvin Painter  
Carole Pateman  
Rosalind Pollack Petchesky  
Mary I. Poovey  
Janice Radway  
Hilary Rose  
Luana Ross  
Gayle Rubin  
Londa L. Schiebinger  
Joan W. Scott  
Carol C. Smart  
Dorothy E. Smith  
Judith Stacey  
Claudia Tate  
Barrie Thorne  
Sau-ling Cynthia Wong  
Sylvia J. Yanagisako  
Iris Marion Young  
*University of Bonn*  
*University of California, San Diego*  
*University of California, Los Angeles*  
*Harvard University*  
*University of Wisconsin - Madison*  
*Cornell University*  
*Princeton University*  
*Australian National University*  
*Hamilton College*  
*London School of Economics and Political Science*  
*Leicester University*  
*Princeton University*  
*University of California, Los Angeles*  
*Hunter College, City University of New York*  
*New York University*  
*Duke University*  
*University of Bradford*  
*University of Washington*  
*University of California, Santa Cruz*  
*Pennsylvania State University*  
*Institute for Advanced Study, Princeton, N.J.*  
*University of Leeds*  
*Ontario Institute for Studies in Education*  
*University of Southern California*  
*Princeton University*  
*University of California, Berkeley*  
*University of California, Berkeley*  
*Stanford University*  
*University of Pittsburgh*

## Feminisms at a Millennium

### Special Issue Editors

Judith A. Howard and Carolyn Allen

### Contents

xiii	Editorial: Feminisms at a Millennium
1007	On Being Transminded <i>Catharine R. Simpson</i>
1013	Marking Time and Progress <i>Mary Romero</i>
1017	Histories of a Feminist Future <i>Elizabeth Gross</i>
1023	The Surprised Feminist <i>Cynthia Enloe</i>
1027	Crisis and Adventure <i>Paola Bono and Federica Giardini</i>
1033	<i>Las Gráficas</i> : Recollections on Consciousness-Raising <i>Drucilla Cornell</i>

*Signs: Journal of Women in Culture and Society* (ISSN 0097-9740) is published quarterly: Autumn, Winter, Spring, and Summer by The University of Chicago Press, Journals Division, 5720 S. Woodlawn, Chicago, IL 60637.

**Subscriptions** U.S.A.: institutions, 1 year \$133.00; individuals, 1 year \$38.00; students, 1 year \$27.00 (with photocopy of validated student ID); NWSA members (individuals) \$31.00. In Canada: add 7% GST and \$6.00 postage to subscription price. Outside U.S.A.: add \$6.00 for each year's subscription to cover postage. Subscription agent for Japan: Kinokuniya Company, Ltd. Individuals have the option to order directly from the University of Chicago Press. Single-copy rates: institutions \$33.25, individuals \$8.50. Checks should be made payable to *Signs*, University of Chicago Press, Journals Division, P.O. Box 37005, Chicago, IL 60637. VISA and MASTERCARD accepted. Include charge number and signature with order. Fax 773-753-0811. E-mail subscriptions@journals.uchicago.edu. Volumes 1-10 available from Periodical Services Co., 11 Main Street, Germantown, NY 12526.

**Editorial Correspondence** Carolyn Allen and Judith A. Howard, *Signs*, Box 354345, University of Washington, Seattle, WA 98195-4345; e-mail signs@u.washington.edu. Please check most recent issue: editorial office moves every five years.

**Website** <http://www.journals.uchicago.edu/Signs/home.html>.

**Postmaster** Send address changes to *Signs*, University of Chicago Press, Journals Division, P.O. Box 37005, Chicago, IL 60637.

