



BRILL

---

Liturgical Commemoration of the Saints in the "Missale Gothicum" (Vat.Reg.Lat. 317). New Approaches to the Liturgy of Early Medieval Gaul

Author(s): Els Rose

Source: *Vigiliae Christianae*, Vol. 58, No. 1 (Feb., 2004), pp. 75-97

Published by: Brill

Stable URL: <https://www.jstor.org/stable/1584538>

Accessed: 28-10-2019 10:42 UTC

## REFERENCES

Linked references are available on JSTOR for this article:

[https://www.jstor.org/stable/1584538?seq=1&cid=pdf-reference#references\\_tab\\_contents](https://www.jstor.org/stable/1584538?seq=1&cid=pdf-reference#references_tab_contents)

You may need to log in to JSTOR to access the linked references.

---

JSTOR is a not-for-profit service that helps scholars, researchers, and students discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content in a trusted digital archive. We use information technology and tools to increase productivity and facilitate new forms of scholarship. For more information about JSTOR, please contact [support@jstor.org](mailto:support@jstor.org).

Your use of the JSTOR archive indicates your acceptance of the Terms & Conditions of Use, available at <https://about.jstor.org/terms>



JSTOR

*Brill* is collaborating with JSTOR to digitize, preserve and extend access to *Vigiliae Christianae*

LITURGICAL COMMEMORATION OF THE SAINTS IN THE  
*MISSALE GOTHICUM* (VAT.REG.LAT. 317).  
NEW APPROACHES TO THE LITURGY OF EARLY  
MEDIEVAL GAUL

BY

ELS ROSE

**SUMMARY:** The liturgical traditions of pre-Carolingian Gaul are transmitted in a handful of sources from various regions, forming only a fragmentary picture of the phenomenon. In the past, several scholars have tried to trace back the development of 'the Gallican liturgy' to one particular origin, for instance Rome, Milan, or 'the East' (Cappadocia, Ephesus). In this article, an attempt is made to outline the diversity of traditions which contributed to the Gallican liturgy. In this endeavour, the liturgical commemoration of the saints is taken as point of departure. On the basis of one particular source, the *Missale Gothicum* (Burgundy, ca 700 AD), the origin of the saints' cults and the way they came to Gaul is presented. By studying the saints and their place in the liturgy, it becomes clear that the liturgy of pre-Carolingian Gaul was enriched by the influence of many traditions, both Western and Eastern. Moreover, as regards the local, Gallic saints, it must be stated that there is a strong connection between the liturgical and the hagiographical veneration of the saints, so that it seems hardly appropriate to consider one of these fields while ignoring the other.

1 *Introduction: the Gallican liturgy*

The phenomenon called 'Gallican liturgy', which denotes the 'style of worship' in Gaul before the Carolingian era,<sup>1</sup> is a complicated matter. The liturgy of early medieval Gaul has been transmitted in a handful of manuscripts and fragments of manuscripts, of which the origin and destination are often unknown. It is difficult to come to a clear picture of the Gallican liturgy on the basis of this evidence. It is clear that many pieces of the jigsaw are lacking, although it is not always known exactly which pieces these are.

The fact that the sources are often difficult to localise and to date leaves large parts of the liturgical map of early medieval Gaul blank. Moreover,

---

<sup>1</sup> Cyril Vogel, *Medieval liturgy. An introduction to the sources* (Spoleto: 1983), 275.

it is difficult to speak of the Gallican liturgy as a unity. In the absence of a leading ecclesiastical centre in the province of Gaul during the early centuries of Christianity, the freedom of the dioceses was considerable.<sup>2</sup> In liturgical matters, local authority had more to say than the provincial councils. There was a certain pursuit of unity as far as the *ordo* of the mass was concerned, but the exact content of the liturgical calendar as well as the choices of prayers and scriptural readings was something decided on by the local bishop.<sup>3</sup> As a consequence, there was a good deal of variation from place to place, in particular with regard to the *Sanctorale*. The student of early medieval Gallican liturgy must, therefore, realize that what is found for one town in Gaul is not necessarily applicable to another place. This is even more true with respect to the liturgical veneration of the saints. The cult of the saints is by nature a local event,<sup>4</sup> and this is likewise true of the liturgical cult of the saints.<sup>5</sup> Another important problem is that, even if it is possible to ascribe a certain source to a particular region or even a city at all, the sources do not always provide a definite answer to the question of the type of community in which they were used. Therefore, the character of the community for which a particular source was made often remains wholly or partially in the shadows.

It is not only the fragmentary character of the transmission of the Gallican liturgy which makes this field of study difficult. The approach of the material by historians of liturgy in the past has not always shed a clearer light on the phenomenon. The wish to lump together the Gallican liturgy and to trace back its development to one particular origin often dominated the work of liturgical scholars in the nineteenth and twentieth centuries.<sup>6</sup> Consequently, an inadvertently confined vision on the Gallican liturgy developed. In this kind of research, the search for uniformity outweighed the endeavour of delineating the diversity of the rite. Also, there was one aspect

<sup>2</sup> Élie Griffé, *La Gaule chrétienne à l'époque romaine* (Paris: 1964-1966), vol. 1, 330; A. Heinz, "Altgallische Liturgie," *Lexikon für Theologie und Kirche* VI (Freiburg: 1999), 984; Theodorus Vismans, "Oud-gallicaanse liturgie," Lucas B. Brinkhoff (ed.), *Liturgisch Woordenboek* (Roermond: 1965-1968), vol. 2, 2084-2094, here 2085.

<sup>3</sup> Yitzhak Hen, "Unity in diversity," in Robert N. Swanson (ed.), *Unity and diversity in the Church* (Oxford: 1996, Studies in Church History 32), 19-30, here 26-27.

<sup>4</sup> Raymond Van Dam, *Saints and their miracles in Late Antique Gaul* (Princeton: 1993), 13: 'Cults differed and cults changed over time'.

<sup>5</sup> Hen, "Unity in diversity," 24.

<sup>6</sup> A clear survey of the various theories is given by Archdale A. King, *Liturgies of the past* (London: 1959), 78-84; W.S. Porter, *The Gallican rite* (London: 1958, Studies in Eucharistic faith and practice 4), 11-18.

of the liturgy on which this approach focused, the eucharistic liturgy, whereas other components received less attention, such as the liturgical calendar and the liturgical commemoration of the saints. In this article, an attempt is made to outline other possible ways of exploring this period in the history of the liturgy.

## 2 *The Missale Gothicum*

An excellent example of the way in which the sources of the Gallican liturgy provide some pieces of the jigsaw while, at the same time, leaving a considerable number of gaps is the *Missale Gothicum*, or Gothic Missal. The Gothic Missal is a sacramentary, written around 700 and handed down under a misleading name. For this book, now preserved in the Vatican Library (Vat.reg.lat. 317) is neither a missal nor Gothic. The title *Missale Gothicum* was added to the manuscript by a late medieval or even post-medieval scribe (f° 1<sup>R</sup>) who clearly had some difficulties in classifying this book, so different was it from contemporary liturgical practice. Whatever its title, the Gothic Missal belongs to the genre of the *sacramentaria*, that is, a collection of prayers used by the celebrant during the eucharistic liturgy, and following the entire cycle of the liturgical year. The book must have been written after the death of St Leodegar, bishop of Autun from 663 to his martyr's death in 679/680,<sup>7</sup> as a mass is included for his anniversary. Paleographically speaking, the manuscript cannot have been written much later than the beginning of the eighth century. The script seems to point to Burgundy as the book's region of origin, more particularly to the school of Luxeuil, with which the manuscript bears many similarities.<sup>8</sup> In general, the origin of the manuscript is dated to between 790 and 810, and ascribed to a scriptorium in the northeast of Gaul, where the Luxeuil script was current.<sup>9</sup>

The question as to which church or religious community used the Gothic Missal as a sacramentary is less easily solved. In order to find an answer to this question, various scholars have analysed the list of saints venerated

<sup>7</sup> Ian Wood, *The Merovingian kingdoms 450-751* (London: 1994), 78, 199; G. Bianchi, "La fonte latina del 'Sant Lethgier'," *Studi Medievali* Series III.13 (1972), 701-790, here 703.

