

1 INTRODUCTION

1.1 STATEMENT OF THE PROBLEM

This study considers the theology of the Argentinean Methodist José Míguez Bonino¹ as a missionary theology. The key to his missionary theology is ‘Faith Seeking Effectiveness’. Obviously an adaptation of Anselm’s famous axiom, this phrase is the title of the Spanish translation of one of Míguez Bonino’s most famous books: *Doing Theology in an Revolutionary Situation* (1975b). This book is an early description, defence, and critique of the Latin American theologies of liberation. When it was originally published in English, Míguez Bonino disliked the title given to it by the publisher (interview with author 1997). When he translated the book back into Spanish he gave it the title *Fe en busca de eficacia* (1977a)². This phrase expresses Míguez Bonino’s comprehension of Liberation Theology’s self-understanding. It is also the way this study intends to survey and analyse his theology.

Míguez Bonino’s theology is missionary, not because mission is the focus of his theology but rather because it is its locus. That is, his theology takes as its point of departure the ethical and missionary question: ‘what should I as a Christian or we as a Church do?’ or more specifically: ‘what should I as a Christian or we as a Church do in this context?’ He does not aim to achieve intellectual understanding of reality, but rather effectiveness in changing reality. This provides the framework for the whole of Míguez Bonino’s theology.

Effectiveness in faith’s search, however, must not be equated with pragmatism. Míguez Bonino’s theology does not simply search for the most expedient way of carrying forward an already decided project. In the light of the concrete reality in which the Church finds itself, it reflects theologically in order to project forward into new pathways of praxis. His theological reflection has revolved around three central theological issues: the Kingdom of God, the church, and the Trinity. The Kingdom of God and the Church have been the two major issues which he utilised throughout his ministry, but in later years, he attempted to deepen and strengthen these items by a reflection upon the Trinity. A Trinitarian perspective on mission widens his earlier views on mission as primarily connected to the Kingdom of God and the church.

This study will investigate Míguez Bonino’s theological method; his understanding of the Kingdom of God; his ecclesiology; and his trinitarian theology. It will seek to answer several questions: What is the nature and development of Míguez Bonino’s missionary theology? How does he relate his theology to the

¹ In the English speaking world it has been common to refer to José Míguez Bonino as Bonino. However, when in Latin America two surnames are used, the second is normally the mother’s surname, in this case, Bonino; and the first surname is the father’s and the official one. In Latin America using both surnames is more acceptable. A person would never use only his or her mother’s surname. Therefore throughout this study “Míguez Bonino” will be used in order to maintain Latin convention.

² Faith Seeking Effectiveness.

context? Where are the areas of continuity and discontinuity? And in the final chapter, what is the relevance of his theology for mission theology today?

1.2 THE RATIONALE OF THE STUDY

1.2.1 Context

Míguez Bonino's ministry has spanned the ca. fifty turbulent years of missionary, ecclesiastical, and theological ferment that formed the second half of the Twentieth Century. He wrote his first major theological work in the year of the formation World Council of Churches (1948) and continued to publish up to 2004.

Up to the end of the Second World War, mission and missiology, done by European and North American Christians, was carried out confidently within the ethos of Western colonialism and Christendom. The changing face of Western Colonialism and the collapse of Western Christendom in and after 1945 meant that the ambiance and ethos in which the modern missionary movement had developed no longer existed. Consequently mission entered into what Ronald K. Orchard called 'a time of testing' (Bosch 1991:2; cf. Orchard 1964). This crisis, along with the formation of the World Council of Churches (WCC) in 1948 and theological developments within the International Missionary Council (IMC) such as the *Missio Dei* concept, meant that by the time of the integration of the IMC and WCC (New Delhi, 1961) 'the foundations of Christian Mission were crumbling' (Scherer 1993:195-197) and Gerald H. Anderson could say: 'the underlying principles and theological presuppositions for the Christian mission have been called into question and Christians are challenged to rethink the motives, message, methods and goals of their mission' (Anderson 1961:3).

