



BEUCITIZEN
BARRIERS TOWARDS EU CITIZENSHIP

Towards Impact Assessment indicators for EU citizenship

Document Identifier

D 11.2 Towards Impact Assessment indicators for EU citizenship

Version

1.0

Date Due

31.12.2015

Submission date

07.10.2016

WorkPackage

11

Lead Beneficiary

Universiteit Utrecht

Dissemination Level

PU





Change log

Version	Date	amended by	changes
1.0	04.10.2016	Marlot van der Kolk	Sent to the coordinator to be submitted.

Partners involved

number	partner name	People involved
1	UU	Wieger Bakker and Marlot van der Kolk



Table of Contents

1. Introduction.....	4
2. Outcomes bEUcitizen project (so far)	4
2.1 Variation in status and EU citizenship: the link approach.....	5
2.2 Bureaucracy.....	5
2.3 Vulnerable groups	5
2.4 Vulnerable countries and regions	6
2.5 Variation in national regulation and EU citizenship.....	6
2.6 Identity and EU community participation	7
3. Development of indicators.....	7
References.....	9
Annex I: List of the deliverables and their subjects/topics	11
Annex II: European citizenship rights*	16
Annex III: Content indicators for EU citizenship impacts	17



1. Introduction

Tools and frameworks for executing impact assessments are useful to provide policy and decision makers with knowledge and guidance. This might help in identifying possible barriers – but also opportunities – for exercising European Union citizenship. Impact assessment is the systematic ex-ante evaluation of the likely or possible consequences of policies, project, programs and other forms of regulation. The existing Impact Assessment guideline in *'Better Regulation guidelines'* (European Commission, 2015) focus on economic, social and environmental impacts. EU citizenship impacts need to be added to this list to overcome barriers for EU citizenship.

Therefore, in the working paper (D11.1) *'Assessing policy implications for EU citizenship'* (Bakker et al., 2016) options for an impact assessment framework for EU citizenship are explored. In the paper favorable impact assessment approaches are identified even as elements that should be included in the framework and what requirements the framework should meet. However, before to establish an impact assessment framework for EU citizenship, it is necessary to develop indicators to assess EU citizenship. These indicators need to be formulated based on existing (impact assessment) guidelines and documents and based on outcomes of the bEUcitizen project so far. Therefore, we analysed all the deliverables of the bEUcitizen project so far to determine whether attention needs to be paid to specific topics in an impact assessment framework for EU citizenship. Annex I shows an overview of the analyzed deliverables and their topics. In this report, we sketch an overview of the most remarkable topics from the deliverables. This leads towards impact assessment indicators for EU citizenship, which will be the starting point for the Impact Assessment tool for policymakers on the European and the national level (deliverable 11.3).

2. Outcomes bEUcitizen project (so far)

In the working paper (D11.1) *'Assessing policy implications for EU citizenship'* (Bakker et al., 2016) two distinct dimensions of European citizenship are identified. The first dimension is that of citizenship as a legal status. This refers to a specific set of civil, political, social and economic rights each citizen of an EU Member State has *in addition* to his or her national citizenship rights. The second dimension of EU citizenship is about the identification with and active membership of an European political community. The focus of the bEUcitizen project mainly is on the 'rights' dimension of EU citizenship. Bakker et al. (2016) located EU citizenship rights in different categories (civil rights, political rights, social rights and economic rights) based on several treaties. For an overview of EU citizenship rights and their categorization, see Annex II. Some of these rights are highlighted in the deliverables of the bEUcitizen project: intellectual property rights¹, right to access to justice², right to freedom of movement³, the right to access to travel documents⁴ and specific social rights as the right

¹ See: D5.5

² See: D7.2

³ See: D7.3

⁴ See: D7.6



to health care and the right to social security and assistance⁵. These rights are noticed by the bEUcitizen researchers as either important or at risk in exercising EU citizenship.

