very brief introduction to more complex Schenkerian concepts such as 'prolongation', 'background structure', and 'voice exchange', on which much of the analytical work is reliant.

Perhaps the most compelling aspect of this study, and also the one that carries the greatest urgency in terms of potential avenues for further investigation, is the historical question that is touched on in the final pages. It is now well recognized that Schubert treated the tonal system experimentally, and Beach's characterization of this attitude of experimentalism suggests a rethinking of wider historical questions when he remarks that 'Schubert flirts with equal division of the octave, including the whole-tone scale, though he always pulls back, ultimately, to the tonal system' (p. 199). There seems to be an invitation here to think about the mature Schubert's place as a forerunner to currents in twentieth-century composition that might eventually come to rival the perceived influence exerted on that much later modernist repertory by late Beethoven.

<div align="right">
CHRISTOPHER TARRANT
<i>Anglia Ruskin University</i>
doi:10.1093/ml/gcy020
</div>

This volume offers a collection of essays published in memory of Edward Laufer (1938–2014), a devoted musician and Schenkerian analyst. Having studied with Milton Babbitt and Ernst Oster, and having taught at the University of Toronto for thirty years, Laufer played a key role in educating generations of professional analysts and musicians. Not only did he publish significant studies on late Romantic composers such as Sibelius and Bruckner, as well as a widely acclaimed review of Oster's translation of *Free Composition* (in *Music Theory Spectrum*, 3 (1981), 158–84), but he also thought deeply about voice-leading principles in the music of twentieth-century composers.

The present volume brings together fifteen former colleagues, students, and friends to offer analytical essays in honour of Laufer. A number of them originated as presentations at the last Schenker symposium, in March 2013. The book is organized by time period, in three parts: (1) Eighteenth Century; (2) Early Nineteenth Century; and (3) Late Nineteenth Century. The book also contains a transcription of an interview with Laufer conducted in 2003 by Stephen Slottow.

The opening five essays that constitute Part I draw on repertory of the mid-to-late eighteenth century. The first two studies, by Charles Burkhart and Mark Anson-Cartwright, engage respectively two staples of J. S. Bach's oeuvre: the C major fugue from Book 1 of *The Well-Tempered Clavier* and the opening eight numbers of the St Matthew Passion. Burkhart's essay is written in the form of a letter to Laufer delivered to him two weeks before his death. Among other things, it explains the performance implications of the analytical observations and draws attention to the 'parenthetical passage', a technique Laufer allegedly coined at the first Schenker Symposium in 1985. Anson-Cartwright's study takes a more comprehensive view of tonal structure in Bach through multiple segments of the St Matthew Passion. It includes a discussion of how a motif (rather than overarching key) can link the various numbers—in this regard, it pays particular attention to the structuring of the recitatives, an aspect of tonal analysis often overlooked.

The essays by Frank Samarotto and L. Poundie Burstein focus on music of the Galant period. Samarotto explores the juxtaposition of 'recurrence' and 'fantasy' in C. P. E. Bach's Rondo in G Major (H. 268, Wq 59/2). He distinguishes between what he calls 'fantasy recurrence', 'in which a familiar element reappears within space clearly belonging to fantasy', and 'recurrence fantasy', 'which creates the illusion of normal discourse but is understood as fantastic at a deeper level' (p. 27). While both concepts have strong analytical import, it is the latter that will pique the reader's interest most. Samarotto locates it within the central part of the rondo, where a restatement of the opening refrain is sounded in the lowered subtonic, F major. Although it might give the listener the immediate feeling of being 'back home', it is for Samarotto nothing more than a dream of home, a fantasy at the deepest possible level. This and other such temporally oriented analytical observations make Samarotto's essay one of the most engaging to read in the volume.

Burstein's essay explores issues of form and structure in Galant music, and in doing so draws on ideas from Heinrich Christoph Koch's 1793 *Versuch einer Anleitung zur Composition*. Burstein seeks to change the discourse around form and voice-leading structure in works composed between the 1750s and 1770s. Taking his cue from Koch's own

notions of *Periode* and *Satz*, which differ from standard English usage today, Burstein shows new ways of aligning middleground paradigms with formal sections and harmonic resting points, in examples by Haydn, Mozart, and Jommelli; he then demonstrates how this leads to results that differ from normative Schenkerian readings, which rely principally on formal procedures of the high Classical period.