After 1961, the missionary and theological crisis has continued. The Dutch missiologist Johannes Verkuyl said: 'the term "missiology" is today internationally recognized although its meaning, and its relation to theology, and the other academic disciplines is not so universally acknowledged' (Verkuyl 1978:2; cf. Bavinck 1960 and Bosch 1991:489-498). The Dutch editors of *Missiology: An Ecumenical Introduction* (1995) stated the following: 'now that many of the presuppositions of Western missions are no longer valid, missiology is looking for a new working self-definition' (Verstraelen et. al. 1995:2). Míguez Bonino has worked out his theology during this time of testing, rethinking and searching for a new identity.

1.2.2 Míguez Bonino as Liberation Theologian

A further reason to study Míguez Bonino is that he has been associated with the Latin American Liberation Theology movement, which has had great influence on missionary theory and practice in both Roman Catholicism and Protestantism. Indeed, it is a missiology that takes the context seriously (Costas 1976:241).

In Latin American Roman Catholicism, the birth and growth of the theologies of liberation signalled the 'coming of age' of Latin American Catholic theology. It sent shock waves through the hierarchy and led to the statement of the Sacred Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith: *Instruction on Certain Aspects of the Theology of Liberation* (1986). Despite the Vatican's attempts to suppress

Liberation Theology, its effects can be seen all over the world in Catholic and other Christian life and missionary work. Subsequent to the publication of Gustavo Gutiérrez' seminal work on Liberation Theology (Gutiérrez 1971), there was a veritable explosion of new 'liberative' theologies written. Feminist theologies (Ruether 1983, 1986; Russell 1974, 1987); African theologies of liberation (Dickson 1984; Muzorewa 1985), Asian theologies of liberation such as Minjung Theology from Korea (cf. Commission on Concerns of the Christian Conference of Asia (eds.) 1983), Black theologies from the United States of America (Cone 1969,³ 1975, 1984; cf. Wilmore and Cone 1979), and Black Theologies from South Africa (Boesak 1978, 1984), Rastafarian and Caribbean theologies (Erskine 1998 2nd ed.) even Jewish (Ellis 1987) and Palestinian Liberation Theologies (Ateek 1989) have been influenced by Latin American Liberation Theologies.⁴

Míguez Bonino is one of the leading protestant theologians associated with the liberation theology movement. If one looks at the main publications on Liberation Theology, Míguez Bonino's name will appear time and again. Along with other Latin American Protestant theologians such as Rubem Alves, Mortimer Arias, and Julio de Santa Ana, Míguez Bonino reflected critically upon the Christian faith in the light of the Latin American reality. His theology, as those of his Protestant colleagues, emerged from radically different roots than those of the Roman Catholic theologians; only later they became intertwined with Roman Catholic developments, entering into a deep and fruitful dialogue.

Míguez Bonino is a critic of Liberation Theology as well. William H. Lazareth has called him one of the 'foremost participant-critics in Latin America' of Liberation Theology (1975h:vii). Míguez Bonino has not only contributed to the debate by participating and supporting, but also by raising difficult questions for Liberation Theology. His voice has been heard inside and outside Latin America. For example, he was more willing than most liberation theologians to deepen the dialogue with Marxism (1976c). Consequently, although Míguez Bonino has long been associated with the Liberation Theology movement and has shared many of its concerns, he cannot be univocally labelled a liberation theologian.

1.2.2 Míguez Bonino as Ecumenical Theologian

Míguez Bonino's theology is not only associated with what are commonly considered liberationist interests but also includes themes related to other aspects of church life. He has published many theological works reflecting on issues such as Church history in Latin America; philosophy; ethics; inter-church relations; and mission. All these items are included in Míguez Bonino's theological vision.

Míguez Bonino was the only Latin American Protestant observer at the Second Vatican Council. His subsequent writings on the relationship between Protestants and Roman Catholics in Latin American have been significant. The book *Concilio Abierto*⁵ (1967c) was an early interpretation of the Second Vatican Council. He also contributed to the ecumenical movement in Latin America where

³ There are Black Theologies from the United States. Although Cone (1969) was written before Gutiérrez, one can see the influence at a later date.