To develop indicators for an EU citizenship impact assessment, we focused on the outcomes of deliverables of Work Packages 5 till 10, i.e. cluster two and cluster three of the bEUcitizen project. We identified six remarkable topics from the deliverables, namely (1) variation in status and EU citizenship: the link approach, (2) bureaucracy, (3) vulnerable groups, (4) vulnerable countries and regions, (5) variation in national regulation and EU citizenship, and (6) identity and EU community participation. In the next sections these topics are further explained.

2.1 Variation in status and EU citizenship: the link approach

In the deliverables from different Work Packages, there are references to the so-called link approach or the marketization of citizenship. This means that a persons' access to rights depends on meeting requirements and/or conditions, such as residency requirements, registration requirements, the labour market position or the market status of the individual.⁶ Individuals are, for instance, required to demonstrate their value and independence in relation to the market as a condition of citizenship. Evidence for market-based 'self-sufficiency' requires a minimum level of economic/income resources for access to rights and benefits. This indirectly excludes those who are not in paid work or are in low-paid and less secure work.⁷ Requirements on, for example residency, are also undesirable. Residence is defined by being registered in a registry. The conditions that apply for a registration in a registry, such as having a postal address, is problematic, because for some people it may be extremely difficult to meet these conditions.⁸ When people cannot meet the requirements, they have no or limited access to rights and benefits.

2.2 Bureaucracy

Research results show that bureaucratic inefficiency is a barrier for citizens to exercise their EU citizenship effectively. Extra-procedural hindrances are a reality and they create barriers especially problematic to mobile EU-citizens, but also to EU-citizens living in their native countries. People can be hindered by, for instance, procedural costs.⁹ Research also shows that administrative burdens in regard to the access to travel documents can be a threshold, especially in the case of applications to the benefit of minors that are foreign-born. The original birth certificate has to be produced, accompanied by an authenticated translation. The issuance of this birth certificate, necessary to proceed with the application for an ID card or a passport to the authorities of the state of nationality, may take some time. Such delays pose hindrances for the child's and her parents' ability to travel for a few month after the child's birth.¹⁰ These are examples of concrete and existing barriers to a well-functioning of EU citizenship.

2.3 Vulnerable groups

⁵ See: D6.1 and D6.2

⁶ See: D6.1, D6.2, D9.6, D10.1 and D10.3

⁷ See: D10.1

⁸ See: D6.2

⁹ See: D6.4

¹⁰ See: D7.6



In the deliverables from the Work Packages, different groups are identified as vulnerable in their access to and in exercising EU citizenship:

- EU migrant citizens¹¹;
- Mobile EU citizens¹²;
- Asylum seekers¹³;
- Economically inactive EU citizens¹⁴;
- Socially weak citizens¹⁵;
- Low educated/unqualified workers¹⁶;
- Women (especially migrant women)¹⁷;
- Youth¹⁸;
- Elderly¹⁹;
- Roma²⁰.

Outcomes of the bEUcitizen project show that these groups are vulnerable. For example, in EU Member States hierarchies of entry are dependent upon citizenship status, wealth or skills. There is an evident move towards a knowledge-based economy and attracting the 'brightest and the best' across the EU. This results in restricted access for family migration and lower skilled workers.²¹ Also, socially weak EU-citizens are over presented in the group of non-voters. This group is outside the political system and do not exercise their political rights.²²

2.4 Vulnerable countries and regions

Most studies complement case studies of specific countries and pay attention to different countries and regions. The studies are context-specific, which makes generally conclusions about vulnerable countries and/or regions more difficult. However, the studies show that policy impacts may vary from country to country and from region to region.²³ For instance, in countries as Estonia, Poland and Spain the overall access to social assistance is limited to residents of these countries and therefore also of no great practical relevance for EU migrants citizens.²⁴ Therefore, it is important to pay attention to the impact of policy options in different countries and the (un)even effects for specific Member States or regions.