<sup>8</sup> Edmund A. Lowe, *Codices Latini antiquiores I: the Vatican City* (Oxford: 1935), 34.

<sup>9</sup> Henry M. Bannister (ed.), *Missale Gothicum. A Gallican Sacramentary* (London: 1917-1919, Henry Bradshaw Society 52 and 54), vol. 1, xlvii-lviii; Leo C. Mohlberg, *Das galikanische Sakramentar (Cod. Vatican. Reg. Lat. 317) des VII.-VIII. Jahrhunderts* (Augsburg: 1929), *Textband*, 100.

in the Gothic Missal. Most of them chose the church of the Burgundian city of Autun as the most plausible match to the saints occurring in the sacramentary. Both Symphorian and Leodegar, for whose anniversaries masses are included in the Gothic Missal, served this city as bishops. Moreover, churches in Autun were dedicated to several other saints for whose *natale* a mass is found in the Gothic Missal, such as Stephen and Martin. The only problem as regards the ascription of the Gothic Missal to the church of Autun is the lack of a mass for the *natale* of this city's cathedral patron since 542, St Nazarius.<sup>10</sup> Several scholars in the past proposed a southern destination of the Gothic Missal, such as Mabillon, one of its first editors. In doing so, Mabillon was possibly misled by the manuscript's title, which he connected to the (visi)gothic liturgy of the South of Gaul and the North of Spain.<sup>11</sup> From a different perspective, Germain Morin suggested that the Gothic Missal belonged to the community of monks in Gregorienmünster, an Alsatian monastery. Morin based his proposal on the expression *patronus noster* by which pope Gregory I is addressed in one of the prayers in his honour included in the station liturgy for the Rogation days, three days of fasting and penitence preceding the feast day of Our Lord's Ascension.<sup>12</sup> There are, however, more saints in the Gothic Missal indicated as *patronus noster*, and the lack of a special mass in honour of Gregory's *natale* seems to weaken Morin's hypothesis. Although the 'Autun-hypothesis' suffers, by lack of mention of St Nazarius's name, from a similar weakness, there seems to be no decisive need to turn down this proposal sustained by the *communis opinio*.

It must be noted that the ascription of the Gothic Missal to 'the church of Autun' does not say anything about the character of the community by which the sacramentary was used. Nowhere in the manuscript are there any clear indications of the kind of community for which the book was destined. Although the significant attention given to the celebration of baptism during the Easter Vigil seems to point to episcopal use of the book, the assumption that the book was used in the environment of a bishop rather than in a community of monks or nuns cannot be more than a supposition, as the manuscript itself gives no definite answer to this question.

<sup>10</sup> Mohlberg, *Das gallikanische Sakramentar*, 107.

<sup>11</sup> Bannister, *Missale Gothicum*, vol. 1, lxvi.

<sup>12</sup> Germain Morin, "Sur la provenance du 'Missale Gothicum'," *Revue d'histoire ecclésiastique* 37 (1941), 24-30. Morin is followed by Joseph A. Jungmann, *The mass of the Roman Rite: its origins and development* (repr./transl. *Missarum Sollemnia*; Westminster: 1992), 46; Pierre Salmon, *Le lectionnaire de Luxeuil* (Rome: 1944), lxxxv.

As far as content is concerned, the Gothic Missal enables us to get a rather clear picture of the annual cycle of the liturgy in early medieval Gaul. The sacramentary follows the circle of the liturgical year, starting in the middle of the vigil preceding the celebration of Christ's birth by the feast of Christmas. Christmas might have been preceded by some Advent masses, but as the first four quires of the manuscript are lost, this can not be ascertained.<sup>13</sup> The vigil and mass of Christmas are followed by the Octave (period of a week following an important liturgical feast) of Jesus's birth, filled with feasts in commemoration of several Biblical saints. On the eighth day after Christmas, January 1, Our Lord's Circumcision is celebrated, followed five days later by the feast of Epiphany. Between Epiphany and the beginning of Lent, masses in honour of the Virgin Mary and of the apostles Peter and Paul are included. Also, a series of other saints' masses is included in this part of the manuscript. Lent is introduced by a mass *In caput ieiunii*. After five masses for Lent, Holy Week is started with Palm Sunday. Then follow Holy Thursday (*In caena Domini*) and the prayers for Good Friday and Holy Saturday, indicated together as *Biduana*. During the Easter Vigil, the new Easter candle is brought in and the praise of the reborn Light is sung in the famous Easter hymn *Exultet*, of which the Gothic Missal provides one of the earliest versions. Subsequently, the candidates are baptized. The resurrection is celebrated by a mass for each day of Easter Week, which is closed by the mass *In clausum Paschae*. In the period between Easter and Pentecost, a mass is included for the celebration of the Finding of the True Cross, as well as a mass for the apostle and evangelist John. Ascension is preceded, as mentioned previously, by the *Rogationes*, and followed by Pentecost. After Pentecost, again a series of saints' feast is included. Subsequently a number of general masses for the commemoration of one martyr or a group of martyrs and one confessor or a group of confessors is given, followed by six general Sunday masses.

---

<sup>13</sup> The mass for the vigil of Christmas, with which the incomplete manuscript starts, is numbered III by a contemporary scribe. There are, therefore, two mass forms lacking. The four lost quires must have contained more than only (Advent) masses, as one mass form needs an average of one quire. Possibly, some general material was collected at the beginning of the sacramentary, such as the Roman Canon (which is given at the beginning of the Bobbio Missal, a related manuscript of the same period) and perhaps a liturgical Calendar. That the first four quires were lost at an early date is indicated by the script of the remark *desunt quaterniones 4* in the first folio of the manuscript (f° 1<sup>R</sup>), which is of the same date as the hand which wrote down the book's misleading title.

This overview shows how the masses for the saints' anniversaries are interwoven in the feasts of the annual cycle. Although there is no separate *Sanctorale* in this type of liturgical book, for convenience's sake the sum of martyrs' and saints' feasts in the Gothic Missal is termed the book's *Sanctorale* in this article. The *Sanctorale* of the Gothic Missal and, more generally, of the Gallican liturgy, is a hitherto largely unexplored field.<sup>14</sup> Still, the study of this part of liturgical life is extremely important for, at least, two reasons. As was explained above, it is difficult to determine the character of the community in which the Gothic Missal was used as a sacramentary. It is, however, possible to picture an essential part of this community's piety by examining the manner in which it commemorated its saints. As was pointed out recently by a number of outstanding scholars, the cult of the saints was an essential part of the religious and social life in the late antique and early medieval period.<sup>15</sup> The annual liturgical commemoration of the saint's migration from this world was of central importance to the practice of venerating the saints. On this special day, the entire community gathered round the saint's grave or relics and celebrated his or her remembrance. The commemoration of saints brought the faithful together and, thus united, they were reconciled with each other and with God.<sup>16</sup> By studying the liturgical celebration of the saints, one of the cardinal aspects of medieval religious life is brought to attention.

In the second place, the liturgical cult of the saints is a particularly adequate means to explore the *diversity* of the Gallican liturgy. Although several scholars in the past have tried to pinpoint one particular city or region as the cradle of this liturgical tradition, it is important to stress the broad variety of influences that have contributed to the richness and diversity of

<sup>14</sup> Philipp Harnoncourt & Hansjörg Auf der Maur, *Feiern im Rhythmus der Zeit* II.1 (Regensburg: 1994, Gottesdienst der Kirche. Handbuch der Liturgiewissenschaft VI.1), 197, footnote 87. Auf der Maur mentions two authors who give a summary: King, *Liturgies of the past*, 133-143; id., *Liturgies of the primatial sees* (London: 1957), 68-75; Achille M. Triacca, "Teologia dell'anno liturgico nelle liturgie occidentali antiche non romane," *Anàmmesis*, 6 (1988), 311-363, here 340-343. Both summaries are, however, very confined and incomplete. See also Louis van Tongeren, "Transformations of the calendar in the early Middle Ages," Paul Post et al. (eds.), *Christian feast and festival. The dynamics of Western liturgy and culture* (Leuven: 2001, Liturgia condenda 12), 287-317.