⁴ For a detailed analysis of the various different liberation theologies, except the Feminist theologies see Witvliet (1985) and for a general introduction see Grenz and Olson, (1992).

⁵ Open Council.

he was involved in organizations such as *Iglesia y Sociedad en América Latina* (ISAL)⁶ and the *Consejo Latinoamericano de Iglesias* (CLAI).⁷ Orlando Costas calls Míguez Bonino ‘the dean of Latin American Protestant Theologians’ (Costas 1976:91). Furthermore he has been a spokesman of Latin American theology, in organisations of world Christianity.

A further reason for this study is that Míguez Bonino’s influence has been felt far beyond the borders of Argentina and Latin America. He has been deeply involved in, and has held influential positions in the World Council of Churches. He was a member of both the Commission on Faith and Order (1961-1977) and on the Central Committee of the WCC (1968-1975); moreover, from the Nairobi Assembly (1975) to the Vancouver Assembly (1983), he was on the presidium of that body. These appointments enabled him to speak at many different conferences crossing confessional and denominational barriers. For instance, he gave the keynote lectures at the London Institute of Contemporary Christianity (1974) led by the Evangelical Anglican John R.W. Stott; he also addressed events such as the ‘Christians in Socialism Conference’ in Chile (1972). In addition, he held ‘visiting professorships in England, Costa Rica, France and the United States’ (Ferm 1988:131).⁸

Finally, the theology of Míguez Bonino needs to be studied because of his personal journey in theology. For most of his career he has primarily been involved in the ecumenical movement. Since the mid nineteen-eighties, however, there has been a shift in his thinking, which has brought him closer to the more conservative Evangelical churches. An example of this shift is the participation of Míguez Bonino in the 25th anniversary conference in Santiago, Chile (1996) which was organised by the *Fraternidad Teológica Latinoamericana* (FTL),⁹ an Evangelical, movement initiated by René Padilla, Andrew Kirk, Peter Savage and other leading Evangelicals, and which today embraces a range of theological viewpoints wider than that of classical evangelicalism. Twenty-five years ago it would have been unthinkable that a theologian associated with Latin American Liberation Theology would join such a group.

1.2.5 *Míguez Bonino as Missionary Theologian*

Míguez Bonino has also shown interest in the rise of the Latin American missionary movement. During the nineteen eighties, many of the Latin American Protestant churches grew rapidly. Some Latin American church leaders gained the understanding that the responsibility of World Mission is also been laid on the shoulders of their churches; the European and North American Churches have no exclusive rights and duties in this regard. The first continent wide, mission congress held in Sao Paulo, Brazil (1987) was the event that gave the Latin American cross-cultural mission movement its first big thrust (Deiros 1997:89). It resulted in the formation of *Cooperación Misionera Iberoamericano* (COMIBAM)¹⁰ as the network of cooperation between the different national missionary movements existent in Latin America (Deiros 1997:89). Since then the numbers of Latin

⁶ Church and Society in Latin America.

⁷ Latin American Council of Churches.

⁸ He also is *Doctor Honoris Causa* of the Free University of Amsterdam (1980).

⁹ Latin American Theological Fraternity.

¹⁰ Iberoamerican Missionary Cooperation.

American foreign missionaries has grown enormously. The latest figures (from 2002) show that there are about 6500 cross-cultural missionaries from Ibero-America (Limpic 2002).

Many of the Evangelical¹¹ Protestant Churches in Latin America have achieved the goals of what Henry Venn (1725-1797), and Rufus Anderson (1796-1880) developed as the ‘3-self Formula,’¹² but have not been able to take a step forward towards the ‘fourth self’ proposed by Paul Hiebert, that of Self-Theologizing (Hiebert 1985:193-224). This fact is especially true of the Latin American missionary movement. However, Míguez belongs to the category of Latin American scholars who have been committed to develop a Latin American missionary theology, which originates from and responds to the Latin American needs locally and continentally and, at the same time, to contribute to a universal vision.¹³