2.5 Variation in national regulation and EU citizenship

¹¹ See: D6.1

¹² See: D6.4 and D7.6

¹³ See: D10.2 and D10.3

¹⁴ See: D6.2 and D7.6

¹⁵ See: D8.6

¹⁶ See: D9.6 and D10.1

¹⁷ See D9.1 and D9.5

¹⁸ See: D9.1

¹⁹ See: D9.1

²⁰ See: D10.1

²¹ See: D10.1

²² See: D8.6

²³ See: D6.1, D6.2, D7.1, D7.2, D7.3, D9.8, D10.1 and D10.3

²⁴ See: D6.1



The research results show that EU and national laws and regulation play an important role in exercising EU citizenship. The EU citizen can be defined as composite in nature, as a subject of law at the crossroads of national and EU law. This brings the (legal) interplay between the citizen and the various layers or parts of national or EU government to the foreground. The EU citizen enjoys sometimes (1) direct protection by virtue of Union law (e.g. the principle of free movement), (2) protection by national law implementing Union law (i.e. directives), and (3) protection by virtue of national legislation without any European dimension. Thus, he or she has certain core rights based on EU law because he or she is an EU citizen, but for the substance of that right he or she is mostly dependent on the substantive national laws of the Member States in which he or she resides.²⁵ Therefore, the existing differences between legal systems of various Member States can create obstacles.²⁶

2.6 Identity and EU community participation

When the Treaty of Maastricht (1992) introduced EU citizenship, the two dimensions of citizenship were considered to be related. One of the main assumptions was that granting European civilians the legal status of EU citizen would result in a feeling of belonging to a shared European community and identity; a causal relation was presumed.²⁷ However, empirical evidence suggest that, in European context, such a relationship is not present and the launching of EU citizenship and the development of an European identity are not directly related.²⁸ This insight calls for an approach that examines both the impact on identify formation and the functioning of a political community as well as the impact on barriers and opportunities to exercise rights and duties. That is why it is remarkable that the focus of the bEUcitizen project is on the 'right' dimension and only minimal attention is paid to the 'community' dimension of EU citizenship.

Although not much attention is paid to the 'community' dimension of EU citizenship, Work Package 8 did pay attention to political participation of citizens, i.e. to the exercise of political rights. One of their conclusions is that socially weak EU-citizens are over presented in the group of non-voters. This group is outside the political system and do not exercise their political rights.²⁹ When socially weak EU-citizens do not participate in the political community, it is questionable if they participate in other fields of the European community, such as cross-border activities and moving to another country. Therefore, it is important to also pay attention to the 'community' dimension in the development of indicators for EU citizenship.

3. Development of indicators

The insights from the bEUcitizen project help us to develop indicators for an EU citizenship impact assessment tool. These insights are in line with the findings in the working paper (D11.1) '*Assessing policy implications for EU citizenship*' (Bakker et al., 2016). The existing Impact Assessment

²⁵ See: D7.3

²⁶ See: D7.6

²⁷ See: D11.1

²⁸ See: Dell'Olio, F. (2005). *The Europeanization of citizenship – Between the ideology of Nationality, Immigration and European identity*. Hants: Ashgate Publishing Limited.

²⁹ See: D8.6



guideline focus on economic, social and environmental impacts. EU citizenship impacts need to be added to this list. The EU citizenship rights (see Annex II) are overlapping and connected with the rights that are assessed in the existing impact assessment guideline: the types of impacts of the policy options are connected and overlapping with economic and environmental impacts, and, in particular, with social impacts. For example, the *Guidance for assessing Social Impacts within the Commission Impact assessment system*³⁰ addresses parts of the social citizenship rights which are connected and overlapping with EU citizenship rights, i.e. with citizenship as a legal status. Therefore, some indicators from the existing guideline can be adopted. This will make the revised impact assessment tool (D11.3) in line with the existing impact assessment tool to make it practical and workable for the Commission.

However, to assess both dimensions of EU citizenship, existing indicators need to be adopted and extended, but also new indicators need to be added. We add specific indicators that focus on the 'community' dimension of EU citizenship. Although there is not much attention paid to the 'community' dimension in the Work Packages, in developing indicators for an EU citizenship impact assessment the insight from earlier research will be taken into account. This leads towards the following Impact Assessment indicators for EU citizenship:

1. Equality of treatment and opportunities, non-discrimination;
2. Access to and effects on social protection and security, health and education;
3. Security and justice;
4. Employment, labour market and job quality;
5. Freedom of movement;
6. Political participation;
7. Identity and EU community participation;
8. Inclusion and protection of particular groups, countries and/or regions.

