ORIGINAL ARTICLE

Children's respiratory health and oxidative potential of PM_{2.5}: the PIAMA birth cohort study

Downloaded from http://oem.bmj.com/ on January 27, 2017 - Published by group.bmj.com

Aileen Yang,^{1,2} Nicole A H Janssen,¹ Bert Brunekreef,^{2,3} Flemming R Cassee,^{1,2} Gerard Hoek,² Ulrike Gehring²

ABSTRACT

► Additional material is published online only. To view please visit the journal online (http://dx.doi.org/10.1136/ oemed-2015-103175).

¹National Institute for Public Health and the Environment (RIVM), Bilthoven, The Netherlands ²Institute for Risk Assessment Sciences, Utrecht University, Utrecht, The Netherlands ³Julius Center for Health Sciences and Primary Care, University Medical Center Utrecht, Utrecht, The Netherlands

Correspondence to

Dr Nicole AH Janssen, National Institute for Public Health and the Environment (RIVM), P.O. Box 1, Bilthoven 3720 BA, The Netherlands; Nicole.Janssen@rivm.nl

Received 8 July 2015 Revised 20 November 2015 Accepted 6 December 2015 Published Online First 11 January 2016



To cite: Yang A, Janssen NAH, Brunekreef B, *et al. Occup Environ Med* 2016;**73**:154–160. **Introduction** The oxidative potential (OP) of particulate matter (PM) has been proposed as a healthrelevant metric, but currently few epidemiological studies investigated associations of OP with health. Our main aim was to assess associations of long-term exposure to OP with respiratory health in children. Our second aim was to evaluate whether OP is more consistently associated with respiratory health than PM mass, PM composition or nitrogen dioxide (NO₂).

Methods For 3701 participants of a prospective birth cohort, annual average concentrations of OP (assessed by spin resonance (OP^{ESR}) and dithiothreitol assay (OP^{OTT})), PM with an aerodynamic diameter of less than 2.5 μ m (PM_{2.5}) mass, NO₂, and PM_{2.5} constituents at the home addresses at birth and at all follow-up addresses were estimated by land-use regression. Repeated questionnaire reports of asthma and hay fever until age 14 years, and measurements of allergic sensitisation, lung function and fractional exhaled nitric oxide at age 12 years were linked with air pollution concentrations.

Results Asthma incidence, prevalence of asthma symptoms and rhinitis were positively associated with OP^{DTT} (adjusted OR (95% CI) per IQR increase in exposure 1.10 (1.01 to 1.20), 1.08 (1.02 to 1.16), 1.15 (1.05 to 1.26), respectively). These associations persisted after adjustment for most co-pollutants. Forced expiratory volume in 1s and forced vital capacity were negatively associated with OP^{DTT} . These associations were sensitive to adjustment for NO₂. Respiratory health was not significantly associated with OP^{DTT} . These associations deferse. **Conclusions** Respiratory health was more strongly associated with OP^{DTT} than with PM_{2.5} mass; OP^{DTT} associations with lung function, but not symptoms, were sensitive to adjustment for NO₂.

INTRODUCTION

Numerous epidemiological studies have established associations between exposure to ambient air pollution and respiratory health.¹ ² Various exposure metrics have been used to investigate the effect of air pollution on human health, such as particulate matter (PM) with an aerodynamic diameter of less than 2.5 μ m (PM_{2.5}) and 10 μ m (PM₁₀); traffic markers (elemental carbon (EC); nitrogen dioxide (NO₂)); and less frequently, different PM constituents (iron, copper, nickel, zinc, vanadium, sulfur, potassium, silicon).³ ⁴ However, PM toxicity is likely to be reflected by the sum of multiple toxic components. Since toxicological studies have

What this paper adds

- Oxidative potential (OP), which measures the inherent capacity of particulate matter (PM) to oxidise target molecules, has been proposed as a biologically more relevant exposure metric than PM with an aerodynamic diameter of less than 2.5 μm (PM_{2.5}).
- This is the first study on the associations between long-term exposure to two measures of OP (assessed by dithiothreitol assay (OP^{DTT}) and spin resonance (OP^{ESR})) of PM_{2.5} and children's respiratory health.
 Exposure to OP^{DTT}, but not OP^{ESR} and PM_{2.5}
- Exposure to OP^{DTT}, but not OP^{ESR} and PM_{2.5} mass, was associated with increased risks of asthma and rhinitis until age 14 years, and decreased lung function at age 12 years.
- Associations of OP^{DTT} with asthma symptoms and rhinitis were largely independent of exposure to other air pollutants, including NO₂, PM_{2.5} mass and PM_{2.5} constituents.
- Our study suggests that OP^{DTT} could be a health-relevant metric.

documented the ability of inhaled PM to cause oxidative stress and inflammation in the airways,^{5–8} oxidative potential (OP), which measures the inherent capacity of PM to oxidise target molecules, has been proposed as a biologically more relevant exposure metric.⁹

Currently, there is limited epidemiological evidence on the relationship between OP and health; consequently, it is not clear whether OP has more consistent associations with health than other PM characteristics.¹⁰ Recently, a few studies have assessed the acute health effects of OP, especially on respiratory health end points. The findings, so far, did not consistently indicate that OP is a better predictor of acute health effects than other air pollution metrics.^{11–16} High correlation between temporal patterns of OP and other pollutants might have contributed to the inconsistency of the twopollutant findings. To the best of our knowledge, only one publication on the long-term health effects of OP is available. Tonne et al¹⁷ compared the associations of carotid intima-media thickness with annual average PM10 concentrations and PM₁₀ concentrations weighted by OP, and found that the inclusion of OP did not strengthen the associations.