1.3 TERMINOLOGY

This study treats the theology of Míguez Bonino as a missionary theology. It is recognized that the term ‘missionary’ carries a great deal of historical baggage. The modern missionary movement with its base in Europe and North America was historically and theologically ambiguous; its links with colonialism are well documented. To refer to a Latin American theologian’s work as ‘missionary’ could cause some consternation given its attempt to articulate coherently and theologically the mission of the church from a non-colonial and even anti-colonial position. The use of a new term, however, such as ‘missional’ tends to create the impression that Míguez Bonino makes a complete break, or at least operates in radical discontinuity with the modern missionary movement. This is clearly not so given his involvement with the WCC. This study intends to emphasise Míguez Bonino’s continuity with the historical mission movement and, at the same time to recognise how he questions many of its fundamental principles. The word ‘missionary’ therefore will continue to be utilised.

Most missionary thinkers do not distinguish between the terms ‘missionary theology’, and ‘theology of mission.’ But in the context of this study this distinction is fundamental. Johannes C. Hoekendijk, at Utrecht University, asserted that whereas ‘theology of mission’ functions as a division of systematic and practical theology, ‘missionary theology’ is systematic and practical theology ‘permeated by the spirit of the apostolate’ (Hoekendijk 1967:339; cf. Jongeneel and van Engelen

¹¹ The term “evangelical” will be explained later.

¹² ‘Self-governing’, ‘self-supporting’, and ‘self-propagating’. See Peter Beyerhaus’ critique (Beyerhaus 1979:15-30).

¹³ This study is needed—especially for the English-speaking world—because the vast majority of Míguez Bonino’s writings are not well known outside Latin America. Those books, articles and chapters that have been translated into English are usually the more “exotic” themes such as the use of Marxist critical tools in hermeneutics; the collaboration between Marxists and Christians in the process of liberation in Latin America; the development of a political ethics; and the like. Other writings—dealing with less controversial issues—have not been published in English. The English-speaking theological world, therefore, is given a distorted impression of Míguez Bonino’s theology. It is hoped that this study will rectify this lack.

1995:442-443). Jan A.B. Jongeneel, successor to Hoekendijk, offers a tentative definition. Missionary theology is:

that form or type of Christian theology which both theoretically and practically reflects upon the relations of Christians and churches with, and their responsibilities toward, adherents and communities of other religions, world-views, and ideologies in all spheres of private and public life (Jongeneel 1997:10).

He asserts that theology must not only be missionary, but also “communal” and “adoring” (Jongeneel 1995:68). That is, theology must reflect upon fellowship and worship, in addition to mission. Furthermore, he asserts that the term ‘missionary theology’ is, on the one hand, too narrow because it does not include philosophical analysis and empirical research, and, on the other hand, too broad because it deals with many issues that do not strictly belong to mission theology properly (Jongeneel 1995:68). It is imperative, therefore, as Lesslie Newbigin pointed out, to understand worship and fellowship as the *missionary dimension* of the church and preaching and service as the *missionary intention* of the church (Newbigin 1958:21, 43). Fellowship and worship as well as preaching and service are included in the purview of Míguez Bonino’s missionary theology.

When studying Latin American Protestantism it is important to note semantic differences in the meaningful translation of certain terms. The word *Evangélico* does not have the same meaning as ‘Evangelical’ in the Anglo-Saxon world. *Evangélico* in Spanish refers to anybody or any tradition influenced directly or indirectly by the Reformation and more or less equivalent to Protestant. This does not mean that the Western ecclesiastical and theological divisions do not exist in Latin America but it does mean that everybody from Pedro Arana Quiróz (b. 1938), who in Anglo-Saxon terms is considered ‘Evangelical’ to Rubém Alves Azevedo (b. 1933), who most certainly would not be thought of in that framework, is referred to as *Evangélico* (cf. 1997a and Escobar 1991:9-10). This is not often recognized in translations from the Spanish when *Evangélico* is simply translated *Evangelical*. However, it is interesting that Míguez Bonino in one of his most recent writings quotes the classic definition given by evangelical George M. Marsden with approval, saying that probably any Latin American *Evangélico* could subscribe to this definition (1997b:7-8; cf. Marsden 1980:3).