**Copying beyond Fair Use** The code on the first page of an article in this journal indicates the copyright owner's consent that copies of the article may be made beyond those permitted by Sections 107 or 108 of the U.S. Copyright Law provided that copies are made only for personal or internal use, or for the personal or internal use of specific clients and provided that the copier pay the stated per-copy fee through the Copyright Clearance Center, Inc., 222 Rosewood Dr., Danvers, MA 01923. To request permission for other kinds of copying, such as copying for general distribution, for advertising or promotional purposes, for creating new collective works, or for resale, kindly write to Permissions Department, University of Chicago Press, 5801 S. Ellis Ave., Chicago, IL 60637. Volumes available in microfilm from Bell & Howell Information and Learning, 300 N. Zeeb Rd., P. O. Box 1346, Ann Arbor, MI 48106.

**Advertising** For rates and information about advertising in *Signs* and rental of its subscriber list, please write to Advertising, University of Chicago Press, Journals Division, 5720 S. Woodlawn, Chicago, IL 60637. Advertising and list rental are limited to material of scholarly interest to our subscribers.

Periodicals postage paid at Chicago, Illinois, and at additional mailing offices. © 2000 by The University of Chicago. All rights reserved.

The paper used in this publication meets the minimum requirements of American National Standard for Information Sciences—Permanence of Paper for Printed Library Materials. ANSI Z39.48-1984.©

\$8.50

- 1041** After the Common Era  
*Sandra Harding*
- 1045** Minding the Gap: General and Substantive Theorizing on Power and Exploitation  
*Laura Brace and Julia O'Connell Davidson*
- 1051** Difference and Indifference: A U.S. Feminist Response to Global Politics  
*Kathy Rudy*
- 1055** The Party  
*Sue-Ellen Case*
- 1061** Once Upon a Time in Europe  
*Rosi Braidotti*
- 1065** Tender Buttons: Misprisions of the Feminine and Millennial Appropriation  
*Lianna Borghi and Ilaria Sborgi*
- 1069** Feminism, the New Millennium, and Ourselves: A Polish View  
*Magorzata Fuszarn*
- 1077** Mapping the Imperial Social Formation: A Modest Proposal for Feminist History  
*Mrinalini Sinha*
- 1083** Undoing the "Package Picture" of Cultures  
*Uma Narayan*
- 1087** Arab Feminism at the Millennium  
*Therese Saliba*
- 1093** Family Bonds/Conceptual Binds: African Notes on Feminist Epistemologies  
*Oyeronke Oyewumi*
- 1099** International Feminism of the Future  
*Tani Barlow*
- 1107** Reading the Signs: The Economics of Gender Twenty-Five Years Later  
*Patricia Fernández-Kelly*
- 1113** U.S. Latina and Latin American Feminisms: Hemispheric Encounters  
*Edna Acosta-Belén and Christine E. Bose*
- 1121** We Are Not the World: U.S. Activism and Human Rights in the Twenty-First Century  
*Dorothy Q. Thomas*
- 1125** Building a New Dream with Gaia?  
*Hilary Rose*
- 1129** Difference and Recognition: Postmillennial Identities and Social Justice  
*Henrietta L. Moore*
- 1133** A Black Feminist Reflection on the Antiviolence Movement  
*Beth E. Richie*
- 1139** Disappearing Acts: The State and Violence against Women in the Twentieth Century  
*Michelle Fine and Lois Weis*
- 1147** Schooling for Inequality  
*Dorothy E. Smith*
- 1153** Feminism and the World Wars  
*Ruth-Ellen Boetcher Joeres*
- 1157** Writing as a Feminist  
*Catherine Belsey*
- 1161** Feminism's Perverse Effects  
*Elaine Marks*
- 1167** On Reaching the Year 2000  
*Sydney Janet Kaplan*
- 1171** Has Feminism Changed Science?  
*Londa Schiebinger*
- 1177** Feminist Economics at the Millennium: A Personal Perspective  
*Julie A. Nelson*