<sup>15</sup> Peter Brown, *The cult of the saints* (Chicago: 1981); id., "The saint as exemplar in Late Antiquity," *Representations*, 1.2 (1983), 1-25; Raymond Van Dam, *Leadership and community in Late Antique Gaul* (Berkeley: 1985); id., *Saints and their miracles in Late Antique Gaul* (Princeton: 1993).

<sup>16</sup> Brown, *Cult of the saints*, 100.

the tradition under discussion. This will become clear as we concentrate in this study on the saints as they appear in the Gothic Missal and try to explore the origins of their veneration and liturgical celebration. This endeavour will take us on a journey through all of the various segments of the Christian world at the time.

### 3 '*Liturgie comparée*'

In a study such as the present one, in which an attempt is made to trace and summarize the various influences on a liturgical tradition, it is necessary to study the sources of this tradition, in this case the Gothic Missal, in their relation with contemporary liturgical and non-liturgical sources. Research of this kind leads the researcher inevitably to the work of undeniably the greatest practitioner of the study of comparative liturgy, Anton Baumstark. Baumstark's *Liturgie comparée*, which was first published more than fifty years ago, is a product of its time, and Baumstark's ideas and theories cannot be applied without a critical note.<sup>17</sup> However, the comparative method as such is an important and often even indispensable instrument for exploring the liturgy of the early Middle Ages, which has been handed down in such scarce and fragmentary sources. Therefore, liturgical sources of all kinds are opened in this study in order to compare them with the Gothic Missal. Liturgical calendars, lectionaries and *martyrologia* from all over the Christian world of the early days can contribute to a better understanding of the Gothic Missal and the Gallican rite.

The method of comparative liturgy has one important drawback. Baumstark's approach to liturgical traditions and developments risks regarding the liturgy as an autonomous entity, detached from the surroundings in which liturgical documents came into being and functioned. The study of early medieval liturgy can hardly be significant when the environment

---

<sup>17</sup> A clear explanation of Baumstark's method and a survey of modern criticism is given by Fritz West, *The Comparative Liturgy of Anton Baumstark* (Bramcote: 1995, Alcuin Club and The Group for Renewal of Worship; Joint Liturgical Studies 31); see also Paul Bradshaw, *The search for the origins of Christian worship. Sources and methods for the study of early liturgy* (Oxford: 1992), 56-79; Robert Taft, "Über die Liturgiewissenschaft heute," *Theologische Quartalschrift*, 177 (1997), 243-255. In 1998, fifty years after Baumstark's death, an international congress was held on the theme in Rome. Proceedings of this congress were published as Robert F. Taft & Gabriele Winkler (eds.), *Acts of the International Congress "Comparative Liturgy fifty years after Anton Baumstark (1872-1948)"*; Rome, 25-29 September, 1998 (Rome: 2001).

in which this liturgy played its role is not taken into account. This conviction has led me to a pluriform approach to the liturgical texts of the Gothic Missal. Elsewhere, I paid attention to linguistic aspects of the sacramentary, regarding the Gothic Missal as a source of early medieval, liturgical Latin.<sup>18</sup> In this study, the liturgical commemoration of the saints enclosed in the sacramentary is compared with other, non-liturgical aspects of the veneration of saints in the early medieval world. Hagiographical material of the saints that play a role in the *Sanctorale* of the Gothic Missal is laid alongside the liturgical prayers. By studying the relation between liturgical traditions and the hagiography of the period under discussion, the Gothic Missal, which is nothing more than a little piece of a complicated puzzle, is put in a broader perspective. Thus, a clearer light might shine on the long-forgotten world to which this manuscript belonged.

#### 4 *Liturgical commemoration of the saints in the Gothic Missal*

The saints to whose commemoration a mass is dedicated in the Gothic Missal can be divided into three groups. The first group consists of Biblical saints, mostly martyrs from the New Testament. The second group contains the martyrs of the early Church, drawn from Rome and North Africa. The last, but not least important group is formed by local saints: the martyrs of the Gallic church, including Gaul's most famous saint, Martin of Tours. In the following, the origins and development of the cult of these saints are outlined, as well as the beginnings of their veneration in the Gallic region.

##### 4.1 *Biblical saints*

In the Gothic Missal, masses are found for the *natale* of nine Biblical (groups of) saints. First of all, the evangelical martyrs are commemorated: St Stephen, the Holy Innocents and St John the Baptist. In addition to the apostles Peter, Paul, Andrew, and James and John, the Virgin Mary has her place in the *Sanctorale* of the sacramentary. This group of Biblical saints is the most interesting of the three groups in light of the attempt of this article to map the external influences that contributed to the development of the Gallican liturgy.

---

<sup>18</sup> Els Rose, *Communitas in commemoratione. Liturgisch Latijn en liturgische gedachtenis in het Missale Gothicum* (Vat.reg.lat. 317). (Diss. Utrecht: 2001, with a summary in English: *Com-*

Following the circle of the liturgical year, the martyr Stephen, who is often mentioned as the prototype of the Christian martyrs, is the first saint we come across in the Gothic Missal. Stephen's *natale* is celebrated on the day after Christmas. The feast of this saint originates in Jerusalem, where the martyr's commemoration was celebrated in the last week of December even before his relics were found in 415 AD.<sup>19</sup> After the *inventio* of the martyr's remains in a little village near the city (Caphar Gamala), the cult of this saint spread to the West. The church of North Africa was the first in the West to which Stephen's relics were moved. The Spaniard Orosius, who had received some relics from his fellow countryman Avitus of Braga, was stranded at Augustine's in Hippo on his way home from the Holy Land.<sup>20</sup> Starting from North Africa, the holy remains of Stephen found their way to Europe, via the trade centres of the Mediterranean, and also along the Rhône river inland.<sup>21</sup> In all extant sources of the Gallican liturgy, as in the other Western traditions,<sup>22</sup> the saint's feast day was celebrated in

---

*munitas in commemoratione. Liturgical Latin and liturgical commemoration in the Missale Gothicum* (Vat.reg.lat. 317)), 179-318. An English edition of this study is in preparation for *Corpus Christianorum, series latina*. See also Els Rose, "Liturgical Latin in the Missale Gothicum (Vat.reg.lat. 317). A reconsideration of Christine Mohrmann's approach," *Sacris Erudiri*, 41/42 (2002/2003; forthcoming).

<sup>19</sup> The finding of Stephen's relics is reported by the priest Lucianus, *Epistola Luciani ad omnem ecclesiam de revelatione corporis Stephani martyris primi et aliorum* (transl. into Latin by Avitus of Braga). Migne, PL 41, 805-818. A critical edition is available by S. Vanderlinden, "Revelatio sancti Stephani (BHL 7850-6)," *Revue des études byzantines* 4 (1946), 178-217. See on this *inventio* also B. Altaner, "Augustinus und die NT Apokryphen, Sibyllinen und Sextussprache. Eine quellenkritische Untersuchung," *Analecta Bollandiana*, 67 (1949), 236-248; Hippolyte Delehaye, *Les origines du culte des martyrs* (Brussel: 1933<sup>2</sup>), 80-82; Bernhard Kötting, *Peregrinatio religiosa. Wallfahrten in der Antike und das Pilgerwesen in der alten Kirche* (Munich: 1950), 260; Elisabeth A. Clark, "Claims on the bones of Saint Stephen: the partisans of Melania and Eudocia," *Church History*, 51 (1982), 141-156. In the late fourth, early fifth century, liturgical celebrations of St Stephen were also performed in Asia Minor, according to the *Martyrologium Syriacum*, which is supposed to reflect the liturgical practice of Nicomedia. *Martyrologium Syriacum*. Hans Lietzmann (ed.), *Die drei ältesten Martyrologien* (Bonn: 1911), 7-15, here 7.