The prospective Prevention and Incidence of Asthma and Mite Allergy (PIAMA) birth cohort study provided information on the relationship between exposure to air pollution (NO₂, PM_{2.5}, PM_{2.5} absorbance, PM_{2.5} elemental composition) and the development of asthmatic symptoms and allergic diseases up to the age of 12 years.¹⁸ Another questionnaire survey was completed when the participants were 14 years old. The present study examines the associations of OP of PM_{2.5} with asthma incidence and symptoms, hay fever, rhinitis, allergic sensitisation, lung function, and airway inflammation represented by fractional exhaled nitric oxide (FE_{NO})¹⁹ in the PIAMA study.

The first aim of this study was to assess whether OP is associated with the aforementioned health outcomes. The second aim was to assess whether the associations of OP with health were more robust than associations with other air pollutant metrics, especially $PM_{2.5}$ mass concentration. These findings will help to elucidate the value of OP as an exposure metric in long-term health effects studies.

MATERIALS AND METHODS Study population

The PIAMA prospective birth cohort study recruited pregnant women during their second trimester in 1996-1997 from various communities in the Netherlands.²⁰ Non-allergic pregnant women were invited to participate in a 'natural history' study arm; allergic women, identified through a screening questionnaire, were primarily allocated to an intervention arm (involving the use of mite-impermeable mattress and pillow covers) with a random subset allocated to the natural history arm. The study population for the present study consists of all participants of the intervention and natural history studies with data on at least one of the health outcomes studied, and with data on air pollution exposure and potential confounders available to be included in at least one of the adjusted analyses (N=3701). The study protocol was approved by the institutional review boards of participating institutes, and written informed consent was obtained from the parents and legal guardians of all participants.

Long-term exposure assessment

We estimated annual average outdoor air concentrations of OP, PM_{2.5} mass, PM_{2.5} absorbance, PM_{2.5} elemental composition (iron (Fe), copper (Cu), potassium (K), nickel (Ni), sulfur (S), silicon (Si), vanadium (V) and zinc (Zn)), and NO₂ at the participants home addresses at birth and at the different follow-ups (medical examination at age 12 years and questionnaire followups until age 14 years) by means of land-use regression (LUR) models that have been described previously.⁴ ^{21–23} LUR models for OP, PM2.5, PM2.5 absorbance and NO2 are presented in online supplementary table S1. In short, three 2-week measurements of PM2.5 were performed in the warm, cold and intermediate seasons between February 2009 and February 2010 at 40 sites spread over the Netherlands and Belgium.^{24 25} All PM_{2.5} filters were analysed for OP and elemental composition.²² ²³ NO₂ was measured at 80 sites, including the 40 PM sites.

OP of $PM_{2.5}$ was measured with the dithiothreitol (DTT) and spin resonance (ESR) assays.²³ The DTT assay measures the ability of $PM_{2.5}$ to transfer electrons from DTT to oxygen and is sensitive towards the organic compounds in the PM mixture.²⁶ OP^{DTT} is reported as the consumption rate of DTT (expressed as nmol DTT/min divided by sampled volume), which is proportional to the concentration of redox reactive compounds (eg, organic compounds) in the sample. The ESR method is based on the trapping of PM-induced hydroxyl radicals (OH•) mainly generated via Fenton-type reactions in the presence of hydrogen peroxide (H₂O₂) and 5,5-dimethyl-1pyrroline-*N*-oxide (DMPO) as spin trap.^{27 28} OP^{ESR} is sensitive towards transition metals in the PM mixture. OP^{ESR} is reported as the average of the total amplitudes of the DMPO-OH quartet in arbitrary units (AU) divided by sampled volume.

The temporally adjusted average of the three measurements for each site was used for LUR model development. Predictor variables, such as land use, traffic intensity, roads and population density, used for LUR model development were derived from the geographical information system. The estimated regional background concentration was offered as an additional predictor. For each site, the background concentrations were calculated by inverse distance squared weighted interpolation of concentrations measured at all regional sites.

Health outcomes

Health outcome information was collected annually from birth until age 8 years, and then at ages 11–12 and 14 years using questionnaires. From the questionnaires, we selected the same health end points as in the previous analyses,¹⁸ namely incident doctor-diagnosed asthma, prevalence of asthma symptoms in the past 12 months, hay fever ever and hay fever symptoms (rhinitis) in the past 12 months.

In addition, at age 12 years, a medical examination was performed on participants with additional consent. IgE levels to common inhalant allergens, including house dust mite (*Dermatophagoides pteronyssinus*), cat, cocksfoot and birch pollen were measured in serum by a radioallergosorbent test-like method used at the Sanquin Laboratories (Amsterdam, the Netherlands). Sensitisation was defined as a positive reaction (specific IgE level ≥ 0.70 IU/mL) to one of the allergens tested. Spirometry was done following the guidelines of American Thoracic Society/European Respiratory Society.²⁹ We measured forced expiratory volume in 1 s (FEV₁), forced vital capacity (FVC), mid-respiratory flows (FEF₂₅₋₇₅) and FE_{NO} (a biomarker of airway inflammation).

Statistical analysis

Longitudinal analysis

Associations of air pollution with asthma incidence were analysed using discrete-time hazard models³⁰; associations with asthma symptoms, hay fever and rhinitis were analysed by generalised estimation equations with a logit-link using a sevendependent correlation matrix.³¹ Analyses were done with exposures at the birth address and exposures at the address at the time of the follow-up. We included the same confounders as in the previous analyses: sex, maternal education, parental allergies, breast feeding, maternal smoking during pregnancy, smoking in the child's home, use of gas for cooking, mould/ dampness in the child's home, pets at home, daycare attendance during first year of life and neighbourhood percentage of lowincome households.¹⁸

Cross-sectional analysis

Owing to high prevalence of allergic sensitisation at age 12 years, we used log-binomial regression to analyse the associations of allergic sensitisation with air pollution levels. For the associations between air pollution and continuous outcome variables (FEV₁, FVC, FEF_{25–75}, FE_{NO}), we used linear regression with natural log (ln) transformation of the outcome variable.^{18 32} Associations with sensitisation, lung function and FE_{NO} were calculated for exposures at the birth address and at the address

Environment

at age 12 years, when the medical examination took place. Associations with lung function were calculated with adjustment for sex and log-transformed age, height and weight (crude model), and with additional adjustment for respiratory infections in the past 3 weeks and the same set of confounders as in the longitudinal symptom analyses. In addition, we adjusted for short-term average ambient air pollution levels during the 7 days preceding the lung function test by using daily data from the National Air Quality Monitoring Network (http://www. rivm.nl/milieukwaliteit/lucht/). Daily data were available for NO₂ and PM₁₀, but not for PM_{2.5}. Eventually, short-term exposure to NO2 was included in all models because short-term NO2 and not short-term PM10 was a strong confounder of the associations between FE_{NO} and long-term air pollution exposure; for FEV1, FVC and FEF25-75, associations with long-term air pollution exposure were generally the same in models with short-term NO₂ and short-term PM₁₀.