- 1183** A Telling Time for Women's Studies  
*Barrie Thornie*
- 1189** Is Academic Feminism an Oxymoron?  
*Judith Stacey*
- 1195** She Who Speaks Shadow Speaks Truth: Transdisciplinarity  
in Women's and Gender Studies  
*Irene Dölling and Sabine Hark*
- 1199** Signs: The Stanford Years, 1980-1985  
*Barbara Charlesworth Gelpi*
- 1205** My Master List for the Millennium  
*Jean F. O'Barr*
- 1209** Like Canaries in the Mines: Black Women's Studies  
at the Millennium  
*Noïme M. Rooks*
- 1213** Regrets  
*Nell Irvin Painter*
- 1215** Black Feminism at Twenty-One: Reflections on the Evolution  
of a National Community  
*Barbara Ransby*
- 1223** Once More into the Streets  
*Karen Brodwin*
- 1227** Feminist Fairy Tales for Black and American Indian Girls:  
A Working-Class Vision  
*France Winddance Twine*
- 1231** Twenty-First-Century Academic Feminism in the United States:  
Utopian Visions and Practical Actions  
*Barbara Laslett and Johanna Brenner*
- 1237** Gender Aporias  
*Tina Chanter*
- 1243** Millennial Bodies  
*Traise Yamamoto*
- 1247** A Few Cautions at the Millennium on the Merging of Feminist  
Studies with American Indian Women's Studies  
*Devon A. Mihesuah*
- 1253** On Teaching through the Millennium  
*Anne Fausto-Sterling*
- 1257** Masculinity, the Teening of America, and Empathic Targeting  
*Judith Kegan Gardiner*
- 1263** Toward a Theory of Disability and Gender  
*Thomas J. Gerschick*
- 1269** The U.S. Women's Health Research Agenda  
for the Twenty-First Century  
*Nancy Fugate Woods*
- 1275** Melancholia in the Late Twentieth Century  
*David L. Eng*
- 1283** Women and Music on the Verge of the New Millennium  
*Susan McClary*
- 1287** Feminist Music Theory into the Millennium: A Personal History  
*Ellie M. Hisama*
- 1293** Beyond Recognition, Beholden: Toward a Pedagogy of Privilege  
*Tamara L. Underiner*
- 1299** Complaining, Conversing, and Coalescing  
*Dale M. Bauer and Priscilla Wald*
- 1305** United States and International Notes
- 1311** Comment and Reply Policy
- 1313** About the Contributors
- 1327** Notice to Contributors
- 1331** Index to Volume 25  
Author/Title Index, General
- 1343** Author/Title Index, Books Reviewed

## Once Upon a Time in Europe

### I. Speed and simultaneity

**T**he end of the millennium is hardly inspiring in the specific periphery of the globe I happen to inhabit: former Western Europe, which has just become the European Union. The century ends here as it began: not with a whimper but with a bang. I am writing this in the midst of the NATO air strikes against the Serbs in the Balkans. Contemporary cultural critics have argued that the war machine—the most advanced brand of today's technology—resembles a huge logistical complex aimed at the swift and efficient delivery of weapons onto targets. The proliferation of micro wars on a global scale makes a mockery of the concept of peace, which is by now replaced in the media with expressions such as “a state of pre-hostility.” It is with great speed, dictated by altogether new kinds of simultaneous events, that thousands of ethnic Albanians are pouring across the borders of Kosovo to flee Slobodan Milosevic's ethnic cleansing and NATO's bombings. As it did over fifty years ago, with the exodus of Jewish Europeans, Roma, and antifascist and homosexual refugees, Europe witnesses once again its own population fleeing from murderous political violence. Nationalism, the century-old virus of the European mind-set, is still claiming victims in that zone of turbulence that is the Balkans, engendering multiple forced and deeply painful brands of nomadism. These high-tech wars without armies but with plenty of civilian casualties (also known as “collateral damage”) rest on techniques and strategies strangely reminiscent of terrorist attacks: hit-and-run target-servicing operations, systematic environmental damage, and embargoes on oil and other prime-necessity materials. A diffuse and all-pervasive fear about the possibility of a bomb going off, an “accident” happening any minute, anywhere, is the political logic of late postmodernity in the “advanced” world.