There is also a certain ambiguity in the Spanish term *Ecuménico*. In Latin America, all Ecumenical Protestants are *Evangélicos*, whereas in the Anglo-Saxon world only a few Evangelicals can be categorized as Ecumenical. In this study the word *Evangelical* will be used with the Anglo-Saxon meaning,¹⁴ except when translating Spanish texts; then the Spanish word *Evangélico* will be maintained. If texts already translated into English use the word *Evangelical* instead of *Evangélico*, the original will be noted in parenthesis.

A third term that needs to be clarified is the use of ‘American.’ In Latin America (Central and South) the people consider themselves to be ‘Americans.’ To use the term ‘American’ simply as a reference to people originating from the United States is considered offensive. Therefore, this study will specify the term ‘American’

¹⁴ Noting the difference between the North American use of the term and the European use.

as ‘North American,’ to signify the United States and Canada and ‘Latin American’ to signify South of the Río Bravo.¹⁵

1.4 METHODOLOGY

Míguez Bonino’s theological production has spanned over fifty years and is a conscious response to the ecumenical and missionary challenges. It was planted and has been nourished within the rich soil of Latin American culture and history, and has developed in both local and international arenas. It can be approached in various ways.

The historical method will be employed as the main method. It is needed to place Míguez Bonino’s life and work in context. It will also be used to trace the development of Míguez Bonino’s theology throughout his life and in the contexts in which he has reflected, ministered and written. Documents, archive materials, and oral history are used to sketch the life and work of Míguez Bonino in chapter two. This method will also be used in chapters three to six, which intend to sketch the developments in his theology.

The systematic method will be additionally employed, in order to describe and analyse the major themes in Míguez Bonino’s missionary theology. In the analysis of the central theological themes (Kingdom of God, Church and Trinity), Míguez Bonino’s own priorities are investigated. It is essential that no external theological framework should be imposed on them; they must speak for themselves.

Finally, the comparative method will be employed. This method will be used to trace the similarities and differences within Míguez Bonino’s own missionary theology over the decades. Additionally, it helps to show how Míguez Bonino’s theological and missiological themes agree with and differ from the context described in chapter two. A missionary theology cannot be fully understood without reference to context. Finally, this method will be used to reveal how Míguez has interacted with, and borrowed from, missionary theology in Latin America and worldwide.

1.5 STRUCTURE OF THE STUDY

After this introductory chapter, attention will be paid to the context in which Míguez has lived and worked. This provides a background to understand the development of his thought. Chapter two will be a biographical sketch of his life from his beginnings in Rosario and Santa Fe, Argentina; followed by his seminary training and early pastoral and missionary work as well as his academic and writing career in both Argentina and around the world. In addition to his involvement in teaching and denominational activities, it pays attention to his participation in the ecumenical movement in Latin America and the wider world. Other antecedent factors will also be studied, such as his spiritual development and his theological formation. This includes the impact which Liberal Protestant theologians made upon his theological

¹⁵This is further complicated by the fact that the indigenous peoples quite rightly reject the term ‘Latin American’ because they are not of Hispanic descent.

professors and how the theology of Karl Barth, Dietrich Bonhoeffer and Jürgen Moltmann influenced his thinking.

Chapters three to six will form the central analysis of Míguez Bonino's theology. A chapter on his theological methodology will investigate how he has developed a praxis orientated hermeneutic. Chapter four and five—on the Kingdom of God and the church respectively—explore two of the most significant themes for his theology. Chapter six will then explore his trinitarian theology, examining how he deepened and strengthened his reflections on the Kingdom and the church. This will allow the theological and contextual flow of his theology to emerge.

After an introduction, chapters three to six will include a brief section on theological developments within the area of study. This will be followed by a listing and explanation of the significance of the most relevant writings by Míguez Bonino on that subject. It will also include a brief description of the context of those writings. The main section of these chapters will be a description and analysis of Míguez Bonino's theological reflections. The chapters involved will conclude with some final observations. These will summarise the argument of the chapter; highlight some major influences on the theme under exploration; and will finish with some analytical comments.