<sup>20</sup> E.D. Hunt, *Holy Land pilgrimage in the later Roman Empire. AD 312-460* (Oxford: 1982), 213.

<sup>21</sup> Matthias Zender, *Räume und Schichten mittelalterlicher Heiligenverehrung in ihrer Bedeutung für die Volkskunde. Die Heiligen des mittleren Maaslandes und der Rheinlande in Kultgeschichte und Kultverbreitung* (Düsseldorf: 1959), 181.

<sup>22</sup> North Africa: *Calendar of Carthage*. Lietzmann (ed.), *Die Martyrologien*, 4-6, here 6; Spain: *Liber Mozarabicus Sacramentorum* 119-127. Marius Férotin (ed.), *Liber Mozarabicus Sacramentorum* (Paris: 1912), 58-60; Milan: *Sacramentarium Bergomense*, 137-145. Angelo Paredi

the Octave of Christmas, on the day of the translation of the relics from the place where they were found to Jerusalem: December 26.<sup>23</sup>

James and John, the sons of Zebedee and brothers in life and martyrdom, are commemorated in the Gothic Missal with a mass in the Octave of Christmas. Again, the oldest traces of a liturgical commemoration of these saints are found in Eastern parts, in this case, on the oldest Calendar of Asia Minor, the *Martyrologium Syriacum*.<sup>24</sup> This document is a testimony of the early fourth century liturgy of Nicomedia. Likewise, other fourth century sources of this region attest the liturgical celebration of James and John in the last week of December, such as Gregory of Nyssa's panegyric on the protomartyr Stephen.<sup>25</sup> According to the documents originating from Asia Minor, the commemoration of Zebedee's sons took place on the 27th of December. In Jerusalem, on the other hand, a liturgical celebration of these apostles existed at this early time on the 29th of December.<sup>26</sup> Both traditions can be found in the liturgy of early medieval Gaul. The tradition of Asia Minor, of a celebration in honour of James and John on December 27, is reflected by the Gothic Missal, whereas the Bobbio Missal, a related sacramentary, puts the brothers on the 29th of December, after the celebration of the *Innocentes* (December 28) instead of before.<sup>27</sup> In the latter, the Jerusalem tradition is visible, which possibly reached the Gallican liturgy via Spain, a country that had strong ties with the Holy Land through pilgrimage.<sup>28</sup>

---

(ed.), *Sacramentarium Bergomense* (Bergamo: 1962), 67-69; Rome: *Sacramentarium Gregorianum Hadrianum*, 62-66. Jean Deshusses (ed.), *Sacramentarium Gregorianum Hadrianum* (Fribourg: 1971), 106-107; *Sacramentarium Gelasianum Vetus*, 30-35. Leo C. Mohlberg (ed.), *Sacramentarium Gelasianum Vetus* (Rome: 1968), 11.

<sup>23</sup> *Epistola Luciani de revelatione*, 9. PL 41, 815.

<sup>24</sup> *Martyrologium Syriacum*. Lietzmann (ed.), *Die Martyrologien*, 8; cf. note 19.

<sup>25</sup> Gregory of Nyssa, "In praise of the holy protomartyr St Stephen." Migne, PG 46, 721-736, esp. 726, 730.

<sup>26</sup> According to the *Armenian Lectionary*, in which the fifth century liturgy of Jerusalem is reflected. Athanase Renoux (ed.), *Le codex arménien Jérusalem 121* vol. 2: *Édition comparée du texte et de deux autres manuscrits*, F. Graffin, *Patrologia Orientalis* 36.2 (Turnhout: 1971), 359-361. See also the introduction to this edition; id., *Le codex arménien Jérusalem 121* vol. 1: *Introduction aux origines de la liturgie hiérosolymitaine. Lumières nouvelles*, F. Graffin, *Patrologia Orientalis*, 35.1 (Turnhout: 1969), 103-106.

<sup>27</sup> *Bobbio Missal* 96-100. Edmund A. Lowe, (ed.), *The Bobbio Missal: a Gallican Mass-book* (London: 1920), 31-32.

<sup>28</sup> Anton Baumstark, "Orientalisches in altspanischer Liturgie," *Oriens Christianus*, 32 (1935), 1-37, here 17.

It is noteworthy that the celebration of the brothers James and John in the Octave of Christmas is, in the Gothic Missal, not the only commemoration as far as the apostle John is concerned. A separate celebration of this saint is found between Easter and Pentecost. The question as to the subject of this commemoration is one of the enigmas of the Gothic Missal. Possibly, there is a connection between this celebration in the sacramentary and the Roman feast in commemoration of John's legendary submersion in boiling oil, to which event the early medieval Roman church of *San Giovanni ad portam latinam* refers. However, although this legend was already known by Tertullian,<sup>29</sup> both the church dedicated to the event and the liturgical commemoration of the tradition were founded during the papacy of Hadrian I (d. 795), in other words, almost a century after the Gothic Missal was composed. Another possible origin of the separate commemoration of John the Evangelist could be found in the Greek celebration of the opening of the saint's grave in Ephesus, a legendary event handed down in the apocryphal writings on St John. According to this legend, a kind of white dust, called 'manna' was found in the saint's grave when it was opened, a miracle which was commemorated annually on the 8th of May in such locations as Constantinople.<sup>30</sup> In the prayers of the Gothic Missal, however, no reference is made to this tradition. It is interesting to see that the prayers of this mass do not refer to John's death at all—the texts present important aspects of John's life: how he was called to be a disciple of Jesus, how he preached the Gospel of 'the Word that was with God' and how he rested on the Lord's chest during the Last Supper. Moreover, the commemoration is indicated as *natalicia* (Go 326), a word which does not occur often in the Gothic Missal, but when used, is meant as the earthly birthday of Christ or a saint.<sup>31</sup> Thus, it is possible that the community in which the Gothic Missal was used as a sacramentary celebrated, in the month of May or early June, the earthly birthday of the apostle and evangelist John. This suggestion, however, is difficult to

<sup>29</sup> Tertullianus, *De praescriptione haereticorum*, 36.3. Raymond Refoulé (ed.), *Traité de la prescription contres les hérétiques*, SChr 46 (Paris: 1957).

<sup>30</sup> S.A. Morcelli, *Menologion ecclesiae Constantinopolitanae* (Rome: 1788), vol. 2, 97. Cf. R. van Dooren, "Johannes de Evangelist," *Liturgisch Woordenboek*, vol. 1, 1167; Louis Duchesne, *Origines du culte chrétien* (Paris 1925<sup>2</sup>), 298-299; K.A. Heinrich Kellner, *Heortologie oder die geschichtliche Entwicklung des Kirchenjahres und der Heiligenfeste von den ältesten Zeiten bis zur Gegenwart* (Freiburg i.B.: 1911), 223; also Auf der Maur, *Feiern*, vol. II.1, 220, in which the date is (mistakenly?) given as May 12.

<sup>31</sup> For instance, *Missale Gothicum*, 2 (birth of Christ), 373 (birth of John the Baptist).

substantiate as there is lack of material for comparison, the Gothic Missal being the only Western source in which this commemoration has a place.

The incorporation of apocryphal elements in liturgical texts of the Gallican tradition is not unusual. To this practice, the prayers in honour of St Andrew in the Gothic Missal bear ample witness. The texts for the feast day of this saint, on November 30, are clearly influenced by the apocryphal writings concerning the apostle.<sup>32</sup> Possibly, the liturgy played an important role in the process of transmission of these originally Greek traditions, despite the pronounced aversion the ecclesiastical authorities displayed to this genre from the fifth century onward.<sup>33</sup>

Life and death of John the Baptist are celebrated in the Gothic Missal by two separate feasts. The earthly birth of the *Precursor Domini* is strongly connected with Christ's birth and is celebrated in the West on June 24, six months before Christmas.<sup>34</sup> In Egypt, where Christ's coming into the flesh is celebrated on January 6, the birth of John the Baptist is likewise situated in the month of January.<sup>35</sup> The origin of the liturgical commemoration of John's birthday in the Gothic Missal is clearly Rome, in view of the great number of similarities between the prayers in the Gothic Missal and Roman material. The mass in honour of John's martyr death, however, was celebrated in Gaul and Spain earlier than in Rome. Perhaps the liturgy of Jerusalem influenced these early Western traditions in this respect.<sup>36</sup> In Jerusalem, a liturgical celebration of John the Baptist existed as early as the fifth century.<sup>37</sup>

The liturgical commemoration of the apostles Peter and Paul in the Gothic Missal is given shape through various feasts with different backgrounds. The death of both saints is commemorated by a joint feast of Roman origin, celebrated on the 29th of June. Additionally, both saints

<sup>32</sup> Cf. Els Rose, "Apocriefe sporen in de liturgie van de heilige Andreas," *Millennium*, 16 (2002), 17-37.