The final essay of Part I is by Timothy L. Jackson. Like Burstein, Jackson wishes to challenge so-called 'normative' approaches to sonata form, and he does so by undertaking analyses of two symphonies by Anton Eberl (1765–1807) and Beethoven's 'Eroica' Symphony. Jackson argues that Eberl's compositional procedures lend themselves to a different kind of formal analysis, and subsequently to alternate types of middleground prolongation in the exposition and recapitulation. He also suggests that Beethoven may have drawn inspiration from Eberl's E flat symphony in composing the 'Eroica', specifically in using two subsidiary thematic groups, in introducing new themes in the development, and in embedding the structural tonic deep in the exposition. Eberl's music is hardly known in analytical circles, and Jackson's efforts to bring these largely forgotten composers to the fore is laudable.

The second part of the book (Early Nineteenth Century) begins with two essays on Schubert. David Beach provides a detailed analysis of the first two movements of Schubert's 'Unfinished' Symphony. He compares both the formal and voice-leading content of the movements, as a way of demonstrating their structural similarities. One of these is Schubert's use of the submediant as initiating a downward arpeggiation from I to IV—in the first movement, this occurs within the space of the exposition; in the second, it happens across the exposition and recapitulation (this latter movement lacks a development). Another similarity is the prominence of scale-degree $\hat{5}$ as a deep covering tone with upper-neighbour tendencies (both movements being based on a fundamental line from scale-degree $\hat{3}$). And finally, both movements lack interruption and are thus continuous (one-part) in their overall structure, which is remarkable given their sheer size.

Like Beach, Su Yin Mak also explores the relationship between structure and sonata form in Schubert. She takes a close look at the first movement of Schubert's Octet in F major, D803, and explores in the way in which the three-key design of the exposition (I–VI–V) affects its deeper voice-leading patterns. It is specifically the moments of misalignment between thematic design, key scheme, and tonal structure that Mak finds most noteworthy. She concludes that '[t]hese dimensionally dissonant interactions destabilize formal conventions and syntactical norms, and posit a dialectical engagement between structure and design' (p. 140). Beach's and Mak's studies will both prove valuable for future analytical studies of Schubert's music.

The chapter by Roger Kamien is similarly focused on the interaction between form and structure, in this case within a single prelude by Chopin (Prelude in B♭ Major, Op. 28 No. 21). Kamien argues that, rather than opt for a traditional reading of binary or ternary form, this prelude is best considered as a through-composed form cutting through a surface thematic A–B–A′+ coda design. This has largely to do with the gradual descent of an undivided fundamental line, cutting through the entire prelude. Kamien also adds a nice touch to his analysis by showing the increasingly melodic role of the opening accompanimental pattern of the left hand, which further adds to the through-composed and variation-like nature of the Prelude.

The final two essays of Part II focus on the music of Robert Schumann, and both intermingle Schenkerian analysis with poetic readings of the music. The first of these essays is by William Rothstein, who explores the ambiguities and multiple meanings embedded within Schumann's famous 'Manfred' overture. Rothstein provides the reader with a detailed exposé of the opening moments of the overture, and links the trials and travails of the protagonist of Byron's story to Schumann's compositional creation. Quoting from Karl Marx, 'all that is solid melts into air', Rothstein points to the melting of traditional tonal syntax—tonic and dominant sonorities, stable versus passing notes, and clear hypermetrical division—that gives 'Manfred' its lifeblood.

Lauri Suurpää combines theories of narrativity and form with a Schenkerian reading of Schumann's music, in the final two movements of the Second Symphony. Suurpää argues that these movements do not provide clear resolution at either local or global levels; at the same time, he reads a definite teleology across the movements, owing to the recurring use of the third movement's principal theme across both movements. Like the 'Manfred' overture, the third movement is in a sonata form, and it too lacks a structural divider, due to the dual function of the dominant as both ending the development and initiating the recapitulation—this is but one of the many form-functional ambiguities built into the closing movements of the symphony.