Chapter seven will be a concluding chapter. It will analyse the challenge of Míguez Bonino's theology in the context of the mission of the global church and for the development of the Latin American missionary movement.

1.6 SOURCES

1.6.1 *Primary sources*

The primary sources for this study are published and unpublished studies, archive materials and oral history (especially interviews and tapes of talks given by Míguez Bonino). The majority of these sources are in Spanish, some being translated into English and others written in English which have been translated back into Spanish.

The unpublished materials are mainly made up of ad hoc leaflets written for various organisations. Examples of these are: 'La Unidad de la Iglesia' (1965g), written for the commission for Church Unity of the River Plate Churches; and 'Buscad a Dios con la alegría de la esperanza' (1998a), written for the Latin American Council of Churches. These studies can be consulted in archives found in Buenos Aires and Quito. Additionally, the unpublished materials include Míguez Bonino's Licenciate and ThD dissertations. They can be consulted in the archives of the *Instituto Superior Evangélico de Estudios Teológicos*¹⁶ (ISEDET,) Buenos Aires. Finally, unpublished materials are also available on the internet: for instance, 'Building Community, Transforming the World' (2002b) given as an address at the 15th World Council of the Young Men's Christian Association (YMCA).

The vast majority of Míguez Bonino's writings are articles published in a wide range of periodicals; chapters in books; papers given at conferences; and reports of interviews in various periodicals and publications. A few significant

¹⁶ The Superior Evangelical Institute of Theological Studies. Often known as Union Seminary, Buenos Aires.

articles should be mentioned here. ‘Nuestro Mensaje’ (1962c) is a paper delivered at a conference in 1961 that gives a clear expression of Míguez Bonino’s early understanding of Christian mission. ‘Fundamentos bíblicos y teológicos de la responsabilidad cristiana’ (1961c) is a paper given in the same month with more focus on the social responsibility of the Christian mission. ‘How does God Act in History’ (1972c; cf. 1966b) originally published in 1966, demonstrates Míguez Bonino’s understanding of hermeneutics and the relationship between the Kingdom of God and human history. ‘Praxis histórica e identidad cristiana’ (1977g) is a later example of Míguez Bonino’s understanding of Christian mission in history; cf. ‘Mission as Conflict and Challenge’ (1978l), which is a paper given to the Ecumenical Forum of Canada. Finally ‘The Concern for a Vital and Coherent Theology’ (1989d) is a much more recent example of Míguez Bonino’s understanding of the theological task in the framework of the World Council of Churches.

Several monographs were published in the course of the decades. Although Míguez Bonino wrote very little systematically in the earliest period of his career, he drafted *Concilio abierto: Una interpretación protestante del Concilio Vaticano II*¹⁷ (1967c), which demonstrates his concern for the ecumenical movement. Most of his significant books originate from the nineteen seventies. *Ama y Haz lo que quieras: Hacia una ética para el hombre Nuevo*¹⁸ (1972a), relates ethics to the creation of the new humanity in Christ. *Space to be people* (1979i), originally published as *Espacio para ser hombres: Una interpretación del mensaje de la Biblia para nuestro mundo*¹⁹ (1975c), is a series of evangelistic talks that can be viewed as a contextualization of the Biblical message to a Christian and non-Christian audience in the Argentina of the time. *Doing Theology in a Revolutionary Situation* (1975b), published in Britain as *Revolutionary Theology comes of Age* (1975h), and translated into Spanish as *La Fe en busca de la eficacia* (1977a) is an analysis of Latin American liberation theology. *Christians and Marxists: The Mutual Challenge to Revolution* (1976c) analyses a major ideological and missiological challenge to Christianity in Latin America. It represents a significant dialogue with a secular ideology.