<sup>33</sup> Innocent I, 405 AD; Leo I, ca. 447 AD; *Decretum Gelasianum*, late fifth, early sixth century. See Jean-Marc Prieur (ed.), *Acta Andreae*, CCSA 5 (Turnhout: 1989), 111-116.

<sup>34</sup> Cf. Luke 1,36.

<sup>35</sup> Auf der Maur, *Feiern*, vol. II.1, 119; Mario Righetti, *Manuale di storia liturgica* (Milan: 1955<sup>2</sup>), vol. 2, 336. On 6 January as birthday of Christ, see J.F. Coakley, "Typology and the birthday of Christ on 6 January", *Symposium Syriacum V* (Rome 1990), 247-256; Thomas Talley, *The origins of the liturgical year* (New York 1986), 91; Susan Roll, *Toward the origins of Christmas* (Kampen 1995), 101.

<sup>36</sup> Baumstark, "Orientalisches in alspanischer Liturgie"; Duchesne, *Origines du culte*, 298-299.

<sup>37</sup> *Armenian Lectionary*. Renoux (ed.), *Le codex arménien*, vol. 2, 359-361.

have their own feast day, both in the period between Epiphany and the beginning of Lent. In Gaul, the commemoration of Paul's conversion (Act 13) was celebrated on January 25, whereas the annual celebration of Peter's episcopate, *Cathedra Petri*, took place on February 22. The latter feast is of Roman origin, and was being celebrated in the Eternal City by the beginning of the fourth century. Later, however, the feast disappeared from the Roman calendar for unknown reasons, while the commemoration survived in Gaul. From here, the feast found its way back to Rome in the tenth or eleventh century.<sup>38</sup> The liturgical commemoration of Paul's conversion, on the other hand, most likely originated in Gaul. This celebration was likewise incorporated in the Roman calendar in the tenth or eleventh century.<sup>39</sup>

The *Sanctorale* of the Gothic Missal contains only one feast in honour of the Virgin Mary: the celebration of *Assumptio Mariae* on January 18. We are dealing here with a typically Gallic date for the celebration of Mary's assumption, which might be of Egyptian or Syriac origin: both traditions celebrate a general feast in honour of Mary the Mother of God in the month of January.<sup>40</sup> Jerusalem had a liturgical celebration in honour of the *Theotokos* on the 15th of August.<sup>41</sup> The texts for the liturgical celebration of Mary's assumption in the Gothic Missal deal not only with the Virgin's miraculous demise; they also pay attention to her Divine Motherhood<sup>42</sup> and to important events in Mary's life such as the *Annuntiatio*.<sup>43</sup>

The liturgical celebration of the Holy Innocents, in conclusion, has its origin in the Church of the West. Long before the children received their own feast day on the liturgical calendar, their fate was remembered during the festivities of Epiphany. Their praises were sung in poems and sermons by Paulinus of Nola, Prudentius and Leo I. From the beginning of the sixth century, a separate liturgical commemoration was incorporated in the Calendar of Carthage.<sup>44</sup> In all of the Western liturgical traditions, the passion of these children was celebrated on December 28, except for

<sup>38</sup> Pierre Journel, *Le culte des saints dans les basiliques du Latran et du Vatican au douzième siècle* (Rome: 1977), 225-226.

<sup>39</sup> *Ibidem*.

<sup>40</sup> Bernard Capelle, "La fête de l'Assomption dans l'histoire liturgique," *Ephemerides theologicae Lovanienses*, 3 (1926), 33-45, here 35.

<sup>41</sup> *Armenian Lectionary*. Renoux (ed.), *Le codex arménien*, vol. 2, 335.

<sup>42</sup> *Missale Gothicum*, 94-103.

<sup>43</sup> *Missale Gothicum*, 103.

<sup>44</sup> Lietzmann (ed.), *Die Martyrologien*, 6.

Spain. In the Spanish tradition, the children's death was commemorated in the shadow of Epiphany (January 8).<sup>45</sup>

The Biblical saints whose *natale* is commemorated in the Gothic Missal provide a wonderful insight into the various traditions that influenced the liturgy of early medieval Gaul. Several traditions of the East as well as the West added to the pluriform and richly-varied entity which is the Gallican liturgy. In the next part of this study, a closer look is taken at the commemoration of saints in the Gothic Missal whose origin is found nearer home.

#### 4.2 *Roman martyrs*

The second group of saints commemorated in the Gothic Missal consists of a considerable number of Roman martyrs: Agnes, Caecilia, Clement; Sixtus, Laurent, and Hippolyte; Cornelius and his African friend and colleague Cyprian; and the less well-known martyrs John and Paul. The origin of these saints' liturgical cult is found nearer home: they were venerated by the Roman church from a fairly early date.<sup>46</sup> In many cases, the Gothic Missal is the oldest testimony of a liturgical cult of these saints in Gaul.

In the Gothic Missal, the illustrious chorus is opened by Agnes, a young maiden martyred during the reign of either Valerian or Diocletian.<sup>47</sup> In Rome, two liturgical commemorations of the virgin martyr were celebrated: one in honour of her death (January 21),<sup>48</sup> and one in honour of her earthly birthday (January 28).<sup>49</sup> Although the Gothic Missal, which is the only Gallican liturgical book in which a commemoration of Agnes is included, gives only one feast day in honour of this young martyr, Agnes occupies a prominent place among the Roman martyrs in the *Sanctorale* of

<sup>45</sup> *Liber Mozarabicus Sacramentorum*. Férotin (ed.), 97.

<sup>46</sup> The oldest survey of the liturgical commemoration of Roman martyrs is found in the calendar of Philocalus, dating from 354 AD, including the *Depositio episcoporum et martyrum*. Lietzmann (ed.), *Die Martyrologien*, 2-4 (cf. note 19).

<sup>47</sup> P. Allaard, "Sainte Agnès," *DACL* I, 905-918, here 913.

<sup>48</sup> According to the *Depositio martyrum*. Lietzmann (ed.), *Die Martyrologien*, 3.

<sup>49</sup> This second festival dates from a later period. The *Martyrologium Hieronymianum* is the oldest document bearing testimony to this festival, thus indicating that the celebration of Agnes's earthly birthday was already being practiced in the fifth century. The commemoration is also mentioned in both the *Sacramentarium Gelasianum Vetus* and the *Sacramentarium Gregorianum Hadrianum*.

this sacramentary. Several allusions to Agnes's earthly birth are found in the opening prayer of this single mass, the *praefatio missae*.<sup>50</sup> In this prayer, the celebration of the day is indicated as *beatae martyris natalicia*, a word that, in the context of the Gothic Missal, seems to point to a saint's earthly birthday rather than being synonymous with *natale*, meaning 'day of demise'.<sup>51</sup> This assumption is reinforced by the repetitive comparison in this prayer of Agnes's prodigious death with her life on earth.<sup>52</sup> Here again not only the saint's death, but also her birth and life are the subject of celebration, as is the case in the mass for *Assumptio Mariae* in the Gothic Missal.