The last part of the book (Late Nineteenth Century) contains analyses of late-nineteenth- and early twentieth-century works. The first essay, by Ryan McClelland, takes an in-depth look at the role of the opening half-diminished seventh chord in three of Brahms's Lieder: *Nachtigallen schwingen* (Op. 6 No. 6); *Die Liebende schreibt* (Op. 47 No. 5); and *Die Schale der Vergessenheit* (Op. 46 No. 3). McClelland's is one of the only essays in the volume to explore the affect of a single sonority on a piece's structure and expressive impact; his Schenkerian sketches show the way in which the outer voices of the local chord can initiate larger voice-leading processes, whether it takes on the status as a neighbour note, or whether it stands in for a genuine harmonic degree in a larger progression.

The final four essays of the volume all deal with large-scale orchestral and vocal works. The first two focus on the significance of motif for Schenkerian analysis. Leslie Kinton explores the role of motivic enlargement in Dvořák's Seventh Symphony. He describes two kinds of motivic enlargement: (1) an initial surface motif that affects the course of the first subject area; and (2) a foreground motif of the exposition that plays out over the course of the development section. Kinton models these uses of motif on piano sonatas by Mozart (K. 545) and Beethoven (Op. 14 No. 1), drawing directly on Laufer's previous research. Whereas the first movement to Dvořák's symphony makes use of motivic enlargement of the opening fragments over the course of the exposition's first subject area, the Finale sees motivic enlargement occurring across the entire development section, based on a fragment in the second subject.

Don McClean's contribution is a detailed exposé of the 'Libera Me' from Verdi's *Messa da Requiem*. McClean takes the reader through a whirlwind tour of the movement: first, with a discussion of the liturgical text and the overall formal and tonal design of the music; then, with a closer look at select moments in the movement that demonstrate Verdi's handling of structural motifs, which link its various parts together. These include the double-neighbour figure; chromatic and diatonic fourth progressions; a fugue subject with a characteristic 'seventh-for-second' motif (i.e. instead of moving directly by step upwards, the music spans a seventh downwards); and an enharmonic play between C♭ and B♮, which highlights the conflict between death and deliverance in the mass. For McClean, these motifs are best understood in the way they transform and accumulate over time, rather than merely as related outside of musical time. McClean concludes his study with a poetic touch by noting the fantasy-like character of 'Libera Me', in which a single programmatic idea ('deliverance from death') leads the listener through a series of 'developing restatements' using the 'underlying compositional ideas' of the music, continually returning us 'to the cross-roads' (p. 274).

The final two essays revolve around compositions of the early twentieth century. The first of these is offered by Matthew Brown, who provides a reading of the 'Dance of the Seven Veils' from Strauss's *Salome*. Brown shows that, despite Schenker's well-known protestations against Strauss's music, a Schenkerian reading can be rendered of this dance, and it can account for the use of motifs (especially the neighbour), extended sonorities, and exotic scales. Brown distinguishes between 'architectural' and 'programmatic' motifs, which provides a useful distinction for sorting out the differing status a motif can take on in a work. Underneath Strauss's dense texture of motifs, Brown identifies a number of straightforward harmonic *Stufen* that support the music.

Finally, Boyd Pomeroy's essay takes a look at the technique of the 'chromatically-displaced dominant' in the music of Debussy, which can take the form of a ♭V^7 or a ♯V^7 chord. Pomeroy explores a number of hypothetical models for describing the voice-leading possibilities inherent in these chords, and then goes on to analyse two movements from *La Mer* ('Dialogue du vent et de la mer', 'Jeux de vagues'), one movement from *Images for Orchestra* ('Rondes de printemps'), and a piano prelude ('La Cathédrale engloutie'). He gives two basic conditions for perceiving a chromatically displaced dominant: (1) 'Tonal syntactical equivalence to the diatonic dominant' (i.e. it stands in at the moment a traditional dominant would occur, and thus is understood syntactically); and (2) 'Balance in the larger tonal-structural context' (i.e. the substitution of a structural dominant is balanced with a coherent diatonic structure). Whether or not these conditions will help guide someone in the course of listening to the work is difficult to prove, but Pomeroy's conditions help specify the basic constraints for analysing a chromatically displaced dominant in the context of a voice-leading sketch. One of these perceptually difficult yet analytically rich tools includes Pomeroy's 'common-tone neighbor' (CTN) resolution, in which a note of the chromatically altered dominant 'resolves' by common note onto a note of the tonic sonority (for example, the F♭ of a G♭ dominant seventh that progresses to E♮ of a C major chord). At the end of his