A few monographs originate from the nineteen eighties and nineties. *Toward a Christian Political Ethics* (1983m) treats in a systematic way the relationship of Christianity to politics, i.e. Christian responsibility in the political realm. Whereas, *Faces of Latin American Protestantism* (1997a), originally published in Spanish as *Rostros del Protestantismo Latinoamericano*²⁰ (1995c), represents a ‘more or less systematic attempt at writing missiology’ (interview with author 1997), proposing the Trinity as hermeneutical criterion in the search for theological coherence and mission as material principle of a Latin American Protestant theology in its search for unity. This book will be used extensively in chapter six.

¹⁷ Open Council: A Protestant Interpretation of the Second Vatican Council.

¹⁸ Love and do as you will: Towards and Ethic for the New Humanity.

¹⁹ Space to be People: An Interpretation of the Message of the bible for our World.

²⁰ Faces of Latin American Protestantism.

1.6.2 Secondary Sources

Publications which deal in a more or less systematic way with the work of Míguez Bonino include books, articles and unpublished dissertations. *Fe, Compromiso y Teología: Homenaje a José Míguez Bonino*²¹ (ISEDET 1985), which was written as a *Festschrift* on the occasion of his retirement from full-time teaching. It contains biographical information as well as reflections upon various theological themes by his colleagues at ISEDET. There are articles dealing with Latin American theologies of liberation which pay attention to aspects of Míguez Bonino's theology. Three books are worth mentioning: 1. Rebecca Chopp, *Praxis of Suffering* (1986), which analyses Míguez Bonino's theology among others and interprets it as a theology of "conversion to the world." This book focuses almost exclusively on Míguez Bonino's hermeneutics; 2. Thomas L. Schubeck S.J., *Liberation Ethics: Sources, Models and Norms* (1993), which sees Míguez Bonino's ethics as the work of a scholar who addresses the issue of power; and 3. Alistair Kee, *Marx and the Failure of Liberation Theology* (1990), which analyzes his use of Marx and is highly critical because he views Míguez Bonino as a theologian who does not engage with Marx's second criticism of religion: that of the inversion of reality.

Various unpublished dissertations have been written, either on an aspect of Míguez Bonino's theology or comparing him with the theological concepts of other scholars. Javier Elizondo, 'The Use of the Bible in the Moral Deliberation of Liberation Theologians: An Examination of the Works of Leonardo Boff, Jose Míguez Bonino and Porfirio Miranda' (1988), demonstrates that there is convergence and divergence in the theologians' use of the Bible and in their views regarding the way in which the biblical witness provides specific themes and directions for Christian life. Its weakness, however, is that the author, although he examines the Latin American mindset and culture in relation to theology, does not explore profoundly enough the socio-political context (Liberation Theologians insist upon this context). Ransom Eugene Casey-Rutland, 'An Examination of the Issue of Violence in the Writings of Selected Latin American Liberation Theologians' (1991), focuses on the ethics and justification of violence in the theologies of Dom Hélder Câmara, Jose Míguez Bonino, and Juan Luis Segundo; it contains little or no exploration of the context of violence in which these theologians were working and writing. Roy Bissell Cooper, 'A Critical Analysis of Liberation Theology in the Works of Jose Míguez Bonino and Ronald J. Sider' (1986), written from an evangelical perspective, examines the different approaches to theology of Míguez Bonino and Sider. Its real value is in the emphasis upon the different historical contexts and different Church traditions of the two authors. But the developments within Míguez Bonino's theology are not fully examined nor analysed; it is a photo rather than a film. John Borman, 'A Study in Christianity, Marxist Ideology and Historical Engagement with Special Reference to the Liberation Theology of Jose Míguez Bonino' (1983), is an examination of Míguez Bonino's theological thought seeing the concept of the Kingdom of God as the hermeneutical key. Although Míguez Bonino's indebtedness to Dietrich Bonhoeffer and Oscar Cullmann and Jürgen Moltmann are acknowledged, Míguez Bonino's Barthianism is not fully explored and his socio-political context is not given sufficient prominence. A further

²¹ Faith, Commitment and Theology: In Honour of José Míguez Bonino.

problem with this work is that Borman only had access to Míguez Bonino's work in English. This has seriously limited the study. Sergio Antonio Estrada, 'A critique of liberationist exegesis of the Gospel of Luke as reflected in the writings of Jose Míguez Bonino, Leonardo Boff, and Gustavo Gutiérrez (1992), develops a historical-critical-cultural model of interpretation in order to discern whether the liberationist approaches to the Gospel of Luke can be considered exegetically sound. It includes an attempt at a Latin American perspective on biblical interpretation and at a history of the Latin peoples that gives a good basis for the understanding of the exegesis of these theologians.