Agnes is accompanied by Caecilia, who, like Agnes, had to suffer martyrdom because she refused to enter into a worldly marriage. For both Agnes and Caecilia, as well as their male companions in the list of Roman martyrs, the Gothic Missal is the eldest liturgical source in Gaul in which a commemoration of their *natale* is incorporated. In most cases, traces of veneration of these saints in Gaul outside the liturgy are scarce. Agnes and Caecilia play a role in the poems of Venantius Fortunatus. This Italian poet had been a student in Ravenna, where these virgin martyrs were venerated, and possibly introduced their cult into Gaul when he travelled north. The martyr Clement, one of the first bishops of Rome, who was drowned in the Black Sea after his exile to Cherson, is a well-known figure in Gallic hagiography as well. Clement is seen as one of the first missionaries sent to Gaul by the apostles, and forms an important *trait d'union* between the Gallic and the Roman church.<sup>53</sup> In Gaul, the martyr Laurentius is undeniably the most popular martyr of those venerated in the Gothic Missal. Both historiographical and hagiographical sources of early medieval Gaul bear witness to a lively veneration of the deacon-martyr. Also, many churches in Gaul were dedicated to this saint from the fifth century onwards.<sup>54</sup>

Whereas the masses for Agnes, Caecilia and Clement pay comparatively much attention to the stories of life and passion of their subjects, the prayers

<sup>50</sup> *Missale Gothicum*, 106.

<sup>51</sup> Cf. § 4.1.

<sup>52</sup> Rose, *Communitas in commemoratione*, 414-416; see also Leo Eizenhöfer, "Die Präfation für den Geburtstag der hl. Agnes," *Archiv für Liturgiewissenschaft*, 11 (1969), 59-76, here 67-68.

<sup>53</sup> Élie Griffé, "Les origines chrétiennes de la Gaule et les légendes clémentines," *Bulletin de littérature ecclésiastique*, 56 (1955), 3-22; id., *La Gaule chrétienne*, vol. 1, 104-115.

<sup>54</sup> Gregory of Tours, *Historiae*, X.31 and II.20. Bruno Krusch & Wilhelm Levison (eds.), MGH SRM I.1 (Hannover: 1951), 530 and 66.

of the masses for Sixtus, Cornelius & Cyprianus, and John & Paul are remarkably shallow. Only in the *immolatio*<sup>55</sup> of the mass in honour of Hippolyte is the influence of the *Passio* of the martyr visible. As this prayer is not of Roman origin, the *Passio* of Hippolyte was apparently well-known in Gaul, either because the text itself was circulated here, or through an unknown or now-lost Roman collection of prayers which was used in the region where the Gothic Missal was composed. If the other masses refer to the life and death of the saints at all—the prayers in honour of Sixtus, Cornelius & Cyprianus, and John & Paul are very short and superficial—they draw on Roman material. Even the more elaborate and certainly more expressive prayers for Laurentius are all of Roman origin. Thus the masses of most of the Roman martyrs in the Gothic Missal have no strongly pronounced features; the liturgical commemorations of these saints were not given a specifically Gallican character. In this respect there is a remarkable difference in the Gothic Missal between the masses in honour of the Roman martyrs and those which venerated the Gallic saints.

### 4.3 *Gallic saints*

The third group of saints of the *Sanctorale* of the Gothic Missal consists of saints of Gallic origin, most of whom died a martyr's death. It is, of course, not surprising that a liturgical document of Gallic origin pays ample attention to Gallic saints. However, it is interesting to see how the commemoration of these local saints is given shape. In the prayers in honour of the Gallic saints, the influence of hagiographical traditions is considerable. Therefore, it is necessary to take a closer look at the relation between liturgy and hagiography in this section.

The comparison of the liturgical prayer texts for the Gallic saints and martyrs in the Gothic Missal with the hagiographical material concerning these saints shows a close connection between the prayers with which the saints are honoured on their feast days and the texts in which their life and death are described. This connection is not equally close in the case of every saint. When looking at the mass of the largely unknown martyrs Ferreolus and Ferrucio, only few parallels between the *Passio* and the prayers in honour of these brothers can be found. With regard to other saints, such as bishop Leodegar of Autun or Martin of Tours, the most impor-

---

<sup>55</sup> The *immolatio* or *contestatio* in the Gallican liturgy is the part of the eucharistic prayer preceding the *Sanctus*.

tant saint of early medieval Gaul, it is clear that the hagiographical material played a more important role. In some cases, the prayers are difficult to understand if the reader is not familiar with the content of the *vita* or *passio* which is at the foundation of the liturgical text. In a few cases, the liturgical text has influenced the development of the later hagiographical tradition. Examples of these situations are discussed in the following.

The first example of a close connection between hagiography and liturgy is the mass in honour of St Symphorianus, bishop of Autun in the second or third century.<sup>56</sup> Some passages in the prayers of this mass are incomprehensible for the reader who does not know the *Passio Symphoriani*, written by bishop Eufronius of Autun in the middle of the fifth century. A remarkable phrase in the *immolatio* of the mass of Symphorianus (*Et fausti fulgidus genere, fausto martyri leuatur in culmine . . .*)<sup>57</sup> plays with the name of the saint's father, Faustus, which can be found in the *Passio*.<sup>58</sup> In addition to the saint's father, his mother also plays a prominent role in the *Passio*. She is depicted as a strong woman, encouraging her son to be perseverant in martyrdom, as his earthly life will not be taken away, but changed for the better.<sup>59</sup> The *immolatio* of the mass for Symphorianus in the Gothic Missal includes an elaborate reference to the 'admirable faith' (*O admiranda gratiarum fides*) of the mother. In addition to his own parents, his 'godparents' played a crucial role in Symphorianus's life: Benignus of Dijon and Andochius of Saulieu. Both martyrs, who baptized the little Symphorianus according to sixth century additions to the original *Passio*,<sup>60</sup> are mentioned in the *immolatio* of the Gothic Missal. It is clear that the composer of the liturgical prayers in honour of St Symphorianus must have known the hagiographical texts of this martyr in great detail. Various particulars, also concerning the saint's martyrdom, return in the liturgical prayers. Without knowledge of the hagiographical texts, the prayers in the Gothic Missal are difficult to comprehend.

The same attention to detail is visible in the mass for St Maurice and his companions, the martyrs of Agaune. The Gothic Missal follows the

<sup>56</sup> Griffe, *La Gaule chrétienne*, vol. 1, 152.

<sup>57</sup> *Missale Gothicum*, 418. Rose (ed.), *Communitas in commemoratione*, 148; Leo C. Mohlberg (ed.), *Missale Gothicum* (Rome: 1961), 102.

<sup>58</sup> *Passio Symphoriani*, c. 1. T. Ruinart (ed.), *Acta primorum martyrum sincera et selecta* (Amsterdam: 1713<sup>2</sup>), 79-83, here 80.

<sup>59</sup> *Passio Symphoriani*, c. 7. Ruinart (ed.), *Acta martyrum*, 82.

<sup>60</sup> *Passio Symphoriani interpolata*. J. Bollandus (ed.), *Acta Sanctorum Augusti IV* (Antwerpen: 1643-1940), 493-494.

*Passio* which bishop Eucherius of Lyon (d. 450/454) wrote in commemoration of this group of martyrs, and which stresses the large number of victims of the persecution: the first prayer of the mass even mentions the rather precise number of 6600 martyrs.<sup>61</sup> The liturgical prayer follows the *Passio* verbatim where it mentions the great courage (*audax*) of the soldier-martyrs.<sup>62</sup> The *immolatio* of the mass in the Gothic Missal is a very important example of a close connection between *Passio* and liturgical prayer. Where the *immolatio* tells the story of the saints' suffering and death and the elongated process of the decimating of the troops and the steadfast faith of Maurice's soldiers, the liturgical prayer often uses the same words as the *Passio*. The comparison of these two texts shows more than 'eine gewisse inhaltliche Ähnlichkeit' between *Passio* and *immolatio*, as Zufferey puts it.<sup>63</sup> At many points, the prayers of the Gothic Missal correspond literally to the *Passio*.