Each indicator entails EU citizenship rights (see Annex II), pays attention to the 'community' dimension of EU citizenship and include insights of the bEUcitizen project.³¹ For instance, the indicator 'Political participation' entails rights as the right to vote and the right to stand as a candidate at EP elections and municipal elections and the right to petition. The indicator 'Inclusion and protection of particular groups, countries and/or regions' focuses on identified vulnerable groups and differences between Member States, but also entails the right of the child and the right of the elderly.

The series of indicators and the insights of the bEUcitizen project provide a solid basis for the Impact Assessment tool for policymakers on the European and the national level (deliverable 11.3).

³⁰ See: European Commission (2009). *Guidance for assessing Social Impacts within the Commission Impact assessment system*. Brussels.

³¹ See Annex III for the list of indicators and their content.



References

Anderson, B., Shutes, I. and Walker, S. (2014). *D10.1 Report on the rights and obligations of citizens and non-citizens in selected countries*. Available from <http://beucitizen.eu/publications/report-on-the-rights-and-obligations-of-citizens-and-non-citizens-in-selected-countries/>

Anderson, B., Shutes, I. and Walker, S. (2015). *D10.2 The 'migrant' in data: report on analysis of national and European datasets on employment, inactivity and unemployment rates, and benefits uptake by specific groups*. Available from <http://beucitizen.eu/publications/report-on-analysis-of-european-datasets-on-employment-inactivity-and-unemployment-rates-d10-2/>

Anderson, B., Shutes, I., Walker, S., Gal, J., Alfasi-Hanley, M., Keidar, E., Murphy, K., Baričević, V., Lepianka, D. and Ramos Martin, N.E. (2016). *D10.3 Citizenship and Work: Case Studies of Differential Inclusion/Exclusion*. Available from <http://beucitizen.eu/>

Bakker, W.E., De Krijger, F., Koska, V. and Puetter, U. (2016). *D11.1 Assessing policy implications for EU citizenship: Exploring options for an impact assessment framework*. Available from <http://beucitizen.eu/publications/working-paper-on-assessing-policy-implications-for-eu-citizenship-deliverable-11-1/>

De Waele, H. (2016). *D7.6 Access to travel documents*. Available from <http://beucitizen.eu/>

Dell'Olio, F. (2005). *The Europeanization of citizenship – Between the ideology of Nationality, Immigration and European identity*. Hants: Ashgate Publishing Limited.

European Commission (2009). *Guidance for assessing Social Impacts within the Commission Impact Assessment system*. Brussels.

European Commission (2015). *Better Regulation guidelines – Commission staff working document*. Strasbourg.

Gaus, D. and Seubert, S. (2016). *D8.6 Report on voter turnout for the European Parliament and Political Equality in the EU*. Available from <http://beucitizen.eu/>

Granger, M., Salat, O. and De Vries, S. (2016). *D7.2 Mechanisms transposing and enforcing civil rights aiming at identifying barriers that EU citizens and third-country nationals face* <http://beucitizen.eu/publications/mechanisms-transposing-and-enforcing-civil-rightsaiming-at-identifying-barriers-that-eu-citizens-and-third-country-nationals-face/>

Guarda, P. (2016). *D5.5 Research paper on Case Study (iii): "Barriers that citizens face regarding their intellectual property rights"*. Available from <http://beucitizen.eu/>



Knijn, T., Yerkes, M. and Šipic, J. (2014). *D9.1 A Report on the transposition of EU guidelines and directives in the most recent 27 National Reform Programme*. Available from http://beucitizen.eu/wp-content/uploads/Deliverable-9.1_report-NRPs.pdf

Luppi, M., Oomkens, R., Knijn, T. and Weicht, B. (2015). *D9.6 Citizenship in the context of migrant care work: regimes, rights & recognition*. Available from http://beucitizen.eu/wpcontent/uploads/Deliverable_9.6_final1.pdf