In the category of secondary sources, reviews of Míguez Bonino's books and articles can also be placed. They can be found in theological journals of various confessional traditions. Finally, published correspondence needs to be mentioned. Famous is the letter of Jürgen Moltmann, 'An Open Letter to José Míguez Bonino' (Moltmann 1979:57-63), which is a highly critical response to Míguez Bonino's *Doing Theology in a Revolutionary Theology Comes of Age* and forms a critical backdrop for further reflection for liberation theologians in the continuous rethinking of their theologies.

1.6.3 General Literature

This study mainly uses general literature to investigate the background to both Míguez Bonino's personal context and thought and the context of world, church and mission at large. These include literature to describe and analyze the works of such diverse thinkers as Karl Barth, Jürgen Moltmann, Oscar Cullmann, Hendrik Berkhof, and Ernst Bloch. In this regard, both primary and secondary sources of their thought will be used as well as various dictionaries (Lossky, Míguez Bonino, Pobee, Stransky, Wainwright and Webb 1991; McGrath 1993; Fabella and Sugirtharajah 2000; Anderson 1998, Müller, Sundermeier, Bevans, and Blise 1997; and Moreau 2000).

For the history of Argentina, the following studies are significant: David Rock, *Argentina 1516-1983: From Spanish Colonialism to the Falklands War* (1985)²² and Edwin Williamson, *The Penguin History of Argentina* (1992). They are used to trace major events in the history of Argentina that impinge upon Míguez Bonino's life story.

From the many histories of Christianity in Latin America, a few books are selected. Pablo Deiros, *Historia del Cristianismo en América Latina* (1992), provides the study with a recent panorama of the history of the church in Latin America written by an Argentinean Baptist. Hans Jürgen Prien, *Historia del Cristianismo en América Latina* (1987)²³ is another panorama of Latin American church history. Prien is a member of the *Comisión de Estudios de la Historia de la Iglesia en América Latina* (CEHILA),²⁴ a Latin American commission founded in 1973 to study church history in Latin America and the Caribbean. This work is used alongside Deiros because of its detailed analysis and strong methodology. Jean-Pierre Bastian, *Historia del Protestantismo en América Latina* (1990), gives specific historical detail in regard to the Protestant church in Latin America. Arno Enns,

²² This book was translated into Spanish by Nestor Míguez, Míguez Bonino's eldest son.

²³ Hans-Jürgen Prien, *Die Geschichte des Christentums in Lateinamerika* (1978) is the original.

²⁴ Commission for the Study of Church History in Latin America.

Man, Milieu and Mission in Argentina (1971) provides data for Argentine church history. These sources are used widely in chapter two.

Reference books on mission theology will also be used. David J. Bosch, *Transforming Mission: Paradigm Shifts in Theology of Mission* (1991), especially chapter twelve, helps to compare Míguez Bonino's missionary theology with the wide range of contemporary traditions. Roger C. Bassham, *Mission Theology: 1948-1975 Years of Worldwide Creative Tension Ecumenical, Evangelical and Roman Catholic* (1979) precedes the study of Bosch serving a similar purpose but treating a more limited period. Johannes Verkuyl, *Missiology: An introduction* (1978) gives an historical survey of missiology from the sixteenth century onwards and introduces at the same time, systematically and contemporary missionary thinking on the basis, goals, means, and motives of mission. Jan A.B. Jongeneel, *Philosophy, Science, and Theology of Mission in the 19th and 20th Centuries: A Missiological Encyclopedia. Part I: Philosophy and Science of Mission* (1995) and *Part II: Missionary Theology* (1997) categorizes and analyses missionary thinking over the past two centuries. Each of these monographs has extensive bibliographies enabling further missiological research.