The relation between hagiography and liturgy is somewhat more complicated in the case of Saturninus, the first bishop of the South Gallic city of Toulouse whose *natale* was celebrated on November 29. According to the bishop's *Passio*, written in the fifth century,<sup>64</sup> Saturninus suffered martyrdom during the persecution of Decius in the year 250.<sup>65</sup> It is interesting to see that the Gothic Missal does not follow this *Passio* in some important aspects, such as the descent of the saint and his mission to Gaul. First of all, the Gothic Missal does not adopt the *Passio*'s dating of Saturninus's death in the third century, but follows the alternative tradition which regards Saturninus as one of the first missionaries of Gaul, travelling from Rome up north in the first generation after the apostles.<sup>66</sup> Clearly, it is this tra-

<sup>61</sup> *Missale Gothicum*, 419. Rose (ed.), *Communitas in commemoratione*, 149; Mohlberg (ed.), *Missale Gothicum*, 102.

<sup>62</sup> *Deus qui sanctis tuis Acauninsebus (. . .) audaciam sustulisti: Missale Gothicum*, 420. Rose (ed.), *Communitas in commemoratione*, 149; Mohlberg (ed.), *Missale Gothicum*, 103.

<sup>63</sup> Maurice Zufferey, "Der Mauritiuskult im Früh- und Hochmittelalter," *Historisches Jahrbuch*, 196 (1986), 23-58, here 40.

<sup>64</sup> Élie Griffé, "Une messe du V<sup>e</sup> siècle en l'honneur de saint Saturnin de Toulouse," *Revue du Moyen Age latin*, 7 (1951), 5-18, here 6-7; id., *La Gaule chrétienne*, vol. 1, 148; A.-V. Gilles, "L'évolution de l'hagiographie de saint Saturnin de Toulouse et son influence sur la liturgie," *Liturgie et musique (IX<sup>e</sup>-XIV<sup>e</sup> siècle)* (Toulouse: 1982), 359-379, here 361.

<sup>65</sup> *Passio Saturnini episcopi Tolosani et martyris*, c. 2. Ruinart (ed.), *Acta martyrum*, 129-133, here 130.

<sup>66</sup> On this 'Arlesian legend', see Griffé, *La Gaule chrétienne*, vol. 1, 104-108. Regarding the early dating of Saturninus's life and martyr death as one of the seven missionaries, see Caesarius of Arles, *De mysterio sanctae trinitatis*. Germain Morin (ed.), *Revue Bénédictine*, 46 (1934), 190-205.

dition of the so-called Arlesian legends, the search for a foundation of the Gallic church in Rome, which influenced the prayers in honour of Saturninus in the Gothic Missal, as is obvious in the *contestatio*:

For this bishop of yours, originating from the East, and out of Rome destined for Toulouse on the Garonne, accomplished both bishopric and martyrdom as a substitute of your Peter.<sup>67</sup>

The Gothic Missal not only carries on the tradition of the apostolic mission which founded the church of Gaul, but also adds an enigmatic remark on Saturninus's descent. On this theme, the *Passio* is rather reticent. The *contestatio* of the Gothic Missal, however, seems to suggest that the saint was from the East (*ab orientis partibus*). According to De Gaiffier, this remark was prompted by the confusion of material composed for an Advent Mass with a prayer in honour of St Saturninus.<sup>68</sup> Gilles even states that this liturgical confusion caused the later hagiographical tradition regarding Saturninus's Eastern origin.<sup>69</sup> Unfortunately, Gilles does not mention any concrete examples of this legendary tradition, leaving her statement unsubstantiated.

The mass for the Spanish martyr Eulalia of Mérida, treated here along with her Gallic companions, is another instance illustrating the importance of knowing the hagiographical sources when dealing with the liturgy of the saints. The oldest hagiographical writing dedicated to this saint is the hymn in honour of Eulalia in Prudentius's *Peristephanon*, written around 400.<sup>70</sup> All other hagiographical writings on the Spanish martyr, the *Passio Eulaliae* as well as Gregory of Tours's chapters on Eulalia in his *Glory of the martyrs*,<sup>71</sup> find their information in this poem.<sup>72</sup> The problem with the mass in honour of Eulalia in the Gothic Missal is that it is, together with four other saints whose feast days were celebrated in the months of November and December (Caecilia, Clement, Saturninus, and Andrew), included between the mass for Agnes (January 21) and *Conversio Pauli* (January 25). The

<sup>67</sup> *Siquidem ipse pontifex tuus ab orientis partibus in urbem Tolosatium destinatus Roma Garonnae inuicem Petri tui tam cathedram quam martyrium consummauit. Missale Gothicum*, 127. Rose (ed.), *Communitas in commemoratione*, 54-55; Mohlberg (ed.), *Missale Gothicum*, 37.

<sup>68</sup> B. De Gaiffier, "A propos d'un passage du "Missale Gothicum". S. Saturnin de Toulouse venait-il d'Orient?," *Analecta Bollandiana*, 66 (1948), 53-58.

<sup>69</sup> Gilles, "L'hagiographie de saint Saturnin," 363-364.

<sup>70</sup> Prudentius, *Peristephanon* III. H.J. Thomson (transl.), *Prudentius*. Loeb Classical Library 398 (London: 1961<sup>2</sup>), 142-157.

<sup>71</sup> Gregory of Tours, *Liber in gloria martyrum*, 90. Bruno Krusch (ed.), MGH SRM I (Hannover: 1885), 484-561, here 548.

<sup>72</sup> O. Engels, "Eulalia," *Lexikon des Mittelalters* IV, 92-93, here 93.

displacement (of which cause and reason are unclear) is particularly confusing in the case of this martyr, as there were in fact two saints Eulalia in early medieval Spain. The name of Eulalia of Barcelona has been known since the seventh century, and her feast day was celebrated on the 12th of February.<sup>73</sup> Comparison of the prayer texts with the hagiographical material is a means of finding out which of the two Eulalias is celebrated in the Gothic Missal. In the prayers, some details can be found which point in the direction of Eulalia of Mérida, most markedly the reference to the closing passage of Prudentius's hymn of Eulalia, in which the poet describes the martyr's death at the stake and the ascent of her soul to heaven:

Thence all at once a dove whiter than snow springs forth; they see it leave the martyr's mouth and make for the stars. It was Eulalia's spirit, milk-white, swift, and sinless.<sup>74</sup>

This image of a pure and swift dove is found in the *immolatio* of Eulalia's mass in the Gothic Missal:

And by a prodigious miracle your majesty accepted this virgin's spirit through the flames and received it through a dove.<sup>75</sup>

Thus, the comparison with hagiographical sources contributes to a better understanding of the liturgy.

The last martyr of the *Sanctorale* of the Gothic Missal, bishop Leodegar of Autun, became victim of a political controversy. The presence of his feast day in the Gothic Missal is a key as to the dating of the manuscript<sup>76</sup> and is one of the most important reasons for suggesting Autun as the place of destination of this sacramentary. The detailed description of the cruelties Leodegar had to undergo, the mutilations to his face as referred to in the *immolatio* of the mass, as well as the reference to the quick distribution of the martyr's relics to various places in Gaul in the same prayer, could be read as an eyewitness report, as Mohlberg states:

<sup>73</sup> H. Moretus, "Les saintes Eulalies," *Revue des questions historiques*, 89 (1911), 85-119, here 86.

<sup>74</sup> *emicat inde columba repens // martyris os nive candidior // visa relinquere et astra sequi; // spiritus hic erat Eulaliae // lacteolus, celer, innocuus.* Prudentius, *Peristephanon* III, 161-165. Transl. Thomson, *Prudentius*, 153.

<sup>75</sup> . . . *ingentique miraculo maiestas tua exalatum uirginis spiritum, quem adsumpsit per flammam, suscepit per columbam . . .* *Missale Gothicum*, 142. Rose (ed.), *Communitas in commemoratione*, 60; Mohlberg (ed.), *Missale Gothicum*, 42.

<sup>76</sup> Cf. note 7.