Naldini, M. and Long, J. (2016). *D9.8 Geographies of Families in the European Union: A Legal and Social Policy Analysis*. Available from: http://beucitizen.eu/wp-content/uploads/D9.8_FINAL.pdf

Pennings, F. et al. (2016). *D6.2 EU Citizenship and Social Rights, a Comparative Report*. Available from <http://beucitizen.eu/wp-content/uploads/D6.2-Report-on-the-transposition-of-the-relevant-EU-instruments-in-the-Member-States.pdf>

Rolandsen Agustín, L. and Nissen, A. (2015). *D9.5 Positions and opinions of political groups in the European Parliament and European social movements on civil, political and social rights for women, migrants and minorities*. Available from <http://beucitizen.eu/>

Seeleib-Kaiser, M. and Chase, E. (2015) *D6.1 Research paper on categorization of social welfare benefits with respect to the factors hindering access by other EU nationals and third country nationals*. Available from <http://beucitizen.eu/publications/social-rights-of-eu-migrant-citizens-a-comparative-perspective>

Van Eijken, H. and De Vries, S. (2015). *D7.1 Research paper on the legal framework for civil rights protection in national and international context*. Available from: http://beucitizen.eu/wp-content/uploads/Deliverable-7.1_final.pdf

Research paper on the legal framework for civil rights protection in national and international context
Authors: Hanneke van Eijken and Sybe de Vries

Van Eijken, H. and Phoa, P. (2016). *D7.3 Exploring obstacles in exercising core EU citizenship rights*. Available from www.beucitizen.eu



Annex I: List of the deliverables and their subjects/topics

Cluster Two: The Multi-Dimensionality of Rights. The Horizontal Approach

WP05 Economic rights

D5.1	Research paper on the categorization of economic rights	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Identifying economic rights in the Member States - Fragmentation of rights
D5.2	The implementation of economic rights in three areas in seven Member States	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Difficulties differ - Access of economic actors to the markets - The protection of economic rights of consumers - The protection of citizens' rights in the digital era
D5.3	Research paper on Case Study (i): "The barriers that professionals face in gaining access to the services market"	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Expected end of May 2016
D5.4	Research paper on Case Study (ii): The capacity of the consumer to process information and make informed choices	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Expected end of May 2016
D5.5	Research paper on case study: Barriers that citizens face regarding their intellectual property rights	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Intellectual property rights - Existence of barriers to online activities prevent citizens from taking advantage of wider range of goods and services - Legal and factual barriers - Difference at the implementation level in the Member States are an obstacle

WP06 Social rights

D6.1	Social Rights of EU Migrant Citizens: A Comparative Perspective	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Vulnerable group: EU migrant citizens - Access depends on meeting residency and/or registration requirements and on the propensity of individual Member States to implement rules limiting access of these rights for EU migrant citizens - Barriers for EU migrant citizens: exploitation, living and working under inhumane conditions, violate human dignity, no decent and affordable housing
D6.2	EU Citizenship and Social Rights, a Comparative Report	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Vulnerable group: non-economically active persons - Link approach
D6.3	The Social Construction of Social Rights across Europe	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Sober view of the potential of European Social Citizenship - Conceptual uncertainty - Ideological diversity - Conception of citizenship across Europe is increasingly liberal/individualistic



D6.4	A Legal Analysis of the Possibilities and Impediments for Citizens Seeking to Enforce their Social Rights	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Vulnerable group: mobile EU citizens - If rights are provided and if redress is offered, there is no formal hindrance that discriminates against mobile EU-citizens - Extra-procedural hindrances
------	---	---