Air pollution variables were entered as continuous variables without transformation in all models for effect estimates with pollutants. Effect estimates are presented as relative risk for allergic sensitisation; OR for all other binary outcomes; and percentage change in lung function and FE_{NO}, all with 95% CIs, for an IQR increase in exposure at birth address to facilitate comparison. Statistical significance was defined as p<0.05 and borderline significance as p<0.1. We report the results of single-pollutant models, and two-pollutant models for health end points that were significantly associated with OP. Two-pollutant models of OP with other air pollutants were specified to evaluate whether OP is associated with health after adjusting for potentially correlated pollutants.¹³

Analyses were performed with Statistical Analysis System (SAS V.9.4) for Windows.

RESULTS

Study population characteristics

The distributions of the general characteristics and health outcomes from medical examination for the current study population and the entire cohort are shown in online supplementary table S2. Difference in characteristics between participants and non-participants were generally small. The frequency distribution of questionnaire-based health outcomes shows a decline in asthma incidence and symptom prevalence with age, while hay fever and rhinitis prevalence increased with age.

Distributions and correlations of air pollution exposure

Figure 1 shows the distributions of annual averages of OP^{DTT} and OP^{ESR} at the participants' addresses at birth, at age 12 years (medical examination) and at age 14 years (questionnaire). Distributions were generally similar at the different time points. The distributions of the annual averages of the other pollutants are shown in online supplementary table S3.

The correlation between the two OP metrics was low (R=0.33 for birth address, see online supplementary table S4). At the birth address, OP^{DTT} correlated highest with NO₂ (R=0.74) and lowest with Zn (R=-0.03) and K (R=0.13). OP^{ESR} correlated highest with PM_{2.5}, PM_{2.5} absorbance, Cu, Fe, S and Si (all R>0.70). The correlation with PM_{2.5} mass concentration was higher for OP^{ESR} (R=0.81) than for OP^{DTT} (R=0.41). These correlations were similar for exposures at the current address at age 14 years.

Single-pollutant models

We report the associations of questionnaire-reported symptoms with OP^{ESR} , OP^{DTT} , NO_2 , $PM_{2.5}$ and $PM_{2.5}$ absorbance at the



Figure 1 Distribution of annual averages of oxidative potential assessed by dithiothreitol assay (OP^{DTT}) and oxidative potential assessed by spin resonance (OP^{ESR}) at the participants' birth address, current address at the time of the medical examination (12ME) and current address at age 14 years. Median (horizontal line in the box), mean (diamond symbol), 25th and 75th centiles (box) are shown, whiskers indicate P10 and P90, and individual outliers are shown as points.

birth address and at the current address from single-pollutant models in table 1. Generally, differences between crude and adjusted associations of annual air pollution level with asthma, hay fever and rhinitis were small; all changes in OR were less than 6%, except for PM2.5 and hay fever where the change in OR was 11% (data not shown). We found statistically significant positive associations of asthma incidence, prevalence of asthma symptoms and rhinitis with OP^{DTT} at the birth address, after adjusting for potential confounders. OP^{ESR} was not significantly associated with any health outcome. We also found significant associations of asthma incidence, prevalence of asthma symptoms and rhinitis with NO2 at the birth address. Effect sizes were similar for OP^{DTT} and NO₂. The adjusted associations with asthma, rhinitis and hay fever were generally weaker and non-significant for air pollution exposure at the current address as compared with air pollution exposure at the birth address. We did not find any significant associations of asthma, hay fever, and rhinitis with PM2.5 and PM2.5 absorbance, and few significant associations (eg, K, S and Zn) with PM2.5 constituents (see online supplementary table S5).

Associations of FE_{NO}, FEV₁, FVC and FEF₂₅₋₇₅ with OP^{ESR}, OP^{DTT}, NO₂, PM_{2.5} and PM_{2.5} absorbance at the birth address and at age 12 years from single-pollutant models are reported in table 2. After adjusting for potential confounders, we found significant negative associations of FEV₁ and FVC with OP^{DTT} and NO₂ at age 12 years. Effect estimates and CIs for NO₂ were larger than those for OP^{DTT}. Moreover, FEV₁ was associated with PM_{2.5}, PM_{2.5} absorbance, Cu and Fe (see online supplementary table S6) at age 12 years. Estimated reductions in FEV₁ were generally larger for these pollutants than for OP^{DTT}. OP^{ESR} was not significantly associated with lung function, allergic sensitisation and FE_{NO} at age 12 years. Few significant associations were found between lung function and exposure at the birth address (table 2).

We also analysed the impact of moving behaviour for lung function parameters by performing separate analyses for movers and non-movers, and found no significant differences.

Two-pollutant models

Only the two-pollutant models for OP^{DTT} are presented in detail, since OP^{ESR} was not significantly associated with any health outcome.