Die ihm [Leodegar] gewidmete Messe enthält vor allem in ihrer "Immolatio" Einzelheiten über das Martyrium, die an das Zeugnis eines Augenzeugen erinnern. Die Worte "ut nos famulos tuos omnemque plebem reminiscens talem pastorem" weisen deutlich darauf hin, daß die Messe im bischöflichen Wirkungskreise des Heiligen entstanden ist und für diesen bestimmt war: nach Autun. Wo sonst lebt er im unmittelbaren Andenken seines Volkes weiter?<sup>77</sup>

Still, Leodegar is not the only saint that is honoured with the title *pastor noster*. This honour is also granted to the Gallic saint *par excellence*, St Martin of Tours, the only saint in the *Sanctorale* of the Gothic Missal who did not die a martyr's death. The opening prayer of Martin's mass in the Gothic Missal indicates Martin as *patris nostri*.<sup>78</sup> As one of the best documented saints of Western Christendom, Martin's feast day was included in most of the sources of the Gallican liturgy.<sup>79</sup> His cult spread quickly after his death in 397, and did not remain confined to the borders of Gaul. It was already during the lifetime of Martin's hagiographer Sulpicius Severus that the *Vita Martini* had become a popular book in Rome. Also, a church was dedicated to the Gallic monk in this city as early as the beginning of the sixth century, whereas masses for this saint can be found in the *Sacramentarium Gregorianum Hadrianum* as well as in the Spanish *Liber Mozarabicus Sacramentorum*. As far as the Gallican liturgical sources are concerned, the prayer texts in honour of St Martin are clearly influenced by the hagiographical documents concerning this saint. In the prayers of the Gothic Missal, many quotations of the *Vita* by Sulpicius can be found. The first is given by the *collectio*, in which it is asked 'that Martin may obtain through his prayers, what the faithful cannot achieve with theirs'.<sup>80</sup> This phrase is a reference to Sulpicius's second letter, in which he informs his friend Aurelius of Martin's death and, at the same time, tries to find comfort for Aurelius and for himself in the thought that Martin lives on in heaven where he prays for his admirers.<sup>81</sup> The *immolatio* of the mass in the Gothic

<sup>77</sup> Mohlberg, *Das gallikanische Sakramentar*, 103.

<sup>78</sup> *Missale Gothicum*, 472. Rose (ed.), *Communitas in commemoratione*, 163; Mohlberg (ed.), *Missale Gothicum*, 112.

<sup>79</sup> See Els Rose, "Celebrating Saint Martin in early medieval Gaul," Post et al., (eds.), *Christian feast and festival*, 267-286.

<sup>80</sup> *Tribue, quaesumus, ut quod nostris obtinere praecibus non possumus, ipsius mereamur obtinere suffragiis*. *Missale Gothicum*, 473. Rose (ed.), *Communitas in commemoratione*, 163; Mohlberg (ed.), *Missale Gothicum*, 112.

<sup>81</sup> *Spes tamen superest illa sola, illa postrema, ut quod per nos obtinere non possumus, saltem pro nobis orante Martino mereamur*. Sulpicius Severus, *Epistola* II.18. Jacques Fontaine (ed.), *Vie de saint Martin*. SChr 133 (Paris: 1967) 316-344, here 332-334.

Missal, rightly called 'la grande préface' by the liturgist André Wilmart,<sup>82</sup> is a fine example of how people learned of a saint's life through the liturgical texts which celebrated his or her death. This prayer, which found its way into many liturgical books, but was also included in the thirteenth century collection of saints' lives *Legenda aurea*,<sup>83</sup> concentrates mainly on Martin's most famous deed: the sharing of his mantle with the poor man at the city gate of Amiens.<sup>84</sup> The prayer refers to the vision which Martin received the following night, and which showed him Christ, dressed in his own mantle, and proclaiming: 'Martin, still a catechumen, covered me with this vestment.'<sup>85</sup> The liturgical text praises Martin who was worthy 'not only to clothe, but even to behold God.'<sup>86</sup> In addition to this 'charité de saint Martin', other feats are mentioned, such as Martin's loyalty to Catholic Christianity despite the pressure of the Arians, whom he fought successfully;<sup>87</sup> his obedience to a life of (monastic) discipline;<sup>88</sup> his healing power<sup>89</sup> and his ability to even raise the dead:<sup>90</sup> a man, in short, equal to the apostles.<sup>91</sup> The prayers in honour of St Martin in the other sources of the Gallican liturgy add to this picture of a close connection between liturgical texts and hagiographical writings.<sup>92</sup> Thus, the liturgical celebration of St Martin in early medieval Gaul is one of the best examples of a strong connection between hagiography and liturgy.

<sup>82</sup> André Wilmart, "Saint Ambrose et la légende dorée," *Ephemerides liturgicae*, 50 (1936), 169-206, here 202.

<sup>83</sup> *Legenda aurea*, 166. Ed. Th. Graesse (Osnabrück: 1969) 750.

<sup>84</sup> Sulpicius Severus, *Vita Martini*, 3.1-3. Fontaine (ed.), SChr 133, 256-258.

<sup>85</sup> Sulpicius Severus, *Vita Martini*, 3.3: *Martinus, adhuc catechumenus hac me ueste contextit.*

<sup>86</sup> . . . *tanta erat gloriatio passionis, ut per quantitate uestis exiguae et uestire deum meruit et uidere.* *Missale Gothicum*, 476. Rose (ed.), *Communitas in commemoratione*, 164; Mohlberg (ed.), *Missale Gothicum*, 113.

<sup>87</sup> Cf. *Vita* 6.4.

<sup>88</sup> Cf. *Vita* 10.

<sup>89</sup> Cf. *Vita* 16-19; Sulpicius Severus, *Dialogi* II.4, III.6-9. Ed. C. Halm, CSEL 1 (Vienna: 1886), 152-216; Gregory of Tours, *Libri IV de virtutibus sancti Martini episcopi*. Ed. Bruno Krusch, MGH SRM I (Hannover: 1885), 584-661.

<sup>90</sup> Cf. *Vita* 7-8.

<sup>91</sup> Cf. *Vita* 10.1: *In solo Martino apostolica auctoritas permanebat.* Fontaine (ed.), SChr 133, 294.

<sup>92</sup> See Rose, "Celebrating Saint Martin," 278-282.

### 5 *Concluding remarks*

The community in which the Gothic Missal was used as a sacramentary was a community that centred around the commemoration of the saints. Until now, little attention has been given to the liturgical veneration of the saints in early medieval Gallican liturgy. However, this perspective seems to be a useful approach to the liturgical tradition of pre-Carolingian Gaul. Whereas scholars in the past used to look for one certain city or region as the cradle of this enigmatic entity, the exploration of the liturgical commemoration of the saints points to a wide range of influences that played a part in the history of the Gallican liturgy. The Gothic Missal, with its elaborate *Sanctorale*, provides vivid insights into this matter. The study of the cult of the saints commemorated in this sacramentary makes it clear that we must not, with respect to the development of the Gallican liturgy, look for one particular place of origin, but for a loom of influences, weaving the various strands of tradition. On this loom, the veneration of local, Gallic saints forms one of the brightest and most vivid cords. Not the search for uniformity, but the contemplation of diversity is fruitful for the study of a period such as the early Middle Ages. For this period is marked by the scarcity and fragmentary character of sources. Therefore, it seems more appropriate to ask an open question, which places the sources in bold relief, than to try to straitjacket the sources for the benefit of one closed theory or hypothesis. Such a straitjacket risks the exclusion of information that does not fit into the theory, thus obfuscating the material, which is inaccessible enough to begin with.

Detailed study of the liturgical texts composed to venerate the saints has shown that these texts cannot be considered without looking at their hagiographical counterparts. In particular, the liturgical texts for the local, Gallic saints reveal the close connection that exists between liturgy and hagiography. Other interesting traces lead to the influence of the apocryphal literature on the apostles in the prayer texts of the Gothic Missal, an element that comes to the fore predominantly with regard to the apostle Andrew. All of this makes it clear that the liturgical texts of early medieval Gaul are not isolated from the rest of cultural and religious life. The broader context of the cult of the saints is crucial to the study of the liturgy, as is the liturgy to a better understanding of the importance of the saints in daily life of this remote period.

Faculteit der Letteren uu  
Muntstraat 2 A NL-3512 EV Utrecht