

The Future of Human Rights
Impact Assessments of Trade Agreements

SCHOOL OF HUMAN RIGHTS RESEARCH SERIES, Volume 35.

A commercial edition of this dissertation will be published by Intersentia under ISBN 978-90-5095-986-5.

The titles published in this series are listed at the end of this volume.

Typesetting: G.J. Wiarda Institute for Legal Research, Boothstraat 6, 3512 BW Utrecht, the Netherlands.

The Future of Human Rights Impact Assessments of Trade Agreements

De toekomst van mensenrechtelijke
effectanalyses van handelsovereenkomsten

(met een samenvatting in het Nederlands)

Proefschrift

ter verkrijging van de graad van doctor
aan de Universiteit Utrecht
op gezag van de rector magnificus, prof. dr. J.C. Stoof,
ingevolge het besluit van het college voor promoties
in het openbaar te verdedigen
op vrijdag 30 oktober 2009 des middags te 2.30 uur

door

Simon Mark Walker
geboren op 12 oktober 1966
te Sydney, Australië

Promotoren: Prof. mr. C. Flinterman
Prof. mr. W.J.M. van Genugten

In loving memory of my dear cousin Pamela Johnson – who thought of the idea and whose undying patience and generosity in reading and reviewing the text made all the difference.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my heart felt thanks to the many family and friends who have helped me through the past years. In particular, I would like to thank Mac Darrow and Kitty Arambulo for helping me get started; Claire Mahon for editing the final manuscript; Nicolas Fasel and James Harrison for reading chapters; Deb Seaton and Roger Holberton for feeding me; Helen Corkhill and Alex Godfrey for being moral support and for providing a good laugh at critical moments; to Melinda Ching-Simon; and Christian Bernardini for his patience and much more. I would also like to thank my supervising professors Cees Flinterman and Willem van Genugten for providing me with the opportunity to undertake these studies and for their careful comments that helped me finalize the thesis. Finally, I would like to thank the United Nations for having the foresight to believe in further education of its staff by providing the opportunity to take Sabbatical leave, without which I would never have finished.

Simon Walker

TABLE OF CONTENTS

Acknowledgements	vii
List of Abbreviations	xiii

INTRODUCTION 1

1	The call for human rights impact assessments of trade agreements	1
2	The origins of human rights impact assessments in environmental and social assessment	3
3	<i>Ex ante</i> impact assessments of trade agreements	7
4	Research question and structure	9

CHAPTER I

A HUMAN RIGHTS FRAMEWORK FOR IMPACT ASSESSMENT OF TRADE AGREEMENTS 13

1	Introduction	13
2	Human rights: what rights, whose rights and whose obligations?	13
2.1	What human rights are subject of impact assessments of trade agreements?	13
2.2	Are market freedoms human rights?	17
2.3	Whose rights are subject of Human Rights Impact Assessments of trade agreements?	19
2.4	What actors are subject to Human Rights Impact Assessments of trade agreements?	21
3	A proposed framework for Human Rights Impact Assessments	30
3.1	A rights-based approach to impact assessment	30
3.2	Human rights should be the explicit subject of a HRIA	30
3.3	The process of the assessment should respect human rights	34
3.4	The impact assessment should contribute to building the capacity of rights-holders and duty-bearers	36
3.5	The impact assessment should involve human rights actors	37
4	Original aspects of the human rights framework	39
4.1	Two social impact assessment frameworks	39

4.2	Areas of overlap between human rights and social impact assessment frameworks	40
4.3	Original aspects of the Human Rights Impact Assessment framework	43
5	Conclusions	49

CHAPTER II

A METHODOLOGY FOR HUMAN RIGHTS IMPACT ASSESSMENTS OF TRADE AGREEMENTS

		51
1	Introduction	51
2	Trade agreements subject to Human Rights Impact Assessments	52
2.1	The content of trade agreements	52
2.2	Sectors relevant to Human Rights Impact Assessments	59
3	Ten categories of impact of trade agreements on human rights	61
3.1	Trade law complements human rights law	62
3.2	Trade agreements promote the growth and resources necessary for the progressive realization of human rights	65
3.3	Trade agreements can breach human rights in practice	66
3.4	Trade agreements can limit government capacity to promote human rights	69
3.5	Trade agreements lead to a ‘race-to-the-bottom’ in human rights protection as countries try to compete on global markets	72
3.6	Trade agreements limit the use of trade measures to improve the enjoyment of human rights abroad	74
3.7	Trade law conflicts with human rights law	77
3.8	Enforcement of trade agreements is stronger than human rights enforcement which could lead to a prioritization of trade law over human rights law	79
3.9	Trade agreements and trade institutions fail to respect the right to take part in the conduct of public affairs	83
3.10	Trade ‘values’ threaten human rights ‘values’	84
4	A step-by-step process	86
4.1	General process	86
4.2	Step one: Preparation	89
4.3	Step two: Screening	92
4.4	Step three: Scoping	93
4.5	Step four: Analysis	98
4.6	Step five: Recommendations	99
4.7	Step six: Monitoring and evaluation	101
4.8	Step seven: Preparation of the report	102
5	Data collection and analysis	103
5.1	Qualitative, quantitative and mixed-methods	103