Table 1 Adjusted associations⁺ of asthma incidence, asthma symptoms, hay fever and rhinitis with exposure at the birth and current address

		Asthma incidence		Asthma symptoms		Hay fever		Rhinitis	
Component adjusted	EI	OR	(95% CI)	OR	(95% CI)	OR	(95% CI)	OR	(95% CI)
At birth address									
OPDTT	0.2	1.10**	(1.01 to 1.20)	1.08**	(1.02 to 1.16)	1.09	(0.98 to 1.21)	1.15**	(1.05 to 1.26)
OP ^{ESR}	252	1.03	(0.90 to 1.17)	1.03	(0.93 to 1.13)	1.08	(0.93 to 1.25)	1.08	(0.93 to 1.25)
NO ₂	8.4	1.12**	(1.01 to 1.25)	1.08**	(1.00 to 1.17)	1.10	(0.98 to 1.24)	1.12**	(1.00 to 1.25)
PM _{2.5} absorbance	0.29	1.06	(0.96 to 1.16)	1.04	(0.97 to 1.12)	1.02	(0.91 to 1.13)	1.05	(0.96 to 1.16)
PM _{2.5}	1.2	1.08	(0.94 to 1.25)	1.03	(0.93 to 1.14)	1.06	(0.90 to 1.24)	1.07	(0.94 to 1.22)
At current address									
OPDTT	0.2	1.06	(0.97 to 1.15)	1.03	(0.97 to 1.09)	1.03	(0.93 to 1.13)	1.05	(0.96 to 1.14)
OP ^{ESR}	252	1.02	(0.88 to 1.17)	1.08	(0.98 to 1.19)	1.03	(0.88 to 1.19)	1.13	(0.98 to 1.32)
NO ₂	8.4	1.08	(0.97 to 1.21)	1.06	(0.98 to 1.14)	1.01	(0.89 to 1.16)	1.12**	(1.00 to 1.26)
PM _{2.5} absorbance	0.29	1.03	(0.93 to 1.15)	1.03	(0.95 to 1.11)	0.97	(0.85 to 1.11)	1.09	(0.98 to 1.22)
PM _{2.5}	1.2	1.02	(0.87 to 1.18)	1.08	(0.97 to 1.20)	1.01	(0.83 to 1.22)	1.14	(0.97 to 1.34)

Associations of NO2 at current address with rhinitis 1.12 (1.00, 1.26). **Associations are presented as OR with 95% Cls. *p<0.05, *p<0.1.

+Adjusted for sex, maternal education, parental allergies, breast feeding, maternal smoking during pregnancy, smoking in the child's home, use of gas for cooking, mould/dampness in

The child's home, pets at home, date of the child's home, bet of the child's home, pets at home, date of gas to cooking, induction provide the child's home, pets at home, date of gas to cooking, induction provide the child's home, pets at home, date of gas to cooking, induction provide the child's home, pets at home, date of gas to cooking, induction provide the child's home, pets at home, date of gas to cooking, induction provide the child's home, pets at home, date of gas to cooking, induction provide the child's home, pets at home, date of gas to cooking, induction provide the child's home, pets at home, date of gas to cooking, induction provide the child's home, pets at home, date of gas to cooking, induction provide the child's home, pets at home, date of gas to cooking, induction provide the child's home, pets at home, date of gas to cooking, induction provide the child's home, pets at home, date of gas to cooking, induction provide the child's home, pets at home, date of gas to cooking, induction provide the child's home, pets at home, date of gas to cooking, induction provide the child's home, pets at home, date of gas to cooking, induction provide the child's home, pets at home, date of gas to cooking, induction provide the child's home, pets at home, date of gas to cooking, induction provide the child's home, pets at home, date of gas to cooking, induction provide the child's home, pets at home, date of gas to cooking, induction pets at home, as a set of gas to cooking at home, as a set of gas to cooking at home, as a set of gas to cooking at home, as a set of gas to cooking at home, as a set of gas to cooking at home, as a set of gas to cooking at home, as a set of gas to cooking at home, as a set of gas to cooking at home, as a set of gas to cooking at home, as a set of gas to cooking at home, as a set of gas to cooking at home, as a set of gas to cooking at home, as a set of gas to cooking at home, as a set of gas to cooking at home, as a set of gas to cooking at home, as a set of gas to cooking a

matter with an aerodynamic diameter of less than 2.5 μ m.

In all two-pollutant models, associations of rhinitis with OP^{DTT} remained statistically significant (figure 2A). For asthma symptoms, the associations only lost significance after adjusting for NO₂. For asthma incidence, the associations lost significance after adjusting for several co-pollutants, including NO_2 and $PM_{2.5}$. The effect estimates for OP^{DTT} , however, were generally of similar magnitude in single-pollutant and two-pollutant OP^{DTT} models (figure 2A).

co-pollutants. After adjustment for NO2, the estimated effects of OP^{DTT} on FEV₁ and FVC were reduced by approximately 50%, and the CIs increased (figure 2B). The variance inflation factor was less than 3, indicating that the correlation between NO₂ and OP^{DTT} did not result in questionable models.

Owing to the high correlations of OP^{DTT} with NO₂, we also evaluated whether the single-pollutant associations of NO_2 remained after adjusting for OP^{DTT} (see online supplementary table S7). For asthma and rhinitis, the effect estimates of NO2 decreased substantially and lost significance when adjusted for

For both FEV₁ and FVC (figure 2B), the effect estimates and CIs were largely unaffected by adjustment for most

Table 2 Adjusted associations⁺ between lung function, FE_{NO}, allergic sensitisation and exposure at the birth address and at the current address at the time of the medical examination at age 12 years