If I could start my work on feminist philosophy all over again, I would think a lot more systematically about the increasing militarization of Western culture. I would keep high on the agenda the interconnections of war, European nationalism, and technology. Now and in years to come, these same questions, crossed over with issues of ethnicity, nationality, and

sexual difference, reach a peak of intensity and relevance. Let us hope that they will not necessarily bring along more murderous violence. I do believe that Europe will evolve into a multiethnic and multicultural space, but in order to do so, masculinism, nationalism, and demented ethnocentrism have to be removed from the European mind-set, so as to stop constructing difference in terms of negative otherness.

## II. Complexity and instability

The only constant in today's world is change. Under the impact of fast technological transformations and equally speedy reorganizations of socioeconomic structures, stability has left our lives. Complexity and instability have come to the fore as dominant principles in European human and social sciences. Over the past two decades, several movements of critical thought (psychoanalysis, poststructuralism, feminism, deconstruction, postcolonial critiques, social sustainability movements, and so on) have undermined the unitary vision of the subject, the authority of experience, and the belief in fixed identities.

All communities, even and especially national ones, are "imagined"; that is, they are held together by complex flows of affects, identifications, and power relations between the self and society. The complexity of this interaction is such as to blur any categorical distinction between the self and whatever lies outside it. It is not uncommon to think about networks of power relations, and even to represent the self, as an interactive web that stretches across different layers of the social, the discursive, the symbolic—a split, fluid, complex, and multilayered vision of a nomadic self. For instance, the idea of national identity itself has been challenged by a postmodernist critical perspective, inspired by Gayatri Spivak and other feminist postcolonial and black thinkers, that shows that common ideas of nation are to a large extent imaginary tales, which project a reassuring but nonetheless illusory sense of unity over the actually disjointed, fragmented, and often incoherent range of internal regional and cultural differences that make up a nation-state. Feminists, moreover, know that the legitimating tales of nationhood in the West have been constructed over the body of women, as well as within the crucible of imperial and colonial masculinity.

The fact that these allegedly universal or all-encompassing ideas of nation or national identity are in fact flawed and internally incoherent does not make them any less effective, nor does it prevent them from exercising hegemonic power. But an awareness of the lack of coherence, consistency, and inner rationality of what Lyotard named the "master narratives" of the

Western world does open new spaces for critical opposition. It is not because masculinism, nationalism, and racism have superior inner rationality or logic that they have become hegemonic. Quite the contrary: it is because of their dominance that they have appropriated exclusive claims to rationality and logic.

Thus, awareness of the profoundly unstable structure of fundamental categories of political and philosophical analysis, far from giving way to a suspension of belief in the permanence of power, results in the quest for new forms of resistance. I would value very highly a project of elaborating forms of political resistance that are suited to the specific paradoxes of our historical condition. More specifically, I would emphasize as a political priority the project of dislodging the belief in the natural foundations and consequently the fixed nature of *any* system of value, meaning, or belief. In this respect, the deconstruction of essentialized identities of any kind, but especially those that are historically linked to the concept of Europe, will remain at the heart of my intellectual and political project.

## III. Recasting European identity

The project of European unification, with the recent introduction of the common currency, the Euro, has already put questions of European identity and citizenship and questions of access, entitlement, and participation at the center of feminist social and political agendas. The changes brought about by the new technologies in terms of globalization have accelerated the decline of nation-states and the rise of new geopolitical configurations such as the European Union.

The concept of European identity is particularly contested at present. As a conservative project, the European Union was aimed at streamlining the reconstruction of Europe in opposition to the Soviet-dominated countries of the east, and thus it was a major pawn in Cold War politics. As a progressive project, however, the European Union is also an attempt to come to terms with the historical decline of European nation-states and, more specifically, of European nationalism. The project of European federation dates back to the end of World War II to the Marshall Plan and the reconstruction of the war-torn European economy. The Allied forces, led by the U.S. government, were determined to prevent further intra-European infighting and thus aimed to link some of these countries in a federal system in order to squash the nationalistic spirits that had ravaged the continent of Europe. The European Union of the present is nothing more or less than the dismantling of the European nation-states in favor of a federated system. It was and still is a postnationalist project.