132

essay, Pomeroy too offers a poetic touch to his analysis, by noting the relationship between the dynamism of natural forces in these works and the 'violent dislocation of chromatically displaced voice-leading' prevalent in all of them (p. 322). For Pomeroy, Debussy's allusion to nature's many vagaries lies less on the surface of the music and more in the deeper conflicts of tonal structure. In all, Pomeroy offers an important contribution to analytical studies of Debussy's music.

In general, the analyses in the book are of a high quality. Readers will certainly have their work cut out for them, since each essay demands an intimate knowledge of the works under discussion. Many of these are large-scale orchestral or vocal works, which makes the task all the greater. Readers with little or no training in Schenkerian analysis will have a difficult time finding their way through such a volume. But those who do take the time to consider carefully the observations and arguments of the authors will be rewarded with greater analytical insight. The graphs are nicely displayed, as are the many form charts and musical examples. Because the essays were written in isolation from one another, there is great variation in the style: some are expanded academic essays, while others have a more personal character; some offer copious citations and extensive footnoting, others provide barely a footnote.

Although the essays in the volume can all be read in isolation, certain general themes can be detected, such as a ubiquitous concern for form and structure, the role of motif (a trademark of Laufer), and the relationship between voice-leading structure and musical meaning. Musical form, for instance, is proving to be one of the most contested areas in music analysis; just as aspects of form and design can influence voice-leading structures, Schenkerian studies such as these have much to contribute to form studies. And, outside of specialist circles, discussions of Schenkerian motif, as well as the relationship between voice-leading structure and meaning, remain by and large neglected—their applicability to issues of performance, listening, and broader analytical questions still require sustained attention.

Finally, since the volume was dedicated to Laufer, this reviewer would have liked to see one or more contributions dedicated to the analysis of post-tonal repertory, which was one of Laufer's central concerns. Of all the essays here, only the one by Pomeroy offers anything that approaches alternative Schenkerian-analytic linear procedures and structures. But all in all, the reader will find this volume a welcome contribution to the Schenkerian analytical corpus.

JOHN KOSLOVSKY
*Conservatorium van
Amsterdam / Utrecht University*

Giacomo Puccini, *Manon Lescaut*, *Dramma lirico in Quattro atti* (Le Opere di Giacomo Puccini: Edizione critica, vol. 3), edited by Roger Parker. (Ricordi, Milan, 2013; ISBN 978-88-7592-954-1.)

Roger Parker's edition of *Manon Lescaut* is the inaugural volume in the complete critical edition of the operas of Giacomo Puccini to be published as a series by Ricordi. *Manon Lescaut* is a particularly egregious example of substantial editorial challenges caused by the composer's incessant revisionary impulse. Things were messy from the beginning—no fewer than seven people had a hand in the libretto—and Puccini (and also Toscanini, with his approval) went on to tinker with the score periodically for thirty years after its premiere at the Teatro Regio in Turin on 1 February 1893. Change did not always follow a rectilinear path, as with the excision (around 1906) and then reinstatement (around 1920) of Manon's Act IV aria 'Sola, perduta, abbandonata', or the more general aesthetic impulse to lighten the orchestration from what was recorded in the autograph score, only to fill in the texture again later in life. The amount of material is daunting and it includes Puccini's orchestral autograph, six printed scores with autograph markings, five editions of the full score, and seven of the vocal score. Another measure of documentary abundance is the fact that Suzanne Scherr's recent dissertation 'Puccini's *Manon Lescaut*: Compositional Process, Stylistic Revisions, and Editorial Problems' (University of Chicago, 2013) weighs in at 1,782 pages (this secondary source was not available to Parker).

Comparison with the source situation of Verdi's operas highlights the complexity of the Puccini record. Verdi tracked changes made to his operas in the course of their initial performance runs in his autograph full scores, which have often been considered the document of record and copy-text for the critical edition, though of course they contain inevitable inconsistencies. Puccini, on the other hand, did not enter changes in his autograph full score, which was quickly superseded by other