		FEV ₁		FVC		FEF ₂₅₋₇₅		FE _{NO}		Allergic sensitisation‡	
	EI	%diff	(95% CI)	%diff	(95% CI)	%diff	(95% CI)	%diff	(95% CI)	RR	(95% CI)
At birth address											
OPDTT	0.2	-0.50	(-1.23 to 0.24)	-0.27	(-0.96 to 0.43)	-1.11	(-3.4 to 1.23)	-0.51	(-4.71 to 3.87)	1.04	(0.96 to 1.12)
OPESR	252	-0.04	(-1.07 to 1.01)	0.16	(-0.82 to 1.15)	-2.07	(-5.28 to 1.24)	-1.18	(-6.95 to 4.95)	1.08	(0.98 to 1.19)
NO ₂	8.4	-0.38	(-1.34 to 0.58)	-0.19	(-1.09 to 0.72)	-2.54	(-5.46 to 0.48)	0.09	(-5.4 to 5.91)	1.09	(0.99 to 1.19)
PM _{2.5} absorbance	0.29	-0.32	(-1.15 to 0.52)	0.12	(-0.67 to 0.91)	-2.74*	(-5.19 to -0.22)	-0.72	(-5.42 to 4.21)	1.08	(0.99 to 1.16)
PM _{2.5}	1.2	-0.17	(-1.26 to 0.94)	0.26	(-0.78 to 1.31)	-2.63	(-5.91 to 0.76)	-0.74	(-6.97 to 5.91)	1.10	(0.98 to 1.23)
At age 12 years											
OPDTT	0.2	-0.94**	(-1.66 to -0.22)	-0.62*	(-1.30 to 0.06)	-1.49	(-3.75 to 0.82)	0.61	(-3.63 to 5.05)	1.04	(0.97 to 1.12)
OPESR	252	-0.79	(-1.93 to 0.36)	-0.59	(-1.67 to 0.50)	-0.10	(-3.66 to 3.58)	0.51	(-6.03 to 7.52)	1.08	(0.98 to 1.19)
NO ₂	8.4	-1.46**	(-2.60 to -0.51)	-1.09**	(-2.07 to -0.09)	-2.61	(-5.77 to 0.65)	-0.71	(-6.83 to 5.80)	1.07	(0.97 to 1.18)
PM _{2.5} absorbance	0.29	-1.20**	(-2.18 to -0.22)	-0.62	(-1.55 to 0.32)	-2.82*	(-5.76 to 0.22)	-1.90	(-7.53 to 4.07)	1.05	(0.96 to 1.15)
PM _{2.5}	1.2	-1.11*	(-2.34 to 0.13)	-0.53	(-1.70 to 0.65)	-2.84	(-6.65 to 1.13)	1.66	(-5.67 to 9.56)	1.10	(0.96 to 1.25)

Associations are presented as percentage difference (%diff) and RR with 95% CIs.

*p<0.05, * p<0.1.

Confounding factors differ from those by Gehring et al¹⁸ as we adjusted for acute NO₂ effects in addition to sex, In age, In height, In weight, respiratory infections during the past 12 weeks, maternal education, parental allergies, breast feeding, maternal smoking during pregnancy, smoking in the child's home, use of gas for cooking, mold/dampness in the child's home, pets at home, daycare attendance during first year of life and neighbourhood percentage of low-income households.

+Adjusted for sex, maternal education, parental allergies, breast feeding, maternal smoking during pregnancy, smoking in the child's home, use of gas for cooking, mould/dampness in

the child's home, pets at home, daycare attendance during first year of life and neighbourhood percentage of low-income households. EI, exposure increment; FEF₂₅₋₇₅, mid-respiratory flows; FE_{NO}, fractional exhaled nitric oxide; FEV1, forced expiratory volume in 1 s; FVC, forced vital capacity; NO₂, nitrogen dioxide; OP^{ESR}, oxidative potential assessed by spin resonance; OP^{DTT}, oxidative potential assessed by dithiothreitol assay; PM_{2.5}, particulate matter with an aerodynamic diameter of less than 2.5 µm; RR, relative risk.



Figure 2 (A) Associations of asthma incidence, prevalence of asthma symptoms and rhinitis with OP^{DTT} at the birth address from single-pollutant and two-pollutant models; (B) adjusted associations of lung function (FEV₁, FVC,) with OP^{DTT} at the time of the medical examination at age 12 years from single-pollutant and two-pollutant models. Cu, copper; Fe, iron; FEV₁, forced expiratory volume in 1 s; FVC, forced vital capacity; K, potassium; Ni, nickel; NO₂, nitrogen dioxide; OP^{ESR}, oxidative potential assessed by spin resonance; OP^{DTT}, oxidative potential assessed by dithiothreitol assay; PM_{2.5}, particulate matter with an aerodynamic diameter of less than 2.5 μm; S, sulfur; Si, silicon; V, vanadium; Zn, zinc.

 OP^{DTT} . For lung function, the effect estimates for NO₂ were reduced by approximately 20% after adjustment for OP^{DTT} . Most respiratory health end points were also more consistently associated with OP^{DTT} than with $PM_{2.5}$ mass concentrations (see online supplementary table S8).

DISCUSSION

We investigated the associations between long-term exposure to two measures of OP (OP^{DTT} and OP^{ESR}) of $PM_{2.5}$ and respiratory health in the Dutch PIAMA birth cohort. In singlepollutant models, we found significant associations of asthma incidence, prevalence of asthma symptoms, rhinitis, FEV₁ and FVC with OP^{DTT} . In two-pollutant models, these associations with OP^{DTT} were insensitive to adjustment for most co-pollutants, including $PM_{2.5}$ mass concentration. However, associations of OP^{DTT} with lung function were sensitive to adjustment for NO₂. We did not find significant associations of $PM_{2.5}$ mass concentration and OP^{ESR} with any of the health end points.

Few studies have assessed the acute respiratory health effects of OP, but the findings from these studies were inconclusive.¹¹⁻¹⁴ ¹⁶ In a study where healthy young adults were exposed for 5 h to air pollution at different locations in the Netherlands, three different measures of OP (OP^{DTT}, OP^{ESR} and the depletion of ascorbate acid) were significantly associated with markers of airway and nasal inflammation (FE_{NO} and NAL IL-6) in single- pollutant models.¹⁴ However, in two-pollutant models, these associations only remained significant when measurements at a site with extremely high levels of OP were

excluded.¹⁴ In the same study, lung function was not consistently associated with OP.¹³ In a panel study consisting of school children with persistent asthma, Delfino et al¹¹ found significant associations of OP^{DTT} and the rat alveolar macrophage assay with FE_{NO} in single-pollutant models, but these associations were reduced and lost significance after adjusting for co-pollutants, including NO₂ and EC. The macrophage assay is a measure of the production of reactive oxygen species (ROS) within cells that can be induced by many other factors, including the endogenous formation of H2O2, and cannot easily be compared with the OP measure that were applied in the present study. In another panel study of elderly people by Delfino et al,¹² macrophage ROS production was significantly associated with FE_{NO} and blood marker IL-6 in single-pollutant models, but these associations lost significance in two-pollutant models after adjusting for other co-pollutants (polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons, organic acids). Generally, these studies did not demonstrate that the intrinsic OP of PM is a better predictor of acute health effects than other exposure metrics.