In the absence of a concerted involvement of feminists in the progressive potential of the European project, more conservative forces are setting the agenda. There is a real danger of re-creating a sovereign center in the new European federation. This is also known as the "Fortress Europe" syndrome, which has been extensively criticized by feminists and anti-racists who warn against the danger of replacing Eurocentrism with a new "Europ-ism," or a belief in an ethnically "pure" and self-reliant Europe.

My agenda for the new millennium gives high priority to the reconstruction of a postnationalist, feminist, and antiracist European identity. "Europe" as a progressive project today means a site of possible political resistance against the nationalism, xenophobia, and racism that could accompany the process of European federation.

#### IV. Lightness and becoming

In a historical context that has been haunted and daunted by the notion of "crisis" — of European values and identities, of the economy, of the family, and of nearly everything — feminist practice has been a horizon of hope and regeneration. Feminism has shaped my intellectual, political, and personal life to such an extent that I cannot imagine any other possible agenda for the spatiotemporal grid that constitutes my existence. The political passion that is feminism has led me to drift in directions whose purpose and worth became evident only a posteriori. Thus, I moved from Melbourne to Paris to follow Foucault's seminar but, once I got there, I discovered Deleuze and Irigaray instead, and they changed my life. I had the honor of meeting Simone de Beauvoir only to realize that an abyss separated us, in terms not only of age, but also of culture, values, and, ultimately, politics. I still loved her and attended her funeral with a broken heart. That, for me, was the real end of the millennium. Things happened along the way, as I followed not so much a line but a zig-zag path of becoming that connects the life of the mind to the desire to act upon the world, with and for other women, so as to make a difference. However critical and alternative, feminism is for me also an affirmative culture of positivity, hope, and tremendous creativity and intelligence. It has put wings on my feet and on my mind, made me laugh and made me cry, and I would not have it any other way. I just hope that those who come after us will have as much fun.

*Women's Studies Department  
Utrecht University*

#### Tender Buttons: Misprisions of the Feminine and Millennial Appropriation

**T**his is the country where Vita ran away with Violet. From this computer, Gertrude Stein's country place, Bilignin, is not too distant. What was Alice's *omelette aux fines herbes* really like before the age of hormones and intensive pest control? Out of the window, a plump mimosa nods in the spring breeze above the hazy blue coastline. Around the corner a lava of cement covers one of the most beautiful regions of the world. We have made nature redundant. Pine trees, cypresses, brush, and blooming fruit trees survive in spots, promising more natural enclosures further inland. But the future is right here, already spent before its coming, the tame black squirrel with its mangy tail hobbling on the minute, electronically enclosed front garden.

Many miles down the same coast, on a nature reserve in the Italian Riviera, where the Goddess once ruled her shrines and the Madonna is now worshipped in the sanctuaries, the local authorities of the Cinque Terre have permitted construction of a huge fish farm. It was the only unpolluted stretch of coastline left in the area. The denaturing of context has become commonplace, from artificial insemination to fish farms, even though we may both dread and welcome its signs. Is it the nostalgia for a point of origin in clean waters that makes us mourn the constant, inconsiderate erosion of our earth's resources?

In the culture of this stretch of land, women and men alike have been taught to care about things, animals, and people. The fabric of the world, like any worn piece of cloth, needs constant mending. But somehow women themselves were never mended and were always on the mend. Last year, a man on trial for rape was acquitted on the grounds that he could not have taken off the woman's jeans without her help. Seeing a pair of jeans now makes us wonder when violence will cease to be a woman's problem and become the responsibility of all beings. Some Italian feminists, upholders of difference, believe that there exists a primary women's politics concerned with the sphere of personal relations that does not