WP07 Civil rights

D7.1	Research paper on the legal framework for civil rights protection in national and international context	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Domestic, international and EU similar set of civil rights - Difference in how rights are upheld - In most countries, a number of public and private organisations contribute to raising awareness about civil rights, and work to support their recognition, development, respect, and promotion
D7.2	Report on mechanisms transposing and enforcing civil rights aiming at identifying barriers that EU citizens and third-country nationals face in gaining (cross-border) access to justice in selected EU Member States	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Civil rights standards are in general satisfactory - Some barriers arise from the narrow scope of protection afforded to certain rights in some of the Member States, with the result that EU citizens, depending on where they live, are not equally protected - Source of protection has in some cases a direct impact on the enforcement of the right - Interpretation of rights
D7.3	Exploring obstacles in exercising core EU citizenship rights	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Citizens most dependent on national law - Freedom to move, equal treatment - Vulnerable group: economically inactive EU citizen
D7.4	Report on case study (ii): Difficulties faced by EU citizens when trying to enjoy the freedom of expression	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Expected June 2016
D7.5	Case study life events of EU citizens WP7 civil rights	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Parentage - Forenames/surnames - Marriage - Life events and registries
D7.6	Case study Access to travel documents	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Vulnerable group: mobile citizen, such as a foreign born - Administrative burden - Differences between legal systems of the Member States can create obstacles for mobile citizens

WP08 Political rights

D8.1	Report 'Constraints imposed by financial markets on political choice in the EU'	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Financial market developments do not automatically turn into political responses, rather they require an interpretation from a transnational technocratic elite which is capable of addressing policy challenges of unprecedented complexity and sensitivity
------	---	--



		- Multi-level and decentralized economic governance structure has repercussion for the expected pattern of political decision-making
D8.2	Report: 'Tensions between the Past Political Choice for Free Competition and the Present and Future Choice for Sustainability'	- Expected July/Augustus 2016
D8.3	Report: "Public regulation through private litigation. Consequences for political choice"	- Whether and how does the policy of regulation by litigation influence the political choice options - Reliable data is vital for effective policy reforms - Consumer rights have opened up space for private litigation in Member States - Consumer organisations that are entitled to sue should be part of permanent consultation processes
D8.4	National parliaments as collective actor of European citizenship	- European Ombudsman - Future role of national parliaments as a collective actor in EU
D8.5	Democratic parliamentary control in times of crisis	- The euro crisis posed no threat to the formal validity of core citizenship rights - Variations in countries in relation to each country setting - Right to vote, the right to participation and the right to information
D8.6	Report on voter turnout for the European Parliament and Political Equality in the EU	- Low turnout elections creates political inequality among citizens - Non- voter: socially weak citizen - Political inequality is related to the EU's current institutional architecture - Imbalance between a representation of citizens and a representation of states - Social inequality in voting
D8.7	European Union and Direct Democracy: A Possible Combination?	- Favour direct participation of EU citizens in decision-making at the European level - European referendum
D8.8	Taking stock of the European Citizens Initiative: Current dynamics and possible institutional trajectories	- European Citizens Initiative (ECI) - Problems related to throughput legitimacy could be resolved - There is still ample scope for awareness of the instrument to increase - Indirect effects of the ECI
D8.9	Report 'Experiences with European Ombudsman'	- Expected unknown
D8.10	Report 'EU Citizenship and Education for a Civic Culture'	- Expected June 2016
D8.11	Options for new Forms of Participation in the EU. A comparative study of EU's financial regulation	- The ideal financial citizen - Confident, empowered and active citizen and at the same time a vulnerable citizen



Cluster Three: The Multitudinous Effects of Rights on Different Categories of Citizens: The Vertical Approach

WP09 Balancing Gender and Generational Citizenship

D9.1	A Report on the transposition of EU guidelines and directives in the most recent 27 National Reform Programmes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Care for the elderly - Non-national care workers - Reproductive rights men and women
D9.2	Report of the gender and intergenerational analysis of reports 6.1 and 6.2, supplemented by four country reports (Croatia, Hungary, Israel and Italy)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Expected September 2017
D9.3	Report of an integrative seminar on the findings of WP5-8	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Expected end of September 2016
D9.4	Attitudes of national populations towards social and civil rights for family members and the role of the EU in converging these rights: A cross-national pilot study	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Existing cross-national data is limited - Polarization between countries that appear more traditional and less traditional in terms of the convergence of rights between heterosexual and homosexual couples - Difference within each country; there appears to be greater acceptance of equality in social rather than civil rights - Need of understanding citizens' attitude
D9.5	Positions and opinions of political groups in the European Parliament and European social movements on civil, political and social rights for women, migrants and minorities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Freedom of movement for young women, migration and elderly care - Role of women is very differently across the policy areas - Vulnerable group: women, especially third country national migrant women
D9.6	Citizenship in the context of migrant care work	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Relation right to receive care and migrant care work: restricted access for unqualified workers from third countries and highly skilled workers have privileged access - Access depends on labour market position and residence status
D9.7	Report of case studies on gender equality as a focus point of national and nativist discourses	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Strengthening of right wing parties across EU is challenging for free mobility, non-discrimination of nationalities, ethnicity and region
D9.8	Geographies of Families in the European Union: A Legal and Social Policy Analysis	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Role of EU citizenship in the recognition of the portability of family statuses and the circulation of family patterns - Right to respect for family life - National variations