To the best of our knowledge, no data have been published on the effects of long-term exposure to OP of $PM_{2.5}$ on the respiratory health of children. We found a more consistent association of most respiratory health end points with OP^{DTT} than with $PM_{2.5}$ mass concentration and OP^{ESR} , suggesting that OP^{DTT} could be a more health relevant measure than $PM_{2.5}$ mass concentration. Especially for rhinitis, the effect estimates from the single-pollutant and two-pollutant OP^{DTT} models remained significant and largely unchanged after adjusting for different co-pollutants, including $PM_{2.5}$ and NO_2 . The low spatial correlation between OP^{DTT} and $PM_{2.5}$ mass concentration is consistent with previous results, and provides support for the possibility of distinguishing the independent effects of OP^{DTT} and $PM_{2.5}$ mass concentration.²³ The lack of associations of $PM_{2.5}$ concentration with respiratory health end points is in line with previous results in PIAMA of the same study population at age 12 years.¹⁸

Few studies have investigated associations with exposure at different time points. The more consistent associations of asthma with early life exposure are in line with earlier findings.^{33 34} With regard to lung function, findings of other studies are inconsistent.^{3 35 36} The stronger association of lung function with current exposure compared with early life exposure in the present study is supported by studies showing that air pollution effects on lung function in children may be reversible.^{37 38}

We previously validated the LUR models used in the current study, and found a significant correlation (R=0.65, p<0.01) of LUR modelled OP^{DTT} with measured home-outdoor OP^{DTT} , and a moderate correlation (R=0.50) with measured personal OP^{DTT 39} We found lower correlations of LUR modelled outdoor OPESR with personal measurements (R=0.24), mostly due to the influence of indoor sources.³⁹ The higher correlations of LUR modelled OP at the home address with personal exposures for OP^{DTT} than for OP^{ESR} may explain why we found consistent associations with OP^{TT}, but not with OP^{ESR}. Moreover, our findings of OPESR are consistent with the results from a previous study in PIAMA where weak associations were found for the transition metals which OP^{ESR} primarily responds to.¹⁸ Also, the differential findings for OP characterised by DTT and ESR could be due to the fact that the assays respond to different components in the PM mixture. Also, there is little external evidence for organic compounds which affect OPDTT primarily being associated with stronger respiratory health effects than the transition metals which affect OP^{ESR}.^{11 40}

We also observed consistent associations of NO₂ with the majority of health end points studied. NO₂ was highly (R=0.70-0.74) correlated with OP^{DTT}, complicating the disentangling of the separate effects of OPDTT and NO₂. Variation inflation factors suggested, however, that the correlation between OP^{DTT} and NO₂ did not result in multicollinearity problems. Our findings with regard to OP^{DTT} and NO₂ are dependent on the relevant health outcomes. For asthma incidence, prevalence of asthma symptoms and rhinitis, the effect estimates of OPDTT largely remained unaffected by adjustment for co-pollutants, including NO2. In contrast, the effect estimates of NO2 decreased and the CIs increased substantially after adjusting for OP^{DTT}. However, for lung function, the effect estimates of OP^{DTT} decreased by more than half after adjusting for NO_2 . To date, no consensus has been reached about the associations with NO₂ observed in epidemiological studies reflecting causal effects of NO2 itself, or NO2 mostly or partly acting as a surrogate of the mixture of traffic-related air pollutants due to the high correlations between NO₂ and other traffic markers.⁴¹ If NO₂ is mainly an indicator for a mixture, the results of the twopollutant models with OP are more difficult to interpret as both the metrics may be related to the same causal characteristics of the mixture. More studies with different ratios between OP and NO_2 are needed to determine which metric predicts respiratory health better across different settings.

Strengths and limitations

Important strengths of this study include the prospective study design and detailed individual residential air pollution exposure assessment. This enabled us to compare the health effects performance of OP with more frequently used exposure metrics. We further assessed two OP assays responding to different components of the PM mixture.^{42 43} The availability of a validation study for the LUR models used in this study allowed us to interpret the epidemiological findings better.

Limitations of our study include the application of acellular OP assays, resulting in the inability to assess the interaction of PM with airway cells which can elicit oxidative stress through alternative pathways. We also did not evaluate the genetic information on single-nucleotide polymorphisms related to oxidative stress, especially with respect to asthma and inflammation.⁴⁴ Another limitation is modelling OP using LUR models since OP is considered to be an indicator of PM-induced oxidative stress and we had no specific predictor variables for the biological activity. Predictor variables were similar for OP and other pollutants, but the relative importance of these predictors differed in the OP model versus models for other pollutants, often resulting in only moderate correlations between model-predicted pollutant concentrations. Both OP models included as predictor, the regional background OP derived from interpolation of measurements, a variable that was specific for OP models. The LUR models were based on measurements taken in 2009-2010, which is just before the 14-year questionnaire follow-up (2010-2011) and the medical examination at age 12 years (2008-2009), thus reflecting exposures at the most recent follow-ups well. By applying the models to the children's historical addresses, we assume that the spatial patterns remained stable from the baseline period of the cohort (ie, 1996-1997). Spatial stability was documented by studies where measured and modelled spatial NO₂ contrasts were stable for periods of 7-12 years.⁴⁵ ⁴⁶ We assume these findings can be applied to OP as well, supported by the moderate to high correlations of measured OP with NO₂.

