

*Religion and Gender*, vol. 2, no. 2 (2012), pp. 352-355

[www.religionandgender.org](http://www.religionandgender.org)

URN:NBN:NL:UI:10-1-101608

ISSN: 1878-5417

Publisher: Igitur Publishing (Utrecht)

Copyright: this work is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution License (3.0)

**Review of Patricia Madigan, *Women and Fundamentalism in Islam and Catholicism: Negotiating Modernity in a Globalized World*, Bern: Peter Lang Publishing 2011, 338 pages, ISBN 978-3-0343-0276-0.**

BY KEVIN BURKE, UNIVERSITY OF NOTRE DAME

Patricia Madigan's *Women and Fundamentalism in Islam and Catholicism: Negotiating Modernity in a Globalized World* seeks to broaden the scope, and provide a critique of, prior work on the development and expansion of fundamentalist religious practice in contemporary societies. In doing so she notes that although 'there has been an explosion of academic study of fundamentalism' (p 3), the field remains ripe for increased depth in the examination of how gender, politico-economic and interfaith perspectives can be brought to bear in the creation of new scholarship. It is vital for the reader to recall, Madigan cautions, that analysis of fundamentalist religious practice must include an examination of how 'global political and economic issues ... underpin it' (p 3). The book is a welcome and well-versed historical account of the wrong turns of religious interpretation in relation to gender in two major systems of belief. But it is more broadly an assertion of the ways in which 'religious fundamentalism' must be 'understood as a politics of identity, which aims to maintain a patriarchal political, economic, and social order threatened by the impact of modernity' (p 27).

The book is divided into six chapters, but really separates into three distinct sections. The first two and most robust sections are aimed at fleshing out the troubling blind spots in prior research on traditionalist religion as well as an historical analysis of majoritarian (and problematic) theological interpretations of women's roles in Catholicism and Islam. Madigan's work here is done well and fluidly. The third section, a synopsis of survey research on an 'interfaith dialogue between Australian Muslim and Catholic women' (p 278) is presumably an attempt to put into practice some of the reconstructionist feminist theological tenets fleshed out earlier in the volume.

The beginning three chapters of the volume do well in establishing three essential tenets for the historico-analytical research. 1) Although *The Fundamentalism Project* (1991-1995) edited by Martin Marty and R. Scott Appleby contributes to a modern understanding of the development of fundamentalist religious sentiment and practice, it largely ignores 'the profoundly patriarchal character of fundamentalism' (p 19), while also failing to address 2) systematic analysis of the rise in fundamentalism 'aimed at shoring up the church's hierarchical and patriarchal power structures' (p 90). That is, although there is some discussion of Catholic conservatism it is otherwise termed 'traditionalism', a much less fraught term. This shift in terminology ultimately serves to blunt the often devastating impact of a religio-political entity in the form of Rome and its Curia which has increasingly moved away from the reforms of Vatican II in favour of a strand of political theology that trades in Marian worship and contraception battles. Madigan's examination of the rise of Islamic fundamentalism, in turn, centres on a need for 3) a 'hierarchy of explanations' (p 68) that takes into account the ways in which Western colonial rhetoric that links Islam with radicalism ignores the role that neoliberal economic policies have played in undermining the lived possibilities of exploited masses of people.

From there, Madigan pivots to an analysis of the role of economics through the lens of gender in a critique of global patriarchal capitalism or neo-patriarchy. She works a dual analysis of the historical seeds of 'a radical social and sexual egalitarianism' (p 164) through the prism of a feminist reconstruction of theology in both Catholicism and Islam. In this light she examines the ways in which Sunni Islam and Catholic Christianity have fostered the rise of 'patriarchal resistance to cultural modernity' (p 180). Here women 'by their very nature find themselves opposed by the combined forces of religious fundamentalism and patriarchal capitalism' (p 180). Selective and fundamentalist readings of sacred texts are thus

rendered as tools in service of ongoing gender dominance held in place by a matrix of religious and economic interests aimed at maintaining a status quo. But of course, there must be hope. And here Madigan uses her fifth chapter to elucidate modes of resistance while carefully maintaining the 'multiplicity of difference' (p 217) in which contexts and belief systems will vary and matter to the lives of women. For example, although feminist interpretations of religious texts are often useful for rebutting fundamentalist Catholic theological claims, the term feminism is often seen, by Muslim scholars, as a Western concept imposed upon Islamic society. Whatever the name of the approach, however, the main focus remains for Madigan a critical analysis of who, in the name of religion, 'is doing the defining and who is benefiting from the very unequal division of power' (p 233) wrought through an unholy alliance of economic, political and theological mistruths.

At this point, to close the book, Madigan turns to an interfaith dialogue. The interview data are, one must say, not problematic of themselves. Indeed there is much to be recommended in work that brings diverse subjects, and women particularly, together. This serves both to humanize the assumed and caricatured 'other' of a strange and exotic religion, but also to create a space for the critique of troubling gender norms imposed in similar ways by different religions. Madigan deftly shows that these institutions are much concerned with concealing how 'critical issues' of religious importance (invented or otherwise) become battles inscribed on and read through the bodies of women (p 226). No, the trouble with the interview data is rather in the framing of methods and methodology in that there is a bit of the former and none of the latter. This seems particularly odd since Madigan is, from the initial phases of the text, very insightful about how context, positionality and subjectivities variously develop into politically powerful modes of interpretation when applied to the reading of religion in, on and through gender. That she fails to root her empirical research in a specific tradition of interviewing and analysis feels like a missed opportunity. The voices at the end of the book remain largely undertheorized and thus are rendered much less authoritative than the literature cited (from both women and men) in the historical and politico-economic portions of the text. They become additive rather than integral. And although Madigan suggests that the interviews 'provide insight into the global issues raised' by the study as a whole (p 305), much more could have been done through a thorough discussion of theories of voice and representation in qualitative research. What, for instance, may be assumed about what gets included and, perhaps, misheard in a gathering of women

(both religiously avowed and otherwise) when the interviewer is a Dominican nun? For now we can only assume because Madigan chooses to mystify her methodologies and the position of her own interviewing self in the situating of the data. In the process, the development of an ethos of situated religious interviewing, perhaps, is missed.

The work, on the whole, is to be recommended for its timeliness as much as for its content. Coming on the heels of the uprisings of the Arab spring and in the midst of the Catholic Church's very public fight with the Obama administration regarding health care and contraception, the text provides a well-considered historical and theological frame for understanding just what role gender has, and might and should play in the development of new representative governments and more humanely considered stances on the lives of women.