WP10 Balancing Citizenship of 'Insiders' and 'Outsiders'

D10.1	Report on the rights and obligations of citizens and non-citizens in selected countries	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Access to state territory (mobility) - Access to citizenship (naturalisation) - Access to social security
-------	---	---



		<ul style="list-style-type: none">- Vulnerable group: Roma- Marketization of citizenship: investor/highly skilled have privileged access, restricted access for non-citizens and access dependent on individual's relationship to the labour market- Citizenship is shaped by cultural as well as market based logic: citizenship as privilege that is granted to non-citizens who can demonstrate that they conform to a particular normative order of the nation
D10.2	The 'migrant' in data: Report on analysis of national and European datasets on employment, inactivity and unemployment rates, and benefits uptake by specific groups	<ul style="list-style-type: none">- How migrants are captured in data- Data on asylum seekers is hypervisibilised
D10.3	Citizenship and Work: Case Studies of Differential Inclusion/Exclusion	<ul style="list-style-type: none">- Work as tenuous basis for inclusion of EU and non-EU citizens- Exclusion from labour market of asylum seekers may have effect on long term exclusion- Vulnerable group: asylum seekers



Annex II: European citizenship rights*

Civil rights	Art. N.	Political rights	Art. N.	Social rights	Art. N.	Economic rights	Art. N.
Human dignity	Art. 1	Right to liberty and security	Art. 6	Right to education	Art. 14	Freedom to choose an occupation and right to engage in work	Art. 15
Rights to life	Art. 2	Respect for private and family life	Art. 7	The rights of the Child	Art. 24	Freedom to conduct a business	Art. 16
Right to the integrity of the person	Art. 3	Protection of personal data	Art. 8	The right of the elderly	Art. 25	Right to property	Art. 17
Prohibition of torture and inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment	Art. 4	Freedom of thought, conscience and religion	Art. 10	Integration of person with disabilities	Art. 26	Workers right to information and consultation within the undertaking	Art. 27
Prohibition of slavery and forced labour	Art. 5	Freedom of expression and information	Art. 11	Family and Professional life	Art. 33	Right of collective bargaining and action	Art. 28
Right to marry and right to found a family	Art. 9	Freedom of assembly and of association	Art. 12	Social security and Social assistance	Art. 34	Right of access to placement service	Art. 29
Equality before the law	Art. 20	Freedom of the arts and sciences	Art. 13	Health care	Art. 35	Protection in the event of unjustified dismissal	Art. 30
Non-discrimination	Art. 21	Right to Asylum	Art. 18	Environment protection	Art. 37	Fair and Just working conditions	Art. 31
Equality between women and men	Art. 23	Protection in the event of removal, expulsion or extradition	Art. 19			Prohibition of child labour and protection of Young people at work	Art. 32
		Cultural, religious and linguistic diversity	Art. 22			Access to services of general economic interest	Art. 36
		Right to vote and to stand as a candidate at EP elections	Art. 39			Consumer protection	Art. 38
		Right to vote and to stand as a candidate at municipal elections	Art. 40			Free movement of goods**	Art.28, 29
		Right to good EU administration	Art. 41			Free movement of capital**	Art.63
		Right of access to documents	Art. 42			Free movement of services**	Art. 56 to 62
		European Ombudsman	Art. 43				
		Right to petition	Art. 44				
		Freedom of movement and of residence	Art. 45				
		Diplomatic and consular protection	Art. 46				
		Right to an effective remedy and to a fair trial	Art. 47				
		Presumption of innocence and rights of defense	Art. 48				
		Principles of legality and proportionality of criminal offences and penalties	Art. 49				
		Right not to be tried or punished twice in criminal proceedings for the same criminal offence	Art. 50				