CONCLUSION

Asthma incidence, prevalence of asthma symptoms and rhinitis were more consistently associated with OP^{DTT} than with $PM_{2.5}$ mass concentration. These associations were robust to adjustment for co-pollutants. The associations of lung function with OP^{DTT} were more sensitive to adjustment for co-pollutants, particularly NO₂. Respiratory health was not significantly associated with OP^{ESR} .

Acknowledgements This research was carried out in the framework of RIVM Strategic Program (SPR), in which expertise and innovative projects prepare RIVM to respond to future issues in health and sustainability.

Contributors AY, GH, NAHJ and UG contributed to the data analyses strategy of the current study. AY performed the statistical analyses and drafted the manuscript. All authors reviewed and approved the manuscript.

Competing interests None declared.

Patient consent Obtained.

Ethics approval Institutional review boards of participating institutes.

Provenance and peer review Not commissioned; externally peer reviewed.

REFERENCES

- Anderson JO, Thundiyil JG, Stolbach A. Clearing the air: a review of the effects of particulate matter air pollution on human health. J Med Toxicol 2012;8:166–75.
- 2 Hoek G, Krishnan RM, Beelen R, et al. Long-term air pollution exposure and cardiorespiratory mortality: a review. Environ Health 2013;12:43.
- 3 Gehring U, Gruzieva O, Agius RM, et al. Air pollution exposure and lung function in children: the ESCAPE project. Environ Health Perspect 2013;121:1357–64.
- 4 Eeftens M, Beelen R, de Hoogh K, et al. Development of land use regression models for PM2.5, PM2.5 absorbance, PM10 and PMcoarse in 20 European study areas; results of the ESCAPE project. Environ Sci Technol 2012;46:11195–205.
- 5 Karlsson HL, Möller L. Measuring oxidative stress in cell cultures, animals and humans: analysis and validation of oxidatively damaged DNA. In: Basu S, Wiklund

Environment

L, eds. *Studies on experimental models*. Totowa, NJ: Humana Press, 2011:605–20. http://www.springerlink.com/content/t57866517t6jt582/ (accessed 18 May 2011). Delfino R, Staimer N, Vaziri N. Air pollution and circulating biomarkers of oxidative

- Delfino R, Staimer N, Vaziri N. Air pollution and circulating biomarkers of oxidative stress. *Air Qual Atmosphere Health* 2011;4:37–52.
 Li N, Sioutas C, Cho A, *et al.* Ultrafine particulate pollutants induce oxidative stress
- and mitochondrial damage. *Environ Health Perspect* 2002;111:455–60.
- Møller P, Jacobsen NR, Folkmann JK, *et al.* Role of oxidative damage in toxicity of particulates. *Free Radic Res* 2010;44:1–46.
 Borm PIA Kelly F Künzli N. *et al.* Oxidant generation by particulate matter: from
- 9 Borm PJA, Kelly F, Künzli N, et al. Oxidant generation by particulate matter: from biologically effective dose to a promising, novel metric. Occup Environ Med 2007;64:73–4.
- 10 Ayres JG, Borm P, Vincent C, *et al*. Evaluating the toxicity of airborne particulate matter and nanoparticles by measuring oxidative stress potential—a workshop report and consensus statement, inhalation toxicology, Informa healthcare. *Inhal Toxicol* 2008;20:75–99.
- 11 Delfino RJ, Staimer N, Tjoa T, et al. Airway inflammation and oxidative potential of air pollutant particles in a pediatric asthma panel. J Expo Sci Environ Epidemiol 2013;23:466–73.
- 12 Delfino RJ, Staimer N, Tjoa T, et al. Associations of primary and secondary organic aerosols with airway and systemic inflammation in an elderly panel cohort. *Epidemiology* 2010;21:892–902.
- 13 Strak M, Janssen NAH, Godri KJ, et al. Respiratory health effects of airborne particulate matter: the role of particle size, composition, and oxidative potential-the RAPTES project. Environ Health Perspect 2012;120:1183–9.
- 14 Janssen NAH, Strak M, Yang A, et al. Associations between three specific a-cellular measures of the oxidative potential of particulate matter and markers of acute airway and nasal inflammation in healthy volunteers. Occup Environ Med 2015;72:49–56.
- 15 Canova C, Minelli C, Dunster C, *et al*. PM10 oxidative properties and asthma and COPD. *Epidemiology* 2014;25:467–8.
- 16 Steenhof M, Mudway IS, Gosens I, et al. Acute nasal pro-inflammatory response to air pollution depends on characteristics other than particle mass concentration or oxidative potential: the RAPTES project. Occup Environ Med 2013;70:341–8.
- 17 Tonne C, Yanosky JD, Beevers S, et al. PM mass concentration and PM oxidative potential in relation to carotid intima-media thickness. *Epidemiology* 2012:23:486–94.
- 18 Gehring U, Beelen R, Eeftens M, et al. Particulate matter composition and respiratory health: the PIAMA birth cohort study. Epidemiology 2015;26:300–9.
- 19 Dweik RA, Boggs PB, Erzurum SC, et al. An official ATS clinical practice guideline: interpretation of exhaled nitric oxide levels (FeNO) for clinical applications. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 2011;184:602–15.
- 20 Wijga AH, Kerkhof M, Gehring U, et al. Cohort profile: the Prevention and Incidence of Asthma and Mite Allergy (PIAMA) birth cohort. Int J Epidemiol 2014;43:527–35.
- 21 Beelen R, Hoek G, Vienneau D, et al. Development of NO2 and NOx land use regression models for estimating air pollution exposure in 36 study areas in Europe —The ESCAPE project. Atmos Environ 2013;72:10–23.
- 22 de Hoogh K, Wang M, Adam M, et al. Development of land use regression models for particle composition in twenty study areas in Europe. *Environ Sci Technol* 2013;47:5778–86.
- 23 Yang A, Wang M, Eeftens M, et al. Spatial variation and land use regression modeling of the oxidative potential of fine particles. *Environ Health Perspect* 2015;123:1187–92.
- 24 Cyrys J, Eeftens M, Heinrich J, et al. Variation of NO2 and NOx concentrations between and within 36 European study areas: results from the ESCAPE study. Atmos Environ 2012;62:374–90.
- 25 Eeftens M, Tsai M-Y, Ampe C, et al. Spatial variation of PM2.5, PM10, PM2.5 absorbance and PMcoarse concentrations between and within 20 European study areas and the relationship with NO2—Results of the ESCAPE project. Atmos Environ 2012;62:303–17.