5.2	Human rights indicators	106
5.3	Techniques for collecting and analyzing data	114
6	Conclusion	121

CHAPTER III

ASSESSMENT OF CAFTA: THE IMPACT OF INTELLECTUAL PROPERTY PROTECTION ON THE RIGHT TO HEALTH AND RELATED RIGHTS IN COSTA RICA	123
--	------------

1	Introduction	123
2	Step one: Preparation	125
3	Step two: Screening	129
4	Step three: Scoping	134
4.1	Introduction	134
4.2	Intellectual property protection and access to medicines in CAFTA	134
4.3	Human rights and access to medicines in Costa Rica	149
4.4	Identification of potential impacts	155
4.5	Assessment techniques	156
4.6	Human rights indicators	158
5	Step four: Analysis	162
5.1	Introduction	162
5.2	Step one: Impacts of CAFTA on extending market exclusivity of IP protected pharmaceuticals	162
5.3	Step two: Impact of extended market exclusivity on prices	167
5.4	Step three: Impact on human rights	171
5.5	Indicators in light of the introduction of the TRIPS plus provisions	183
6	Step five: Conclusions and recommendations	184
7	Step six: Monitoring and evaluation	186

CHAPTER IV

BENEFITS AND RISKS OF HUMAN RIGHTS IMPACT ASSESSMENTS OF TRADE AGREEMENTS	187
--	------------

1	Introduction	187
2	Benefits of Human Rights Impact Assessments of trade agreements	187
2.1	A comprehensive framework	187
2.2	A more objective standard	191
2.3	A developed analytical framework	192
2.4	A limitation to ‘trade-offs’	196
2.5	Legal accountability	198
2.6	A supportive network of actors	200

Table of Contents

2.7	Conclusions	201
3	Risks of Human Rights Impact Assessments of trade agreements	201
3.1	Politicization	201
3.2	Annexation	203
3.3	Externalization	205
3.4	Imbalance	205
3.5	Feasibility	206
3.6	Conclusions	209
	FINAL OBSERVATIONS	211
	Annex 1. Intellectual Property Protection in the TRIPS Agreement relevant to access to medicines	221
	Annex 2. Intellectual Property Protection of Pharmaceuticals in Practice	225
	Samenvatting	227
	Bibliography	231
	Curriculum vitae	247

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

ACP	African, Caribbean and Pacific countries
CAFTA	Dominican Republic-United States-Central American Free Trade Agreement
CCSS	Caja Costarricense de Seguridad Social
CEDAW	Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Discrimination Against Women
CRPD	Convention on the Rights of Persons with Disabilities
EAA	Ecumenical Advocacy Alliance
EC	European Commission
EIAs	Environmental Impact Assessments
EU	European Union
FDI	Foreign Direct Investment
GDP	Gross Domestic Product
HRIAs	Human Rights Impact Assessments
IAIA	International Association of Impact Assessment
ICCPR	International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights
ICERD	International Convention on the Elimination of All Forms of Racial Discrimination
ICESCR	International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights
IFC	International Finance Corporation
IAs	Integrated Impact Assessments of the United Nations Environment Programme
ILO	International Labour Organization
NAFTA	North American Free Trade Agreement
NGO	Non-governmental organization
NHRI	National Human Rights Institution
OECD	Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development
OHCHR	Office of the United Nations High Commissioner for Human Rights
SIAs	Social Impact Assessments
SRSG	Special Representative of the Secretary-General
TRIPS	Agreement on Trade-Related Aspects of Intellectual Property Rights
TSIAs	Trade and Sustainability Impact Assessments of the European Commission
UN	United Nations
UNEP	United Nations Environment Programme

List of Abbreviations

UPOV	Union pour la Protection des Obtentions Végétales; Convention for the Protection of New Varieties of Plants.
WIPO	World Intellectual Property Organization
WTO	World Trade Organization