* Legal basis articles: CFREU; Classical distinction by Marshall, 1950; Economic rights are added

** Other legal basis: TFEU

Corresponds with articles EVRM

Corresponds with articles EVRM (widerscope)

EU citizen rights that complement national citizen rights



Annex III: Content indicators for EU citizenship impacts

The existing impact assessment tools addresses rights which are connected and overlapping with EU citizenship rights, i.e. with citizenship as a legal status. Therefore, some indicators from the existing guideline are adopted. However, to assess both dimensions of EU citizenship, existing indicators need to be adopted and extended, but also new indicators need to be added. We add specific indicators that focus on the 'community' dimension of EU citizenship. Each indicator entails EU citizenship rights (see Annex II), pays attention to the 'community' dimension of EU citizenship and include insights of the bEUcitizen project.

1. Equality of treatment and opportunities, non-discrimination

- Human dignity – civil right
- Rights to life – civil right
- Right to integrity of the person – civil right
- Prohibition of torture and inhuman or degrading treatment or punishment – civil right
- Prohibition of slavery and forced labour – civil right
- Right to marry and right to found a family – civil right
- Equality before law – civil right
- Non-discrimination – civil right
- Equality between women and men – civil right
- Freedom of thought, conscience and religion – political right
- Freedom of expression and information – political right
- Freedom of the arts and sciences – political right
- Family and professional life – social right

2. Access to and effects on social protection and security, health and education

- Right to education – social right
- Integration of person with disabilities – social right
- Social security and social assistance – social right
- Health care – social right
- Environment protection – social right

3. Security and justice

- Protection in the event of removal, expulsion or extradition – political right
- Protection of personal data – political right
- Right to an effective remedy and to a fair trial – political right
- Presumption of innocence and rights of defence – political right
- Principles of legality and proportionality of criminal offences and penalties – political right
- Right not to be tried or punished twice in criminal proceedings for the same criminal offense – political right
- Environmental protection – social right
- Right to liberty and security – political right
- Right to property – economic right



4. Employment, labour market and job quality

- Freedom to choose an occupation – economic right
- Freedom to conduct a business – economic right
- Workers right to information and consultation within the undertaking – economic right
- Right of collective bargaining and action – economic right
- Right to access to placement service – economic right
- Protection in the event of unjustified dismissal – economic right
- Fair and just working conditions – economic right
- Prohibition of child labour and protection of young people at work – economic right
- Access to services of general economic interest – economic right
- Consumer protection – economic right

5. Freedom of movement

- Right to Asylum – political right
- Freedom of movement and of residence – political right
- Free movement of goods – economic right
- Free movement of capital – economic right
- Free movement of services – economic right

6. Political participation

- Right to vote and to stand as a candidate at EP elections – political rights
- Right to vote and to stand as a candidate at municipal elections – political rights
- Diplomatic and consular protection – political right
- European Ombudsman – political right
- Right to petition – political right
- Right of access to documents – political right
- Freedom of assembly and of association – political right

7. Identity and EU community participation

- Identification as European
- Expressment of involvement in the development and functioning of the EU
- Active engagement in realizing rights
- Involvement in cross border contacts
- Political participation (voting, standing for elections, taking part in citizen initiatives)
- Active relation or passive orientation on the European public sphere

8. Inclusion and protection of particular groups, countries and/or regions

- Inclusion or exclusion of vulnerable groups: EU migrant citizens, mobile EU citizens, Asylum seekers, economically inactive EU citizens, socially weak citizens, low educated/unqualified workers, women, youth, elderly and Roma
- The rights of the Child – social right
- The right of the elderly – social right
- Inclusion or exclusion of countries and/or regions
- Differences between Member States