- 26 Cho AK, Sioutas C, Miguel AH, et al. Redox activity of airborne particulate matter at different sites in the Los Angeles Basin. Environ Res 2005;99:40–7.
- 27 Shi T, Schins R, Knaapen A, et al. Hydroxyl radical generation by electron paramagnetic resonance as a new method to monitor ambient particulate matter composition. J Environ Monit 2003;5:550.
- 28 Hellack B, Yang A, Cassee FR, et al. Intrinsic hydroxyl radical generation measurements directly from sampled filters as a metric for the oxidative potential of ambient particulate matter. J Aerosol Sci 2014;72:47–55.
- 29 Miller MR, Hankinson J, Brusasco V, et al. Standardisation of spirometry. Eur Respir J 2005;26:319–38.
- 30 Singer JD, Willett JB. Applied longitudinal data analysis: modeling change and event occurrence. Oxford University Press, 2003.
- 31 Diggle P, Heagerty P, Liang K-Y, et al. Analysis of longitudinal data. 2nd edn. Oxford Statistical Science Series 25, 2013.
- 32 Moshammer H, Hoek G, Luttmann-Gibson H, et al. Parental smoking and lung function in children: an international study. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 2006;173:1255–63.
- 33 Gehring U, Wijga AH, Brauer M, et al. Traffic-related air pollution and the development of asthma and allergies during the first 8 years of life. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 2010;181:596–603.
- 34 Gruzieva O, Bergström A, Hulchiy O, et al. Exposure to air pollution from traffic and childhood asthma until 12 years of age. *Epidemiol Camb Mass* 2013;24:54–61.
- 35 Oftedal B, Brunekreef B, Nystad W, et al. Residential outdoor air pollution and lung function in schoolchildren. *Epidemiol Camb Mass* 2008; 19:129–37.
- 36 Schultz ES, Gruzieva O, Bellander T, et al. Traffic-related air pollution and lung function in children at 8 years of age: a birth cohort study. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 2012;186:1286–91.
- 37 Avol EL, Gauderman WJ, Tan SM, et al. Respiratory effects of relocating to areas of differing air pollution levels. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 2001;164:2067–72.
- 38 Rojas-Martinez R, Perez-Padilla R, Olaiz-Fernandez G, et al. Lung function growth in children with long-term exposure to air pollutants in Mexico City. Am J Respir Crit Care Med 2007;176:377–84.
- 39 Yang A, Hoek G, Montagne D, et al. Agreement of central site measurements and land use regression modeled oxidative potential of PM2.5 with personal exposure. Environ Res 2015;140:397–404.
- 40 Verma V, Fang T, Xu L, et al. Organic aerosols associated with the generation of reactive oxygen species (ROS) by water-soluble PM2.5. Environ Sci Technol 2015;49:4646–56.
- 41 World Health Organization. Review of evidence on health aspects of air pollution— REVIHAAP project: final technical report. 2013. http://www.euro.who.int/en/ health-topics/environment-and-health/air-quality/publications/2013/review-ofevidence-on-health-aspects-of-air-pollution-revihaap-project-final-technical-report (accessed 2 Jul 2014).
- 42 Janssen NAH, Yang A, Strak M, *et al.* Oxidative potential of particulate matter collected at sites with different source characteristics. *Sci Total Environ* 2014;472:572–81.
- 43 Yang A, Jedynska A, Hellack B, et al. Measurement of the oxidative potential of PM2.5 and its constituents: the effect of extraction solvent and filter type. Atmos Environ 2014;83:35–42.
- 44 Saxon A, Diaz-Sanchez D. Air pollution and allergy: you are what you breathe. Nat Immunol 2005;6:223–6.
- 45 Eeftens M, Beelen R, Fischer P, *et al.* Stability of measured and modelled spatial contrasts in NO(2) over time. *Occup Environ Med* 2011;68:765–70.
- 46 Gulliver J, de Hoogh K, Hansell A, et al. Development and back-extrapolation of NO2 land use regression models for historic exposure assessment in Great Britain. Environ Sci Technol 2013;47:7804–11.



Children's respiratory health and oxidative potential of PM $_{2.5}$: the PIAMA birth cohort study

Aileen Yang, Nicole A H Janssen, Bert Brunekreef, Flemming R Cassee, Gerard Hoek and Ulrike Gehring

Occup Environ Med 2016 73: 154-160 originally published online January 11, 2016 doi: 10.1136/oemed-2015-103175

Updated information and services can be found at: http://oem.bmj.com/content/73/3/154

These	incl	lude:
111000		uuo.

Supplementary Material	Supplementary material can be found at: http://oem.bmj.com/content/suppl/2016/01/11/oemed-2015-103175.D C1.html
References	This article cites 42 articles, 6 of which you can access for free at: http://oem.bmj.com/content/73/3/154#BIBL
Email alerting service	Receive free email alerts when new articles cite this article. Sign up in the box at the top right corner of the online article.

Topic
CollectionsArticles on similar topics can be found in the following collectionsAir pollution, air quality (207)
Other exposures (1025)

Notes

To request permissions go to: http://group.bmj.com/group/rights-licensing/permissions

To order reprints go to: http://journals.bmj.com/cgi/reprintform

To subscribe to BMJ go to: http://group.bmj.com/subscribe/